

# **A framework for the improvement of knowledge-intensive business processes**

By

**Peter Dalmaris**

A thesis submitted for the degree of

**Doctor of Philosophy**

**University of Technology, Sydney  
February 2006  
Sydney, Australia**

## CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP / ORIGINALITY

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Candidate

Production Note:  
Signature removed prior to publication.

Peter Dalmaris

## Acknowledgments

This work would not be possible without the help and encouragement I received from the incredible people I was fortunate to have crossed paths with.

My PhD committee has helped me far beyond what I had reasonably expected. My sincere “thank you” and gratitude goes to you for enduring my constant need for help and advice for almost three years, despite your already overloaded schedules. Thank you (no particular order) to Professor Ken Dovey, Dr Bill Hall, Professor Bob Smith and Professor Eric Tsui for making this work possible.

Michelle, my best friend and future wife, you were responsible for keeping me focused on the job, and sane. You gave me stability and respite, and with your positive attitude made me comfortable despite the continuous hard work. Through the trials of this PhD we developed a strong sense of mutual respect and support that will be the foundation of our future life. Thank you for everything you have done for me.

To my family, as always, you have been fundamental in everything I have done thus far.

My parents, Despina and Theodore, sister Eleftheria, brother John, and grandparents Eleftheria and Panayioti, are the ones that helped me develop the way I did. By succeeding in this work, I am proud to show them that their faith in me is well justified. For this faith, I thank you.

Finally, I wish to thank the examiners of my work for their thoughtful and helpful comments. Although I was not able to address all of them, I did consider every one of them. Be assured that you have been a significant positive influence of my future work.

All I know is that I know nothing.

Wisdom is to know how little we know.

**Socrates (470B.C. – 399B.C.)**

There are no authoritative sources of knowledge, and no 'source' is particularly reliable.

Everything is welcome as a source of inspiration, including 'intuition'; especially if it suggests new problems to us.

But nothing is secure, and we are all fallible.

**Karl Popper (1902 – 1994)**

## Table of contents

<b>CHAPTER 1 - INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Research problem.....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Main research areas .....</b>	<b>4</b>
Epistemology.....	5
Process ontology.....	5
Improvement methodology.....	6
<b>Scope, goal, and objectives.....</b>	<b>7</b>
Scope .....	7
Goal .....	8
Objectives .....	8
<b>Research approach.....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>The research as a project.....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>Thesis structure .....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>CHAPTER 2 - EPISTEMOLOGICAL FOUNDATIONS OF THE STUDY .....</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>Why Popperian epistemology is adopted in this research.....</b>	<b>14</b>
Michael Polanyi’s influence on KM.....	16
<b>Three questions of epistemology .....</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>What is knowledge?.....</b>	<b>17</b>
Three popular definitions of knowledge.....	17
An evolutionary definition of knowledge.....	19
Knowledge, information, and data.....	20
Example .....	22
<b>Popper’s evolutionary theory of knowledge.....</b>	<b>23</b>
Fundamentals.....	23
From DNA mutations to human language .....	23
Dispositions and expectations.....	25
A feat of evolution .....	26
Objective knowledge: a consequence of language .....	28
The “tetradic” schema: a model of knowledge creation .....	29
A knowledge ontology.....	30
<b>Conclusion.....</b>	<b>32</b>
<b>CHAPTER 3 – KNOWLEDGE MANAGEMENT .....</b>	<b>33</b>
<b>What is knowledge management.....</b>	<b>35</b>
A simple definition of knowledge management .....	36
<b>Organisational learning .....</b>	<b>38</b>
Mechanisms and principles of learning .....	39
Single and double loop learning.....	39
Lower and higher level learning .....	41
Strategic/tactical and internal/external learning.....	42
Conclusions: organisational learning.....	44

