

**WORKPLACE LEARNING, CONTEXTUALITY
AND CULTURAL TEXTS:**

**A case study of Taylorism in
Incoming Customer Service Call Centres**

by
Margaret Crouch

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Education

University of Technology, Sydney, Australia

January, 2007

CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP/ORIGINALITY

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Student

Production Note:

Signature removed prior to publication.

Acknowledgements

Approaching the ubiquitous “light at the end of the tunnel” offers a timely opportunity to acknowledge those people who have been significant in my journey. Initially, I wish to acknowledge the Faculty of Education at University of Technology, Sydney, for their ongoing involvement in the development of emerging researchers and their unfailing encouragement to engage in academic discourse in the very broad field of education. Within the faculty, I acknowledge my supervisor, Dr. Tony Holland, for his guidance over the course of my thesis and the opportunity to provide undergraduate students with an introductory insight into the world of research methodologies and methods.

Outside the hallowed halls of academia I wish to thank James Oglethorpe whose enthusiasm and willingness to discuss call centres and “all things Taylorist” was insightful. Further, my gratitude is extended to my family and “normal” friends who provide the sanctuary of a world without academic analysis.

In particular, I extend a special thank you to Dr. Emmi Mikedakis with whom I shared many interesting hours of philosophical discussion on “the cyclical narrative” which highlighted not only its relevance in broader contexts but also its privileging in my own work.

However, a balance in life is an essential accompaniment to the commitment of conducting research and writing a thesis. For that essential balance I lovingly acknowledge “my girls” who fill my world with love, laughter and wonder, and who make every day a gift.

Table of Contents	Page
Acknowledgements	ii
Table of Contents	iii
Tables and Diagrams	vi
Abstract	vii
Chapter One – Introduction	1
1.1 Thesis Introduction	
1.2 Thesis Outline	
1.3 Thesis Constructs	
1.3.1 Contextuality Construct	
1.3.2 Pedagogy Construct	
1.4 Research Terminologies	
1.5 Research Framework	
Chapter Two –Background.....	11
2.1 Chapter Introduction	
2.2 Evolution of the Research	
2.3 Call Centres	
2.3.1 Incoming Customer Service Call Centres	
2.3.2 Call Centre Semiotic Language and Literacy	
2.4 Background to the Thesis Constructs	
2.5 Contextuality Construct	
2.5.1 F.W. Taylor, Scientific Management and the Historic-Scientific Dimension	
2.5.2 Braverman and the Social-Political Dimension	
2.5.3 The Ethno-Cultural Dimension	
2.6 Pedagogy Construct	
2.6.1 Ethno-pedagogy	
2.7 Research Questions	
2.7.1. Research Assumptions	
2.7.2. Table of Research Questions	
Chapter Three – Literature Review	43
3.1 Chapter Introduction	
3.2 Contextuality Construct	
3.2.1. The Historic-Scientific Dimension	
3.2.2. The Social-Political Dimension	
3.2.3. The Ethno-Cultural Dimension	

3.3	Pedagogy Construct	
3.3.1	Formal and Informal as Learning Theory, Learning Setting and Decontextualised / Contextualised Knowledge Constructs	
3.3.2	Contextuality, Culture and Learning	
3.3.3	Ethno-pedagogy and the ethno-cultural community	
Chapter Four – Research Methodology		90
4.1	Chapter Introduction	
4.2	Methodology	
4.2.1	Interpretive Perspective, Qualitative Method	
4.2.2	Ethnography	
4.2.3	Ethnomethodology	
4.3	Method	
4.4	Data Analysis and Interpretation	
4.4.1	Semiotic Orientation	
4.5	Research Conclusions and Research Reporting	
4.5.1	Transferability, Comparability and Translatability	
Chapter Five – Data, Analysis and Interpretation		107
5.1	Chapter Introduction	
<i>PART A – CONTEXTUALITY CONSTRUCT</i>		
5.2	Contextuality Construct	
5.2.1	Historic-Scientific Dimension	
5.2.2	Social-Political Dimension	
5.3	Ethno-Cultural Dimension	
5.3.1	Evolutionary Understandings	
5.3.2	Cyclical Narrative	
5.3.3	Beliefs and Philosophy	
5.3.4	Relationship Structure	
5.3.5	Traditions, Cultural Artifacts and Texts	
5.3.6	Language, Semiotics and Cultural Literacy	
5.3.7	Culturally Desirable Behaviours	

