UNIVERSITY OF TECHNOLOGY, SYDNEY

TOWARDS A UBIQUITOUS GOVERNMENT: THE MOVE TO MOBILE SERVICES AS PERCEIVED BY THE END USER

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements
for the award of the degree
Doctor of Philosophy
in
Computer Sciences
by

Tarek El-Kiki

FACULTY OF INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY

January 2008

CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP/ORIGINALITY

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Production Note:
Signature removed prior to publication.

Tarek El-Kiki

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I would like to sincerely thank my supervisor, Associate Professor Elaine Lawrence, for her exceptional support and guidance during my research. It is my pleasure to take this opportunity to express my sincerest gratitude to her, as her dedicated academic supervision, as well as her remarkable concern of my well-being, has always been outstanding throughout my candidature. Whatever I may say to thank her will never be sufficient for the significant role she played which resulted in bringing this thesis to life. I was also exceptionally fortunate to have Dr. Agnieszka Bachfischer as my co-supervisor, as her expert, meticulous reading of my chapters maintained the accuracy and consistency of this thesis.

The most influential people, who have a large contribution in my happiness and current success in life, have been my mother Kadria whose wisdom and love have always been there for me to rejuvenate my mind and my heart, and my wife Mouna who set the best example for a loving, patient and encouraging wife. There have been difficult times during those three years of my candidature in which Mouna proved steadfast, especially when it came to looking after our five children, 'setting me free' to complete my research.

After, and before all, I thank Allaah Who empowered me, and facilitated everything material for me, in order to come to the end of this hectic 'ubiquitous' journey, safe and sound!

PUBLICATIONS SUPPORTING THIS RESEARCH

- El-Kiki, T. & Lawrence, E. 2008, 'Mobile User Needs: Efficient Transactions', *Fifth International Conference on Information Technology: New Generations*, IEEE Computer Society, Las Vegas, Nevada.

- El-Kiki, T. 2007, 'mGovernment: A Reality Check', *Proceedings of the International Conference on the Management of Mobile Business*, IEEE Computer Society, Washington, DC, USA, Toronto, Canada, p. 37.

- El-Kiki, T. & Lawrence, E. 2007, 'Mobile User Needs: Strategic Data', *The Tenth Collaborative Electronic Commerce Technology and Research, CollECTeR*, University of South Australia, Melbourne, Australia, <http://www.collecter2007.unisa.edu.au>.

- El-Kiki, T. & Lawrence, E. 2007, 'Mobile User Needs: Quality of Service', *The Fifth Collaborative Electronic Commerce Technology and Research, CollECTeR Iberoamérica*, Universidad Nacional de Córdoba, Argentina, <http://www.collecter.org.ar/>.

- El-Kiki, T. & Lawrence, E. 2007, 'Mobile User Needs: Value for money', *MeTTeG07: 1st International Conference on Methodologies, Technologies and Tools enabling e-Government*, Camerino - Italy.

- **El-Kiki**, T. & Lawrence, E. 2007, 'Emerging Mobile Government Services: Strategies for Success', *20th Bled eConference, eMergence: Merging and Emerging Technologies, Processes, and Institutions*, eds M.L. Markus, J.F. Hampe, J. Gricar, A. Pucihar & G. Lenart, Bled, Slovenia.

- **El-Kiki**, T., Lawrence, E. & Culjak, G. 2007, 'Expert's Perspectives on Barriers to the Development of Mobile Government Services', *Proceedings of WEBIST 2007 - Third International Conference on Web Information Systems and Technologies*, vol. 2, eds J. Filipe, J. Cordeiro, B. Encarnação & V. Pedrosa, Barcelona, Spain.

- Lawrence, E., Bina, M., Culjak, G. & **El-Kiki**, T. 2007, 'Wireless Community Networks: Public Assets for 21st Century Society', *International Conference on Information Technology '07')*, IEEE Computer Society, Las Vegas, Nevada, USA, pp. 166-174.

