Factors Influencing Adoption and Diffusion of Mobile Payment Systems – A Holistic Framework

A thesis submitted by Agnieszka Zmijewska
in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY in Computer Sciences

February 2007

Faculty of Information Technology
University of Technology, Sydney
Certificate of Authorship/Originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Agnieszka Żmijewska
Acknowledgements

Thanks for all the great help received from my supervisor, Associate Professor Elaine Lawrence, who has been extremely supportive at every stage of this research. Elaine has constantly provided me with guidance, advice, motivation and support, and has always given her feedback in a record time. Thanks also to Professor J. Felix Hampe, my co-supervisor, for reading my chapters. The thesis examiners have provided very valuable feedback as well.

Special thanks, of course, to Gerhard for his love and support, giving me so much happiness, always being there for me, making me hundreds of coffees to keep me going during writing, and, last but not least, for making this thesis look as pretty as it does. Also thanks for the support of my family, Mum, Dad, Kasia and Pawel, who have had to listen to me talking about the same topic for the past three years. The same goes to my friends who have been there for me since I started, and understood when I needed 'time off social life' – Dorota, Karolina, Monika, Ola, Romek, Sylwia, and Terka (alphabetically!).

"Being a PhD student is like becoming all of the Seven Dwarfs at once. In the beginning you're Dopey and Bashful. In the middle, you are usually Sneezy, Sleepy, and Grumpy. But at the end, they call you Doc, and then you're Happy!" (Found online at http://www.cs.unc.edu/~azuma/hitch4.html)
Publications supporting this research

The following publications published in peer-reviewed journals and conferences are directly related to this research. The relevance of these papers, as well as of other publications by the author of this thesis, is described in Appendix B.


Abstract

Mobile devices have a potential to become ideal payment devices because they are small, light, personal, convenient, and many people carry them anytime, anywhere. Mobile devices have a number of connectivity options, and their own display and input capabilities. They are already widely used around the world.

Mobile payments, despite their potential, have not reached the expected adoption levels. While there may be many reasons for this, previous research focused on few topics only, mainly technology and consumers. The main aim of this study was to find out what is necessary to improve adoption and diffusion of mobile payments. Specific objectives that were proposed to help achieve this aim included: a) identifying all the factors that may influence adoption and diffusion of mobile payments, b) integrating such factors and relations between them in a holistic framework, and c) providing specific recommendations and guidelines in all the various perspectives.

Grounded theory was the methodology employed to fulfil these objectives. Qualitative approach was found to be most suitable to this study, and open-ended Web surveys, as well as various kinds of interviews, including email, face-
to-face, phone, and focus groups managed to obtain detailed, in-depth information from industry and user participants.

The main contribution of this study is the holistic theoretical framework that explains the specific factors that influence adoption and diffusion of mobile payments, provides interesting findings on each of the identified factors, and at the same time integrates such investigations together as one coherent whole that forms a roadmap of success factors for mobile payments.

Some of the discovered factors have not been proposed before at all. Some others have been proposed in fragmented explanations that focused on several influences only. Other factors have been proposed before but this study offered more accurate or understandable interpretations or names for them. In addition, this project integrated all the factors together in a holistic framework, pointing out all the important contexts and conditions that providers need to understand and fulfil. Another contribution is a multitude of specific guidelines and recommendations that have been discovered in the participants' data. This study, unlike some other mobile payment projects, additionally devoted much attention to studying mobile payments in relation to other payment methods. The proposed theory with its well explained success factors can be used by providers to improve their current systems or better design new mobile payment initiatives.
# Table of Contents

**Thesis Structure**  
1. Introduction ............................................................................................................................ 6  
1.1 Mobile Payments Defined .......................................................................................... 6  
1.2 Mobile Devices as Possible Payment Instruments ............................................. 7  
1.3 Mobile Payment Research Overview ................................................................... 9  
1.4 Research Questions ................................................................................................ 15  
1.5 Aims and Objectives ............................................................................................... 16  
1.6 Mobile Payment Research Overview Update ...................................................... 17  
1.7 Impact and Significance ......................................................................................... 19  
1.8 Personal Motivation .................................................................................................. 20  
1.9 Scope of the Study .................................................................................................... 21  
1.10 Overview of Existing Mobile Payments ............................................................. 24  
1.11 Chapter Review ....................................................................................................... 27  

2. Theoretical Background and Methodology ............................................................ 29  
2.1 Research Framework ................................................................................................29  
2.2 Constructionism as the Epistemology ................................................................. 30  
2.3 Interpretivist Symbolic Interactionism as the Theoretical Perspective ...... 32  
2.4 Grounded Theory as the Research Methodology .............................................. 34  
2.5 Qualitative Research Methods ............................................................................... 40  
2.6 Chapter Review .......................................................................................................... 43  

