An Examination of the Effectiveness of Acupuncture as an Adjunct to an Alcohol and Other Drugs (AOD) Treatment Program:

A Pilot Study

Katherine Berry
BHSc TCM Acupuncture

A thesis submitted as partial requirement for the degree of Masters of Science (Research)

Faculty of Science
University of Technology, Sydney

August 2005
Certificate of Authorship/Originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Katherine Berry
Acknowledgements

There are many people who contributed their time, energy, enthusiasm and support for this study, for which I am eternally grateful.

Many thanks to my supervisors, Dr Deirdre Cobbin and Chris Zaslawski, who have contributed significantly in all stages of the program. I’d like to thank Deirdre for her drive and dedication to acupuncture research and for navigating me through the difficult process of data analysis and reporting. And thank you to Chris who, without his support, the program would not have been possible.

I’d like to express my sincere gratitude to the UTS students who conducted the acupuncture treatments. Their knowledge, confidence, compassion and professionalism were outstanding, and the strength behind the program. In particular, I would like to thank Glendon Gardner and Joanna Walsh for their input as student representatives in the initial stages.

Thank you also to Dr Joanne Ferguson, Naomi Langburne and the staff at Palm Court, for their acceptance and support of acupuncture and the UTS student clinical placement program. Thank you to the 47 patients who volunteered their time and shared their experiences.

In the initial stages, the recommendations I received from the Victoria University staff and clinical supervisors were crucial, providing a framework for the research. In particular I’d like to thank Glen Furze, Robbie Cotterhill, Vivienne Williams and Dr Kerry Watson.

I am grateful to Peter Meier for generously sharing his database and making the technical changes which were necessary for the program data collection. Thank you also to Bob Hayes and the UTS Staff.

I’d like to thank Dr Sean Walsh for his ongoing input, advice and support. And Emma King, for her understanding and empathy.

Special thanks to my friend and mentor Stuart Loveday, who shared his wealth of knowledge, experience and passion for acupuncture and alcohol and other drug dependence.

I’d like to thank my friends and family for their support and endless cups of tea. Thank you also to my colleagues at the Alliance of NSW Divisions.

A warm thank you to Paul Coady, who inspired me and encouraged me to take the first steps.

And thank you to Dr Adam Winstock for his love and professional support (and for delivering snackettes during the writing stage of my thesis).

Finally, I would like to thank Jacinta Ho’Are from whom I learned the value of life, love and friendship. Jacinta has been the driving force behind this project, inspiring me to overcome the challenges which came along the way... Thank you.
Abstract

Background to the study:
Alcohol and other drugs are one of the leading causes of preventable deaths and hospital admissions in Australia. Treatment services are expected to meet the growing needs of the community in the delivery of appropriate and timely interventions for patients and their families. Despite this, these services are inadequately funded and have significant staff shortages. There is an urgent need to explore adjunct treatments to complement public health care services. Research emerging from the United States and United Kingdom suggests acupuncture is effective in treating alcohol and other drug dependencies. In 2004, the University of Technology, Sydney (UTS) conducted Australia’s first hospital based study examining the effectiveness of acupuncture as an adjunct to an alcohol and other drugs treatment program.

Objectives:
The aim of the study was to determine the feasibility of acupuncture as an adjunct treatment in an existing AOD program.

Study Design:
The study was an uncontrolled, open label pilot study.

Subjects:
Forty seven subjects (29 male and 18 female) volunteered to receive acupuncture treatments during their admission to Palm Court Residential Rehabilitation Unit, Rozelle Hospital.

Method and interventions:
Acupuncture treatments were delivered weekly between May 21 and October 8 2004. Subjects received up to four, one hour acupuncture sessions, during their four week admission. Pre and post treatment anxiety anxiety scores were measured for each session, to determine immediate changes in anxiety. Variables for analysis included gender ratio, drug of choice, mean age, acupuncture points selected, initial treatment date, principal student practitioner and total number of treatments received. Subjects’ perceptions of the effectiveness of acupuncture were recorded in a client satisfaction questionnaire. The average length of stay (number of days in treatment) for the trial subjects was retrospectively compared to the average length of stay for the same period, in the previous two years.

Results:
The subjects fell into four categories determined by whether they: could not complete the program (because of time constraints); dropped out of Palm Court; elected to drop out of the acupuncture program; or completed both programs. Thirteen of the 47 subjects (5 male, 8 female) completed the trial, receiving four treatments in total.