- **El-Kiki**, T. & Lawrence, E. 2006, 'Mobile User Satisfaction and Usage Analysis Model of mGovernment Services', *EURO mGov 2006 - The Second European Conference on Mobile Government*, eds I. Kushchu, C. Broucki & G. Fitzpatrick, Mobile Government Consortium International LLC, University of Sussex, Brighton, UK, pp. 91-102.

- **El-Kiki**, T. & Lawrence, E. 2006, 'Government as a Mobile Enterprise: Real-time, Ubiquitous Government', *Third International Conference on Information Technology: New Generations*, IEEE Computer Society, Las Vegas, Nevada, pp. 320 - 327.

- **El-Kiki**, T. & Lawrence, E. 2006, 'Efficiency in mGovernment Services: An Evaluation Framework', *WSEAS TRANSACTIONS ON INFORMATION SCIENCE AND APPLICATIONS*, vol. 3, no. 2, pp. 416-426.

- **El-Kiki**, T. & Lawrence, E. 2005, 'A Multi-Perspective Effectiveness Evaluation Methodology for mGovernment (MPE^2M-mG)', *IADIS International Conference - e-Commerce 2005*, Porto, Portugal.

- **El-Kiki**, T.H. & Lawrence, E.M. 2005, 'Towards a better understanding of efficiency in mGovernment services', *Proceedings of the 4th WSEAS International Conference on Information security, communications and computers*, WSEAS, Spain, 16 December 2005, pp. 1 -10.

- **El-Kiki**, T., Lawrence, E. & Steele, R. 2005, 'A Management Framework for Mobile Government Services', *The Eighth Collaborative Electronic Commerce Technology and Research, CollECTeR*, Sydney, Australia.

ABSTRACT

Mobile technologies, by virtue of their pervasive and powerful existence, are relentlessly transforming the way in which people work and play as people become contactable anytime anywhere. Mobile devices are becoming indispensable tools of verbal and data communication at present, and will be even more essential to the following generations.

The use of mobile technologies offers governments the possibility to render their services to the end users (constituents) in a more effective and efficient fashion. There are numerous factors that influence the effectiveness of government mobile services. These factors can be viewed from a few perspectives such as financial, administrative, social and technological; this research thoroughly analyses the end users' perspective towards the effectiveness of mobile government services.

Mobile government services are those services rendered to end users, be they citizens or businesses, through the use of mobile communication technology within the government administration. The main research question is what does 'successful government mobile service' mean to the end user? Both qualitative and quantitative methodologies are employed to establish the answer to this question.

In order for such answer to be accomplished, an extensive review of the available literature was performed to highlight the research problem as the first step in the research process. Subsequently, experts in the fields of mobile government and electronic government were consulted through a web-based survey that also

worked as an online interview as several participants were willing to undertake further discussions on the survey findings. The findings of this survey were aligned and compared with the outcomes of the literature review resulting in a useful classification of the mobile service success factors as well as pinpointing the barriers to such success.

The following step was devising two mobile service effectiveness evaluation models which employed those classified success factors as evaluation metrics. These models formed the theoretical basis for a real-world survey, through which end-users' opinions about their needs for mobile service were collected and analysed. Once these needs are fulfilled by the mobile service, satisfaction is reached, and, accordingly, these needs are considered as real success factors for the mobile service from the end-users' perspective.

According to those two mobile service effectiveness evaluation models, these success factors must satisfy one perspective, which is the end-users' (citizens & businesses), from four perspectives: Citizens & Businesses, Operational & Internal Business, Innovation & Learning and Financial & Economic, if a comprehensive effectiveness evaluation is required.

In order to build a realistic picture about the practical rendering of effective mobile services by local governments, (if there were any), the researcher selected three local Sydney councils to conduct a case study.

