

The Impact of Patient Transfers and Bedspace Moves on Nurse Workload

Nicole Blay

2015

A Thesis submitted in fulfilment of a PhD

Faculty of Health, University of Technology Sydney

Supervisors

Professor Christine Duffield

Professor Robyn Gallagher

Dr Michael Roche

CERTIFICATE OF ORIGINAL AUTHORSHIP

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Student:

Production Note:
Signature removed prior to publication.

Date: 08/12/2015

Acknowledgements

A body of work such as is presented here cannot be accomplished without the support and encouragement of many individuals. To each of you, I thank you.

I am greatly indebted to my principal supervisor Christine Duffield, for her expert guidance and patience with reading and reviewing the (very) many drafts of this thesis. Likewise for my co-supervisors, Robyn Gallagher and Michael Roche. Robyn for her boundless enthusiasm and statistical expertise and Michael for freely giving up his time, even when on sabbatical, to support me with the management of the large health administrative dataset.

I would also like to express my sincere gratitude to the nurses who have contributed in many different ways to this project. To Vicki Manning for access to the secondary data and the wards at the site hospital. Cara Dickson for downloading the data from HIE. Elle and Amanda for access to your wards and patients under your care. Special thanks must go to the nurses working on the medical and surgical wards used in Stage 2. Your enthusiasm to be observed and timed, made data collection an overwhelmingly positive experience.

Appreciation is also extended to Claudia Virdun and the Bachelor of Nursing students for permission to attend their clinical skill sessions at the Faculty of Health, Karing-gai campus. These sessions highlighted the need to modify space on the data collection tool and gave me much needed timing practise.

And finally, I am forever grateful to my family without whose support I would not have completed this study. To my husband and sons for their patience throughout the many hours that I have spent with my laptop, and to my mum for her unending encouragement to fulfil my dreams. I hope that one day you will reap the benefits of my endeavours.

'This life is a hospital in which each patient is obsessed with the desire to change beds'

Charles Baudelaire (1821-1867)¹

¹ Baudelaire, C. (1867). 'Anywhere Out of the World', *Little Poems in Prose*; Spleen, Paris.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	III
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	V
LIST OF TABLES.....	XII
LIST OF FIGURES	XIV
ABSTRACT	XV
AUTHOR PUBLICATIONS ASSOCIATED WITH THIS THESIS	XVII
CHAPTER 1. BACKGROUND	1
1.1 THE AUSTRALIAN HEALTHCARE SYSTEM.....	3
1.2 NURSING WORKFORCE	7
1.2.1 <i>Bed Management Strategies</i>	10
1.3 TERMINOLOGIES AND DEFINITIONS USED IN THIS THESIS	12
1.4 STUDY PURPOSE	14
1.5 RESEARCH QUESTIONS.....	15
CHAPTER 2. PATIENT FLOW	16
2.1 STRATEGIES TO IMPROVE PATIENT FLOW.....	16
2.1.1 <i>Short-stay Units</i>	16
2.1.2 <i>The Transit Lounge</i>	17
2.1.3 <i>National Emergency Access Target</i>	18
2.1.4 ‘Winter’ Beds	20
2.1.5 <i>Other Patient Flow Strategies</i>	21
2.2 PATIENT TRANSFERS	24
2.2.1 <i>Definitions of Patient Transfers</i>	24
2.2.2 <i>Incidence of Patient Transfers</i>	25
2.2.3 <i>Patterns of Patient Transfers</i>	26