With all four groups, there were statistically significant decreases in mean anxiety scores for the initial treatment (p < 0.05). This was the only treatment for which between group comparisons could be made because of subject drop out.
Alcohol, accounting for 60% of the sample group, was the only drug with adequate representation to consider for analysis. No obvious patterns were found to suggest alcohol was a predicting factor for program completion.

Analysis was conducted to determine if age or gender were predicting factors for program completion. The mean age was similar for all four groups, therefore age was not a predicting factor for program completion. However, it was found that while men comprised the majority of subjects, women were statistically significantly more likely to complete it (p = 0.03).

The average length of stay (number of days) in Palm Court was higher for the trial period than for the same time in previous years. However data were limited and it is difficult to draw conclusions from such a small sample size and short trial duration (21 weeks).

Limitations of the study included a high drop out rate; small sample sizes; difficulties distinguishing between acupuncture and health improvements over time; difficulties disentangling the effects of acupuncture from non treatment specific health outcomes (placebo); sample and practitioner bias; no treatment prescription leading to a wide range of points selected and no post treatment follow up.

Discussion:
Uncontrolled clinical trials are essential in new frontiers of research to determine whether the clinical effects are worth investigating. Decreases in mean anxiety scores for all the groups, increase in program retention rates and positive feedback from client satisfaction surveys suggest that further research is warranted.

Conclusions:
Despite the limitations of this uncontrolled open label pilot study, it has been a necessary first step. The study An Examination of the Effectiveness of Acupuncture as an Adjunct to an Alcohol and Other Drugs Treatment Program has provided a foundation on which to build an evidence base in the future.

Supporting Conference Presentations
Australasian Acupuncture and Chinese Medicine Annual Conference, Melbourne May 2005
Meeting of the Minds Langton Centre, Sydney February 2005
World Federation of Acupuncture and Chinese Medicine Society, Gold Coast November 2004
Royal North Shore Hospital Annual Scientific Research Meeting, Sydney November 2004
University of Technology, Sydney Postgraduate Research Conference, Sydney August 2004
International Harm Reduction Conference, Melbourne April 2004
# Contents

Acknowledgments i  
Abstract ii  
Supporting conference presentations iii  
Contents iv  
Figures viii  
Tables viii

## Chapter 1 Introduction 1

1.1 Background to the study 1  
1.2 Overview of acupuncture treatment 2  
1.3 Acupuncture in Australia 3  
1.4 Historical development of the use of acupuncture for AOD treatment 3  
1.5 Acupuncture for AOD treatment in Australia 4  
1.6 Anxiety treatment in AOD populations 4  
1.7 Study design 5  
1.8 Study aims 6  
1.9 Format of the thesis 6

## Chapter 2 Literature Review 8

2.1 Databases and search engines 8  
2.2 Search strategies 8  
2.3 Selection criteria for literature review inclusion 8  
   2.3.1 Treatment intervention 9  
   2.3.2 Control intervention 9  
   2.3.3 Outcome measures 9  
2.4 Exclusion criteria 9
2.5 Alcohol and other drugs studies
2.6 Reviews of studies for alcohol dependence
2.7 Reviews of studies for cocaine and crack cocaine dependence
2.8 Reviews of studies for heroin dependence
2.9 Alcohol and other drugs (AOD) acupuncture research in Australia
2.10 Limitations of current studies
  2.10.1 Small sample sizes
  2.10.2 Short treatment duration
  2.10.3 Practitioner bias
  2.10.4 Variation in acupuncture points
  2.10.5 No follow up
  2.10.6 Drug of choice
2.11 Conclusion

Chapter 3 Method
3.1 Research design
3.2 Student practitioners
3.3 Subjects
3.4 Inclusion criteria
3.5 Exclusion criteria
3.6 Appointment scheduling
3.7 Data collection
  3.7.1 Demographic data
  3.7.2 Initial consultation clinical assessment
  3.7.3 Anxiety research tool
3.8 Treatment protocol
Chapter 4 Results