The literature review, the experts and users surveys, as well as case studies have all contributed to a practical framework that represents a checklist for government mobile service providers to adopt and adapt according to their mobile services provisions. Accordingly, this study contributes with its outcomes,

such as mGovernment theoretical management framework, and the devised effectiveness evaluation tools, to enrich this novel field of work and research; the field of mobile government services.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION 1

1.1. Research Overview 1
1.2. Scope of the Study 3
1.3. Research Questions 4
1.4. Research Objectives 5
1.5. Research Methodology 6
1.6. Research Implications 6
1.7. Research Significance 7
1.8. Research Motivation 7
1.9. Thesis Outline 8
1.10. Chapter Review 14

2. FUNDAMENTALS OF MGOVERNMENT 15

2.1. Introduction 16
2.2. Background 17
2.3. eGovernment transforming phases and the emergence of mGovernment 20
2.4. Types of eGovernment partnerships inherited by mGovernment shaping its mission and vision 30
2.4.1. Government-to-Citizen (G2C) & Citizen-to-Government (C2G) 31
2.4.2. Government-to-Business (G2B) & Business-to-Government (B2G) 31
2.4.3. Government-to-Employee (G2E) 32
2.4.4. Government-to-Government (G2G) 32
2.5. Dimensions of mGovernment 32
2.6. mGovernment definition and its integration with eGovernment 34
2.7. Pressures facing and leading to mGovernment 36
2.7.1. Challenges and Opportunities 39
2.7.1.1. Infrastructure Development 40
2.7.1.2. Law and Public Policy 41
2.7.1.3. Digital Divide 41
2.7.1.4. Trust, Privacy and Security 43
2.7.2. Transparency and Accountability 46

2.7.3. Technical Challenges 47
2.8. Chapter Review 49

3. RESEARCH PROBLEM 50

3.1. Introduction 51
3.2. mGovernment goals as project engines 52
3.3. mGovernment objectives and strategies 54
3.3.1. mG2C (mGovernment-to-Citizen) 54
3.3.2. mG2B (mGovernment-to-Business) 55
3.4. mGovernment service project's success factors 56
3.5. Research Questions 67
3.6. Research Objectives 68
3.7. Locating the Problem 69
3.7.1. Strategic Level 71
3.7.2. Managerial Level 71
3.7.3. Operational Level 72
3.7.4. Outputs 73
3.7.4.1. Change: 73
3.7.4.2. Innovation: 74
3.7.5. Outcomes 75
3.7.5.1. Benefits: 75
3.7.5.2. Risks: 76
3.7.6. Problem location 77
3.8. Chapter Review 79

4. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY 80

4.1. Introduction 80
4.2. Research Design 81
4.2.1. Research Philosophy 82
4.2.1.1. Constructionism as the Epistemology 83
4.2.1.2. Interpretivist as the Theoretical Paradigm 84
4.2.2. Research Methodology 87
4.2.2.1. Qualitative Research Methods 88
4.2.2.2. Quantitative Research Methods 92
4.2.2.3. Discussion and Rationale for Choice of Approach 92

4.3. Research Process 95
4.3.1.1. Phase I 97
4.3.1.2. Phase II 99
4.4. Research Quality Evaluation 101
4.4.1. Quality of the qualitative study 101
4.4.1.1. Credibility or Internal Validity 103
4.4.1.2. Transferability or External Validity 105
4.4.1.3. Dependability or Reliability 106
4.4.1.4. Conformability or Objectivity 107
4.4.1.5. Subjectivity 108
4.4.1.6. Transparency 110
4.4.1.7. Communicability 110
4.4.1.8. Coherence 111
4.4.2. Quality of the quantitative study 111
4.5. Chapter Review 112

5. DATA COLLECTION & ANALYSIS 113

5.1. Introduction 113
5.2. Data collection 115
5.2.1. Literature Review 115
5.2.2. Web-based Surveys 117
5.2.2.1. Experts' & Government Officials' Survey 120
5.2.2.2. End-users' Survey 125
5.2.3. Case Studies 131
5.2.3.1. Selection of the Samples 132
5.2.3.2. Design of the Telephone Interview 133
5.2.3.3. Data recording and management 134
5.3. Data Analysis 135
5.3.1. Qualitative Analysis Strategy 136
5.3.1.1. Codification Processes 137
5.3.1.2. Refining Coding Scheme 141
5.3.2. Quantitative Analysis Strategy 141
5.3.2.1. Creating Variables 142
5.3.2.2. Data Reduction 144
5.3.2.3. Creating Relationships 145
5.4. Chapter Review 145