<b>Organisational knowledge .....</b>	<b>45</b>
Three lenses for viewing organisational knowledge .....	47
A pluralist approach.....	48
Realist viewpoint .....	49
Intellectual capital.....	49
Knowledge processing .....	50
Conclusion: organisational knowledge.....	54
<b>Organisational memory .....</b>	<b>55</b>
Major perspectives of organisational memory.....	56
The organisational knowledge base perspective .....	56
The Walsh-Ungson approach.....	58
Group memory and transactive memory.....	59
A technological perspective.....	61
The Distributed Organisational Knowledge Base (DOKB).....	62
Technological applications of organisational memory .....	62
<b>Knowledge Management in practice.....</b>	<b>65</b>
Matsushita Electric .....	66
Royal Dutch Shell.....	69
Ernst & Young.....	71
<b>Conclusion.....</b>	<b>74</b>
<b>CHAPTER 4 - BUSINESS PROCESSES, MANAGEMENT, AND IMPROVEMENT .....</b>	<b>75</b>
<b>Business Process: literature and working definition .....</b>	<b>75</b>
A working definition of “business process” .....	77
<b>Business Process Management .....</b>	<b>78</b>
A working definition of “business process management” .....	80
Foundations and Origins of Business Process Management.....	81
BPI methodologies.....	86
<b>Conclusion.....</b>	<b>90</b>
<b>CHAPTER 5: METHODOLOGY .....</b>	<b>91</b>
<b>Overview of methodology .....</b>	<b>91</b>
<b>Literature Review.....</b>	<b>93</b>
<b>Problem Formulation and Reformulation.....</b>	<b>97</b>
Problem formulation.....	97
Problem reformulation.....	98
<b>Tentative Theory Formulation and Reformulation.....</b>	<b>100</b>
Theory building .....	100
Testing and refutation.....	101
<b>Testing and Error Detection.....</b>	<b>101</b>
Summary of testing technique .....	102
Summary of case study design.....	102
<b>Error Reduction .....</b>	<b>104</b>
<b>Summary .....</b>	<b>106</b>

## **CHAPTER 6 - A FRAMEWORK FOR KNOWLEDGE-BASED BUSINESS PROCESS IMPROVEMENT ..... 108**

<b>Foundation: theory of knowledge and business processes .....</b>	<b>109</b>
A working definition of knowledge.....	109
A knowledge ontology.....	109
Epistemological foundation - Cornerstones.....	110
<b>A knowledge-based business process ontology.....</b>	<b>111</b>
Top level business process ontology.....	111
Knowledge Objects.....	112
Knowledge Tool .....	113
Function .....	114
Member.....	114
Knowledge Path.....	115
Knowledge Transaction .....	115
Knowledge Transformation .....	116
Environment.....	116
Conclusion .....	116
Abstract Classes.....	117
Knowledge Object Taxonomy .....	117
Knowledge Processes.....	118
Transaction Type .....	120
Containers .....	120
Media .....	121
Medium Types .....	122
Conclusion .....	123
<b>Knowledge-intense business process improvement methodology .....</b>	<b>123</b>
Stage 1: Process Audit.....	124
Ontology editor.....	124
Process visualisation .....	126
Stage 2: Analysis .....	128
Function level analysis procedure.....	128
Process level analysis procedure.....	131
Stage 3: Design.....	133
Final remarks on the methodology .....	134
<b>Conclusion.....</b>	<b>134</b>

## **CHAPTER 7 – CASE STUDIES ..... 135**

<b>Case 1.....</b>	<b>135</b>
Description of the organisation.....	136
Description of the business process.....	136
Justification for choice of the organisation and the business process.....	137
Goals and objectives .....	138
Study method and execution.....	141
Initiation.....	141
First round of meetings .....	143
Questionnaires .....	144
Second round of meetings.....	146
Discussion of results .....	146
Goals .....	146
Objectives .....	149
<b>Case 2.....</b>	<b>151</b>
Description of the organisation.....	152
Description of the business process .....	153