4.1 Subject groups

4.1.1 Group A Could not complete acupuncture treatment

4.1.2 Group B Dropped out of Palm Court and acupuncture program Simultaneously

4.1.3 Group C Dropped out of acupuncture prior to dropping out of Palm Court

4.1.4 Group D Completed Palm Court and acupuncture program

4.2 Mean anxiety scores pre and post initial treatment, by subject group

4.3 Gender ratio by group

4.4 Drug of choice

4.4.1 Gender ratio for alcohol dependent subjects

4.5 Mean age of men and women by subject group

4.6 Initial treatment mean anxiety scores for alcohol subjects by group

4.7 Pre treatment one, mean anxiety scores by gender and subject group

4.8 Mean anxiety score for initial treatment by gender and subject group

4.9 Most frequent acupuncture points used in treatment one

4.9.1 Similar number of points

4.9.2 Profile of acupuncture points

4.10 Initial treatment date by subject group

4.11 Student practitioner for initial treatment by subject group

4.12 Retention rate at Palm Court 2002-2004

4.13 Overall number of treatments received, by week

4.13.1 Pre and post treatment mean anxiety scores: Treatment 1

4.13.2 Pre and post treatment mean anxiety scores: Treatment 2
4.13.3 Pre and post treatment mean anxiety scores: Treatment 3
4.13.4 Pre and post treatment mean anxiety scores: Treatment 4
4.14 Effects of treatment within the same status group
  4.14.1 Status 2 (N = 12)
  4.14.2 Status 3 (N = 7)
  4.14.3 Status 4 (N = 13)
4.15 Feedback from client satisfaction survey

Chapter 5 Discussion

Chapter 6 Conclusion and future considerations

References

Appendices
Appendix A: Summary of common anxiety medications
Appendix B: Patient information sheet
Appendix C: Patient consent form
Appendix D: Patient Demographic Information Form
Appendix E: UTS initial treatment form
Appendix F: Speilberger trait anxiety scale
Appendix G: Speilberger state scale
Appendix H: UTS subsequent treatment form
Appendix I: Client satisfaction questionnaire
Appendix K: Background to the study
Appendix L: Summary of subject data by group
Appendix M: Budget and expenditure
Figures

Figure 3.1 Subject demographic form 38
Figure 3.2 Spielberger state scale 40
Figure 3.3 Client satisfaction questionnaire 42
Figure 4.1: Profile of main points used by subject group 53
Figure 4.2: Number of admissions to Palm Court from May to September 2002-2004 62
Figure 4.3: Average length of stay (ALOS) at Palm Court from May to September 2002-2004 62

Tables

Table 2.1 Summary of studies in literature review 26
Table 4.1: Mean anxiety scores pre and post treatment one for group A, B, C and D 46
Table 4.2: Gender ratio for group A, B, C and D 47
Table 4.3: Drug of choice for group A, B, C and D 48
Table 4.4: Proportions of alcohol dependent men and women in each of the subject groups 48
Table 4.5: Mean age by gender for group A, B, C and D 49
Table 4.6: Mean anxiety scores pre and post treatment one for group A, B, C and D subjects for whom alcohol was the drug of choice (DOC). (SEM = standard error of the mean) 49
Table 4.7: Pre initial treatment mean anxiety scores for group A, B, C and D by gender 50
Table 4.8: Mean anxiety scores pre and post treatment one for group A, B, C and D by gender 51
Table 4.9: Selection of main acupuncture points used in treatment one, by subject group 52
Table 4.10: Distribution of initial treatment date by subject group 54
Table 4.11: Distribution of initial treatment by subject group and principal student practitioner 55
Table 4.11.1: Completion and drop out data for the principal practitioner who delivered the initial treatment, by subject group 56
Table 4.11.2: Point selection for group D initial treatment, by student 57
Table 4.11.3: Point selection for group B initial treatment, by student 58
Table 4.11.4: Point selection for group C initial treatment, by student 60
Table 4.12: Number of admissions to Palm Court and average length of stay from May to September 2002-2004

Table 4.13.1: Status 1 to 4 mean anxiety scores pre and post treatment at treatment 1
Table 4.13.2: Status 2 to 4 mean anxiety scores pre and post treatment at treatment 2
Table 4.13.3: Groups 3 and 4 mean anxiety scores pre and post treatment at treatment 3
Table 4.13.4: Status 4 mean anxiety scores pre and post treatment at treatment 4

Table 4.14.1: Status 2 mean anxiety scores pre and post treatment at treatments 1 and 2
Table 4.14.2: Status 3 mean anxiety scores pre and post treatment at treatments 1, 2 and 3
Table 4.14.3: Status 4 mean anxiety scores pre and post treatment at treatments 1, 2, 3 and 4

Table 4.15 shows the total number of points needed for each status group by week

Table 4.16: Frequency of acupuncture points by week

Table 4.17: Feedback from Client satisfaction survey