6. EXPERT SURVEY ANALYSIS 148

6.1. Introduction 149

6.2. Background 150

6.3. Survey Quantitative Data Analysis 151

6.3.1. Demographic Data 152

6.3.1.1. Gender 152

6.3.1.2. Age 153

6.3.1.3. Country of Residence 154

6.3.1.4. Involvement in mGovernment service project 156

6.3.1.5. Professional Occupation 158

6.4. Survey Qualitative Data Analysis 159

6.4.1. Organisational Barriers 160

6.4.2. Organisational Suggestions 162

6.4.3. Technical Barriers 165

6.4.4. Technical Suggestions 166

6.4.5. Governance Barriers 168

6.4.6. Social Barriers 168

6.4.7. Social Suggestions 170

6.4.7.1. Mobile Service Price 170

6.4.7.2. Mobile Service Privacy and Security 171

6.4.7.3. Mobile Service Training and Education 172

6.5. Chapter Review 174

7. MSERVICE EFFECTIVENESS AND END USER'S DATA ANALYSIS 176

7.1. Introduction 177

7.2. Multi-Perspective Effectiveness Evaluation Methodology for mGovernment (MPE^{2}M-mG) 180

7.2.1. First Step 180

7.2.2. Background on Effectiveness Measurement Approaches and the Emergence of MPE^{2}M-mG 181

7.2.3. Describing MPE^{2}M-mG 186

7.2.3.1. Problem Assessment (Evaluation Question) 187

7.2.3.2. Designing a Management Plan 187

7.2.3.3. Implementation 188

7.2.3.4. Monitoring 188

7.2.3.5. Evaluation 189

7.2.3.6. Adjustment 190
7.3. End User Satisfaction and Usage Analysis Model of mServices (EUSM) 191
7.3.1. Background on End-User Satisfaction Analysis 191
7.3.2. Mobile-User's Goals/Benefits: Definition and Analysis 193
7.3.2.1. Value for Money 194
7.3.2.2. Quality of Service 195
7.3.2.3. Efficient Transactions 199
7.3.2.4. Strategic Data 202
7.3.3. Satisfaction 203
7.4. Quantitative Data Analysis 207
7.4.1. Characteristics of the Participants 207
7.4.1.1. General Outlook 207
7.4.1.2. mService Awareness 209
7.4.1.3. mService Interest 210
7.4.1.4. Mobile Devices 210
7.4.1.5. Mobile Devices Usage Skills 212
7.4.1.6. Mobile Devices Usage Duration 213
7.4.1.7. End User's Profile 214
7.4.2. Benefits Data Analysis 217
7.4.2.1. Value for Money (VfM) Construct 217
7.4.2.2. Quality of Service (QoS) Construct 219
7.4.2.3. Efficient Transactions (ET) Construct 222
7.4.2.4. Strategic Data (SD) Construct 224
7.4.2.5. Satisfaction (Construct of Constructs) 225
7.4.3. Constructs Validity and Reliability 227
7.4.3.1. Content Validity 227
7.4.3.2. Construct Validity 228
7.4.3.3. Construct Reliability 229
7.5. Qualitative Data Analysis 230
7.5.1. mService Advantages as Viewed by End Users 230
7.5.2. mService Disadvantages as Viewed by End Users 233
7.6. Chapter Review 236