Justification of choice for the organisation and the business process .....	154
Goals and Objectives .....	154
Study method and execution.....	156
Initiation.....	156
First round of meetings .....	157
Questionnaires .....	158
Second round of meetings.....	158
Discussion of results .....	159
Goals .....	159
Objectives .....	161
<b>Case 3.....</b>	<b>164</b>
Description of the organisation.....	165
Description of the business process.....	165
Justification for choice of the organisation and the business process .....	166
Goals and objectives .....	167
Study method and execution.....	168
Initiation.....	169
First round of meetings .....	169
Questionnaires .....	170
Second round of meetings.....	171
Discussion of results .....	171
Goals .....	171
Objectives .....	172
<b>Conclusion.....</b>	<b>174</b>
<b>CHAPTER 8 – SUMMARY AND FUTURE RESEARCH.....</b>	<b>175</b>
<b>Summary of this thesis .....</b>	<b>175</b>
<b>Contributions to knowledge.....</b>	<b>176</b>
<b>Future research and expected results .....</b>	<b>178</b>
Improvement of the framework .....	178
Development of KBPI Tools .....	179
Integration of process modelling with the ontology editor .....	179
Analysis automation.....	180
Integration with process management systems .....	180
Summary.....	181
<b>Epilogue.....</b>	<b>181</b>
<b>APPENDIX A – CASE STUDY DESIGN .....</b>	<b>183</b>
<b>Introduction .....</b>	<b>183</b>
<b>Summary.....</b>	<b>183</b>
Product and objectives of individual case studies.....	184
Purpose of protocol.....	184
<b>Key features of the case study method.....</b>	<b>185</b>
<b>Suitability of case study research method .....</b>	<b>185</b>
<b>Selection criteria.....</b>	<b>185</b>
Selection of organisation.....	186



<b>Procedures.....</b>	<b>187</b>
Preparation of field visit for case study .....	187
Review of preliminary information.....	187
Verification of access procedures .....	188
Special documents .....	189
Determination of persons to be interviewed and other sources of information .....	189
Process owner .....	190
Process members.....	190
Process clients.....	191
Other sources of information .....	192
<b>Case study protocol .....</b>	<b>192</b>
Objectives .....	192
Data collection.....	192
Data collection method .....	192
Questionnaire .....	194
Documents.....	194
Document types .....	195
Document Analysis.....	195
Contextual cues and clues.....	195
CCC Capture.....	196
CCC analysis.....	196
<b>Case study analysis and reporting .....</b>	<b>197</b>
Individual case studies.....	197
Description of the case study subject.....	197
Outline of the individual case study report .....	199
<b>Case study steps – Process audit method.....</b>	<b>200</b>
<b>The improvement framework.....</b>	<b>201</b>
<b>APPENDIX B - GLOSSARIES .....</b>	<b>202</b>
Glossary of general terms used in this thesis .....	202
Glossary of process ontology terms used in this thesis.....	206
<b>REFERENCES .....</b>	<b>210</b>