PART B – PEDAGOGY CONSTRUCT

- 5.4 Pedagogy Construct
- 5.5 Efficiency Gains, Logics and Tensions
 - 5.5.1 Establishing the Nature of Efficiency Gains and a Tension in the Logics

PART C – PRIMARY CULTURAL TEXTS

- 5.6 Cultural Junctures, Artifacts, Primary Cultural and Text Influencers
 - 5.6.1 Cultural Junctures / Cultural Texts (Unweighted Logics)
 - 5.6.2 Cultural Junctures / Cultural Texts (Weighted Logics)
 - 5.6.2.1 Recruitment
 - 5.6.2.2 Induction Training
 - 5.6.2.3 On-the-Job Training
 - 5.6.2.4 Performance Review
 - 5.6.2.5 Self Regulation

PART D – SECONDARY CULTURAL TEXTS

- 5.7 Secondary Cultural Artifacts and Cultural Texts
 - 5.7.1 Elements of Taylor’s Model
 - 5.7.2 Story Telling

PART E – CULTURAL LITERACY

- 5.8 Semiotic Language, Semiotic Literacy and Cultural Literacy

Chapter Six – Conclusion 187

- 6.1 Chapter Introduction
- 6.2 Contextuality Construct
- 6.3 Pedagogy Construct
- 6.4 Research Implications and Future Research Potential
 - 6.4.1 Theory-based Implications
 - 6.4.2 Practice-based
- 6.5 Summary

Appendices 201

Appendix A – Research Method

Thesis Bibliography 223

Diagrams and Tables	Page
Diagrams	
1.1 Call Centre Contextuality	5
1.2 Research Framework	10
5.1 The Cultural Narrative of Call Centres and Taylorism	115
5.2 Ethno-Cultural Community Relationships Structure	118
5.3 Cultural Junctures/Cultural Texts (Unweighted Logics)	133
5.4 Cultural Junctures/Cultural Texts (Weighted Logics)	138
Tables	
2.1 Table of Research Questions	42
3.1 Table of Relationship: Formal/Informal Learning, Learning Settings and Decontextualised/Contextualised Knowledge Constructs	74
5.1 Correlative Analysis of F.W.Taylor's Scientific Management to Contemporary Call Centre Practices	109

Abstract

The relationship between workplace contextuality and workplace learning is part of an ongoing academic, educational discourse. While enlightening in general terms, this thesis represents original research focusing more specifically on workplace learning in incoming customer service call centres.

Investigating references to “revitalised Taylorism” in general terms, and “an engineering model” in specific call centre terms, the research confirms that at the core of call centre contextuality lies the adaptation of F.W. Taylor’s late 19th century Scientific Management philosophy and the call centre model for efficiency performance management. Over the passage of time this Taylorist adaptation in contemporary call centres practices grounds an argument to view incoming customer service centres as a unique ethnographical and cultural business community shaped by past practices and artifacts, folk knowledge and enduring behavioural patterns. These in turn shape workplace learning frames of reference “embodied in the signs, symbols, and language or the semiotics of culture” (Merriam & Associates 2002, p.236).

The main body of the research then focuses on workplace pedagogy. It proposes that workplace artifacts become embodied in cultural texts (such as written curricula, oral/aural storytelling, semiotic language and semiotic displays) which act as teaching and learning conduits. Specific artifacts and cultural texts are examined from the perspective of Korczynski’s claim (in Deery & Kinnie 2002) that call centre performance management and measurement are infused with two logics, that of cost-efficiency and customer-orientation.

The originality of the research lies in two key areas of contribution. The first is the rigour applied to situating workplace contextuality as a framework within which understandings of workplace learning can be interpreted. The second, as a consequence, is a fresh approach to

workplace learning, and one which legitimises the workplace as an ethnographic, cultural community which teaches and learns through cultural texts. Examining workplace learning from this perspective raises the profile of workplace artifacts, socialisation and semiotics (including semiotic language) as significant workplace learning conduits. The thesis challenges existing understandings which act to constrain a broader interpretation of learning agencies such as literacy, culture, semiotics and texts in assigning relevant workplace meaning and knowledge constructs in their frames of reference.