8. LOCAL GOVERNMENT CASE STUDIES 238

8.1. Introduction 238
8.2. Stage 1: Accuracy Check & Data Reduction 240
8.2.1. Case Study 1: Council A 241

8.2.1.1. The Council's current electronic services 241
8.2.1.2. The Council's current mobile services 242
8.2.1.3. Impact of mobile technology on the Council's internal and external operations 243
8.2.1.4. Problems in using the mobile technologies 244
8.2.1.5. The Council's opinion about mService success factors 245
8.2.1.6. Plans for further mobile technology use 245
8.2.2. Case Study 2: Council B 246
8.2.2.1. The Council's current electronic services 246
8.2.2.2. The Council's current mobile services 247
8.2.2.3. Impact of mobile technology on the Council's internal and external operations 248
8.2.2.4. Problems in using the mobile technologies 248
8.2.2.5. The Council's opinion about mService success factors 249
8.2.2.6. Plans for further mobile technology use 249
8.2.3. Case Study 3: Council C 250
8.2.3.1. The Council's current electronic services 250
8.2.3.2. The Council's current mobile services 251
8.2.3.3. Impact of mobile technology on the Council's internal and external operations 252
8.2.3.4. Problems in using the mobile technologies 252
8.2.3.5. The Council's opinion about mService success factors 253
8.2.3.6. Plans for further mobile technology use 253
8.3. Stage 2: Open Coding 254
8.4. Stage 3: Selective Coding 257
8.5. Chapter Review 261

9. OUTCOMES & CONCLUSIONS 263

9.1. Overview of the Study 263
9.2. Research Question 266
9.2.1. Narrowing the research focus 267
9.2.2. mService effectiveness analysis 268
9.2.3. Defining end user's needs 269
9.3. Research Contributions 269
9.3.1. Comprehensive mGovernment evolution review 270
9.3.2. mGovernment theoretical management framework 271
9.3.3. Multi-Perspective Effectiveness Evaluation Methodology for mGovernment (MPE^2M-mG) 271

9.3.4. mService success factors 272
9.3.5. Organisational success factors 272
9.3.5.1. Technical success factors 274
9.3.5.2. Social success factors 274
9.3.5.3. End user's profile as a success factor 277
9.3.6. Local government perspectives about mServices 277
9.3.6.1. Cautions and recommendations 277
9.3.6.2. Conditions of success 278
9.3.6.3. End-users' benefits 278
9.3.6.4. Staff-member benefits 279
9.3.6.5. Successful mService Characteristics 279
9.4. Research Implications 279
9.4.1. Theoretical Implications 280
9.4.2. Practical Implications 280
9.5. Research Strengths 281
9.5.1. Significance 281
9.5.2. Sound and relevant theoretical philosophy 282
9.5.3. Rigour and quality of the research 283
9.5.4. Impact value of this study 284
9.6. Research Limitations 284
9.7. Future Directions 286

REFERENCES 287

APPENDIX A: TOWARDS A BETTER UNDERSTANDING OF EFFICIENCY IN MGOVERNMENT SERVICES 322

APPENDIX B: MORE DETAILS ABOUT CHAPTER 7'S ANALYSIS 349

APPENDIX C: LOCAL GOVERNMENT INTERVIEW GUIDE 376

APPENDIX D: MOBILE AND ELECTRONIC SERVICES RENDERED BY THE LOCAL COUNCILS 383

APPENDIX E: SCRIPTS OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT INTERVIEWS 393

APPENDIX F: EXPERTS' QUESTIONNAIRE..... 428

APPENDIX G: END-USERS' QUESTIONNAIRE..... 433

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1-1: Study plan overview 13

Figure 2-1: Chapter 2 outline 16

Figure 2-2: eGovernment transforming phases. Source: (Layne & Lee 2001) 21

Figure 2-3: Types of eGovernment partnership 30

Figure 2-4: mGovernment dimensions and partnership portfolios 33

Figure 2-5: Projected global mobile penetration levels. Source: (Taaffe 2006) 38

Figure 2-6: Generic mGovernment project process. Source: adapted from El-Kiki et al. (2005) 39

Figure 3-1: Chapter 3 outline 51

Figure 3-2: The relationship between mGovernment vision and its projects 56

Figure 3-3: Summary of success factors literature review 66

Figure 3-4: mGovernment's ubiquity empowering the government 69

Figure 3-5: mGovernment theoretical management framework 70

Figure 3-6: Problem location 78

Figure 4-1: Research design components 82

Figure 4-2: Four Paradigms of Social Research. Source: (Burrell & Morgan 1979) 85