## List of figures

FIGURE 1: KEY RESEARCH AREAS - A FRAMEWORK FOR KNOWLEDGE-BASED BUSINESS PROCESS IMPROVEMENT .....	4
FIGURE 2: THESIS STRUCTURE .....	12
FIGURE 3: GENERATION OF ORGANISATIONAL VALUE; PEOPLE PERFORMING BUSINESS PROCESSES USE KNOWLEDGE TO ACHIEVE VALUED RESULTS .....	15
FIGURE 4: DATA, INFORMATION AND KNOWLEDGE.....	21
FIGURE 5: THE "TETRADIC" SCHEMA .....	30
FIGURE 6: ORGANISATIONAL LEARNING, KNOWLEDGE, AND MEMORY: A SIMPLE MODEL OF KM.....	37
FIGURE 7: SINGLE AND DOUBLE LOOP LEARNING .....	40
FIGURE 8: INTELLECTUAL CAPITAL MODEL AT SKANDIA (ROOS ET AL. 1997:29).....	50
FIGURE 9: THE KNOWLEDGE LIFE CYCLE, SIMPLIFIED (J. FIRESTONE & M. MCELROY 2003A:201) .....	51
FIGURE 10: THE PAUTZKE/KIRSCH MODEL .....	57
FIGURE 11: THE WALSH-UNGSON MODEL.....	58
FIGURE 12: ORGANISATIONAL MEMORY MODEL ACCORDING TO WATSON .....	61
FIGURE 13: THE DOKB .....	62
FIGURE 14: KM ANALYSIS FOR MATSUSHITA ELECTRIC BREAD MAKER DESIGN.....	68
FIGURE 15: KM ANALYSIS FOR SHELL'S SCENARIO PREDICTION .....	71
FIGURE 16: ERNST & YOUNG KM ANALYSIS .....	74
FIGURE 17: INDICATIVE TIMELINE OF BUSINESS PROCESS MANAGEMENT .....	82
FIGURE 18: THE RESEARCH METHODOLOGY .....	93
FIGURE 19: AREAS OF LITERATURE REVIEW .....	96
FIGURE 20: PROBLEM FORMULATION.....	97
FIGURE 21: PROBLEM REFORMULATION.....	99
FIGURE 22: THEORY (SOLUTION) FORMULATION AND REFORMULATION FACTORS....	100
FIGURE 23: CASE STUDY PROCEDURE .....	103
FIGURE 24: THE KBPI STRUCTURE.....	108
FIGURE 25: THE KBPO (TOP LEVEL) .....	112
FIGURE 26: ABSTRACT CLASS: KNOWLEDGE OBJECT TAXONOMY .....	118
FIGURE 27: ABSTRACT CLASS: KNOWLEDGE PROCESSES .....	120
FIGURE 28: ABSTRACT CLASS: TRANSACTION TYPE .....	120
FIGURE 29: ABSTRACT CLASS: CONTAINERS .....	121
FIGURE 30: ABSTRACT CLASS: MEDIA .....	122
FIGURE 31: ABSTRACT CLASS: MEDIUM TYPES.....	123
FIGURE 32: THE IMPROVEMENT METHOD.....	124
FIGURE 33: PROTÉGÉ DISPLAYING DETAILS OF THE FUNCTION CLASS .....	125
FIGURE 34: PROTÉGÉ DISPLAYING AN INSTANCE OF THE FUNCTION CLASS .....	126
FIGURE 35: PART OF A PROCESS MODEL, HIGHLIGHTING INSTANCES OF KNOWLEDGE PATHS AND KNOWLEDGE TOOLS .....	127
FIGURE 36: EVALUATION AND IMPROVEMENT LEVELS .....	128
FIGURE 37: FUNCTION LEVEL ANALYSIS PROCEDURE.....	131
FIGURE 38: THE PROCESS LEVEL ANALYSIS PROCEDURE.....	132
FIGURE 39: PROCESS AUDIT / DATA COLLECTION PROCESS.....	194
FIGURE 40: PROCESS AUDIT METHOD .....	200
FIGURE 41: THE IMPROVEMENT FRAMEWORK.....	201

## List of tables

TABLE 1: RESEARCH LIMITATIONS.....	7
TABLE 2: ANSWERS TO THE THREE QUESTIONS ON EPISTEMOLOGY .....	32
TABLE 3: SUMMARY OF ORGANISATIONAL LEARNING REVIEW .....	45
TABLE 4: PROCESS IMPROVEMENT METHODOLOGIES AND THEIR FOCUS.....	88
TABLE 5: LITERATURE GUIDING QUESTIONS .....	95
TABLE 6: CASE STUDY DELIVERABLES .....	103
TABLE 7: THE CORNERSTONES OF KBPI EPISTEMOLOGY.....	110
TABLE 8: DATA CAPTURE TOOLS .....	127
TABLE 9: FUNCTION LEVEL ANALYSIS PROCEDURE .....	129
TABLE 10: PROCESS LEVEL ANALYSIS PROCEDURE .....	131
TABLE 11: GOALS FOR CASE STUDY 1.....	138
TABLE 12: CASE STUDY ONE OBJECTIVES .....	139
TABLE 13: GOALS FOR CASE STUDY 2.....	154
TABLE 14: CASE STUDY ONE OBJECTIVES .....	155
TABLE 15: GOALS FOR CASE STUDY THREE.....	167
TABLE 16: CASE STUDY THREE OBJECTIVES .....	168

## **Abstract**

This thesis reports on the results of research into the development of a framework for the improvement of knowledge-intensive business processes (KBPI). This framework is composed of three parts: an epistemology, which provides a working definition of the concept of knowledge and a theoretical foundation of the improvement framework; a business process ontology, used to describe a business process; and an improvement methodology, used to guide the improvement process. The framework was tested on three different business processes through the conduct of three case studies. The case study results show that the KBPI can be applied to the process analysis and improvement of a variety of business processes but is especially useful to those processes that are knowledge-intensive.