3. Rigour and Quality of Research .................................................................................. 46  
3.1 Review of Quality Criteria in Qualitative Research ........................................... 46  
   *Burns's (1997) reliability, internal validity and external validity* .................................. 47  
   *Stenbacka's (2001) objection against reliability criterion* ........................................ 48  
   *Lincoln and Guba's (1985) essential criteria for quality* ......................................... 48  
   *Beck's (1993) components of rigour* ........................................................................ 48  
3.2 Procedures Used to Improve Research Quality .................................................. 51  
   *Triangulation* .............................................................................................................. 51  
   *Participants guiding the data collection process* ...................................................... 52  
   *Constant comparison method* ................................................................................ 53  
   *Member checking* ..................................................................................................... 53  
   *Participants' terminology used to generate the theory* ........................................... 54  
   *Transparency of research design reporting* .......................................................... 54  
   *Multiple coding* ........................................................................................................ 55  
   *Verbatims in describing emerging theory* .............................................................. 56
Legal issues ................................................................................................................157
Taxation issues .........................................................................................................158
6.9 Chapter Review .......................................................................................................159

7. Literature Review: Refining the Theory .................................................................162

7.1 The Role of a Literature Review in Grounded Theory ........................................163
7.2 Theories Explaining Technology Adoption and Diffusion ....................................165
  Diffusion of Innovations (DoI) ................................................................................166
  Perceived Characteristics of Innovating (PCI) .......................................................169
  Theory of Reasoned Action (TRA) .........................................................................170
  Theory of Planned Behaviour (TPB) ......................................................................172
  Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) ................................................................173
  Decomposed Theory of Planned Behaviour (DTPB) .............................................174
  Unified Theory of Acceptance and Use of Technology (UTAUT) .......................176
  Task–Technology Fit (TTF) ..................................................................................178
  Theory of Network Externalities ...........................................................................180

7.3 Theories Explaining Adoption and Diffusion
  of Mobile Payments or Related Services ................................................................182
  TAM extensions .....................................................................................................182
  Factors driving u-commerce ..................................................................................187
  Innovation versus infrastructure factors ................................................................188
  Competitive and contingency factors ...................................................................190
  Moderating factors .................................................................................................191
  Technology versus user-oriented factors ..............................................................193
  Multi-criteria approach ..........................................................................................194
  Additional success factors .....................................................................................195
  Players’ strengths and capabilities .........................................................................207
  Mobile payment consortia objectives ....................................................................213

7.4 Chapter Review .....................................................................................................219

8. Final Discussion ........................................................................................................221

8.1 Against Forcing of Data .......................................................................................222
8.2 Factors Confirmed in Data and Literature ...........................................................223
8.3 Factors Emerged from Data but not Confirmed in Literature .............................224
  Factors summary ..................................................................................................224
  Discussion ..............................................................................................................225
  Conclusion ...............................................................................................................227
8.4 Factors Proposed in Literature but not Confirmed in Data .................................228
  Factors summary ..................................................................................................228
  Discussion ..............................................................................................................232
  Conclusion ...............................................................................................................244
8.5 Chapter Review .....................................................................................................246
List of Figures and Tables

Figures

Figure 1: Thesis structure ..................................................................................................................... 5
Figure 2: Mobile payment publications up to 2003, both in total, and as they appeared in conferences and journals .................................. 11
Figure 3: Topics of mobile payment publications up to 2003 ............................................................. 12
Figure 4: Topics of mobile payment publications over the years ......................................................... 13
Figure 5: Topics of mobile payment publications up to 2006 (Dahlberg et al, 2007) ................................................................. 18
Figure 6: A research framework ...................................................................................................... 30
Figure 7: Advantages of using qualitative research methods in this study ........................................ 43
Figure 8: The research framework employed in this study ............................................................... 44
Figure 9: Screenshot of an open-ended Web survey for industry participants ............................... 68
Figure 10: Screenshot of the users’ Web survey with the focus shift to other payment methods .............................. 70
Figure 11: Screenshot of an email interview with an industry participant on an emerging category of Understanding players’ strengths and capabilities ........ 71
Figure 12: Screenshot of a summary of various occupations and ages of the participants ............. 78
Figure 13: Screenshot of the first page of the users’ Web surveys .................................................... 83
Figure 14: Coding a piece of survey data into a category using the drag-and-drop technique ....... 94
Figure 15: A memo example in NVivo ......................................................................................... 96