Figure 4-3: Research process 96

Figure 4-4: Research Quality Evaluation Guideline 103

Figure 5-1: Data collection and analysis process 114

Figure 5-2: Expert survey front page screenshot 121

Figure 5-3: End user's survey introductory page 126

Figure 5-4: Qualitative data analysis processes 140

Figure 6-1: Respondents gender ratio 153

Figure 6-2: Respondents age ranges 154

Figure 6-3: Counties of the survey participating experts 156

Figure 6-4: mService suggested success mix. Source: adapted from (El-Kiki & Lawrence 2007a) 160

Figure 7-1: Effectiveness as a relation between inputs and outcomes. Source: Adapted from El-Kiki et al. (2005) 178

Figure 7-2: Multi-Perspective Effectiveness Evaluation Methodology for mGovernment 183

Figure 7-3: Effectiveness evaluation process implementing AMA. Source: Adapted from J.B. Nyberg (1999) 186

Figure 7-4: Mobile-user's four main benefits from mGovernment services, and their Indicators 194

Figure 7-5: mService effectiveness as result of collective benefits satisfaction 204

Figure 7-6: mService awareness by participants' ages 209

Figure 7-7: Mobile device types as used by gender 211

Figure 7-8: Distribution of mobile device usage skills by age range 212

Figure 7-9: Respondents' experience in using their mobile devices 214

Figure 7-10: Value for Money construct collective answers 218

Figure 7-11: Quality for Service construct collective answers 220

Figure 7-12: Efficient Transactions construct collective answers 223

Figure 7-13: Strategic Data construct collective answers 225

Figure 7-14: Overall Satisfaction 227

Figure 7-15: NVivo generated model of mService advantages 233

Figure 7-16: NVivo generated model of mService disadvantages 235

Figure 8-1: Open coding interpreted in free nodes 256

Figure 8-2: Selective coding interpreted in tree nodes 260

Figure 9-1: Research workflow outlook 265

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2-1: Six stages of data processing growth. Source: (Nolan 1979, p. 117) 24

Table 2-2: eGovernment framework with examples. Source: (Moon 2002, p. 426) 26

Table 2-3: Stage 6: Ubiquity. Source: (El-Kiki 2006, p. 42) 29

Table 2-4: Projected global mobile penetration levels. Source: (Taaffe 2006) 38

Table 3-1: Summarised eGovernment success factors 62

Table 3-2: Summarised mGovernment success factors 64

Table 5-1: Variables of indicator constructs 144

Table 6-1: Factors Impacting Mobile Acceptance. Source: (Carroll 2005) 150

Table 6-2: Gender representation in the collected expert survey data 152

Table 6-3: Age representation in the collected expert survey data 153

Table 6-4: Country of residence representation in the collected expert survey data 155

Table 6-5: Experts involvement in previous mGovernment service projects 156

Table 6-6: Success rates of experts participated-in mService projects 157

Table 6-7: Participated-in mService projects by country and success rate 158

Table 6-8: Survey participants' professional occupations 159

Table 6-9: Legal issue as barriers to mGovernment 162

Table 7-1: A summary of some effectiveness measurement methods. Source: Adapted from Vedung (2000) 183

Table 7-2: AMA applied on mGovernment in Hungary. Source: Derived from Information Policy (2004) 185

Table 7-3: Mobile End-User Satisfaction Questions Source: Derived from (El-Kiki & Lawrence 2006b) 206

Table 7-4: Participants demographic data distributed by active and passive users' genders 208

Table 7-5: mService awareness percentages distributed by participants' age ranges.... 209

Table 7-6: Participants' interest in mServices by gender..... 210

Table 7-7: Participants' usage of mobile devices by gender 211

Table 7-8: Age and mobile device usage skills..... 212

Table 7-9: Age and duration of using the mobile devices 213

Table 7-10: Chi-Square relatedness analysis between one independent variable and nine dependants 215

Table 7-11: Mean = Overall Satisfaction..... 226

Table 7-12: Construct reliability results as tested by Cronbach's alpha 230

Table 7-13: Coding Summary Report for mService Advantages as viewed by end users 232

Table 7-14: Coding Summary Report for mService Disadvantages as viewed by end users 235

Table 8-1: Free nodes assigned to tree nodes..... 259

"New conditions impose new requirements on government and those who conduct government"

Franklin D. Roosevelt