2.3	BEDSPACE MOVES	27
2.3.1	<i>Incidence of Bedspace Moves</i>	28
2.3.2	<i>Mixed Gender Patient Rooms</i>	28
2.4	THE IMPACT OF PATIENT TRANSFERS AND BEDSPACE MOVES ON STAFF TIME.....	30
2.4.1	<i>Summary</i>	33
CHAPTER 3. LITERATURE REVIEW		34
3.1	NURSING WORKLOAD.....	35
3.1.1	<i>Nursing Workload and Patient Turnover</i>	39
3.2	NURSING WORKLOAD STUDIES AND PATIENT TRANSFERS	41
3.2.1	<i>Patient Transfers and Nursing Work</i>	43
3.2.2	<i>Transfer Activities and Nurse Workload</i>	46
3.2.3	<i>Summary</i>	53
CHAPTER 4. OBSERVATIONAL RESEARCH STUDY METHODS		55
4.1	TIME AND MOTION.....	55
4.1.1	<i>Background</i>	56
4.1.2	<i>Time and Motion Technique</i>	58
4.1.3	<i>Timing a Process</i>	60
4.1.4	<i>Identifying Activities</i>	62
4.1.5	<i>Pilot Observation</i>	63
4.1.6	<i>Categorising Activities</i>	65
4.1.7	<i>Observers, Training & Inter-rater Reliability</i>	69
4.1.8	<i>Timing Devices</i>	71
4.2	OBSERVATIONAL RESEARCH STUDY DESIGNS	72
4.2.1	<i>Study Duration</i>	72
4.2.2	<i>Observation Periods</i>	73
4.2.3	<i>Observation Hours</i>	75
4.2.4	<i>Sample Size</i>	77

4.3 VARIANTS OF TIME & MOTION TECHNIQUES.....	80
4.3.1 <i>Time and Motion, Work Sampling or Timing Study?</i>	81
4.3.2 <i>Self-reporting</i>	84
4.4 LIMITATIONS OF OBSERVATIONAL RESEARCH TECHNIQUES	85
4.4.1 <i>Timing Methods</i>	85
4.4.2 <i>Non-observed Time</i>	87
4.4.3 <i>Hawthorne Effect</i>	88
4.4.4 <i>Examining Workload Associated with Transfers and Bedspace Moves</i>	91
4.4.5 <i>Conclusion</i>	92
CHAPTER 5. RESEARCH METHOD	94
5.1 RESEARCH QUESTIONS.....	94
5.2 DESIGN	95
5.2.1 <i>Stage 1</i>	95
5.2.2 <i>Stage 2</i>	95
5.2.3 <i>Stage 3</i>	96
5.2.4 <i>Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria</i>	96
5.2.5 <i>Site</i>	97
5.2.6 <i>Setting</i>	97
5.2.7 <i>Subjects</i>	98
5.2.8 <i>Instruments</i>	99
5.2.9 <i>Ethics Approval</i>	101
5.3 STAGE 1 PROCEDURE.....	102
5.3.1 <i>Inpatient and Transfer Variables</i>	105
5.3.2 <i>Merging and transposition of data in PASW</i>	106
5.4 DATA MANAGEMENT	107
5.4.1 <i>Coding of Admissions, Transfers and Discharges</i>	107
5.4.2 <i>Data Cleansing</i>	109
5.5 STAGE 2 PROCEDURE.....	110

5.6	DEVELOPMENT OF THE DATA COLLECTION TOOL	111
5.6.1	<i>Identification of Nursing Activities</i>	111
5.6.2	<i>Identification of Activity Categories</i>	113
5.6.3	<i>Data Collection Tool</i>	117
5.6.4	<i>Pilot Study</i>	117
5.7	OBSERVATION AND TIMING OF PATIENT TRANSFERS	119
5.7.1	<i>Sending Transfers</i>	120
5.7.2	<i>Receiving Transfers</i>	120
5.8	STAGE 2 DATA COLLECTION	121
5.8.1	<i>Observation Periods</i>	121
5.8.2	<i>Sample Size</i>	121
5.8.3	<i>Participant Consent</i>	122
5.8.4	<i>Identifying Transfers and Bedspace Moves</i>	122
5.9	TIMING PROCEDURE.....	124
5.9.1	<i>The Timing of Sending Transfers</i>	124
5.9.2	<i>The Timing of Receiving Transfers</i>	124
5.9.3	<i>The Timing Process</i>	125
5.9.4	<i>Privacy and Confidentiality</i>	126
5.9.5	<i>Data entry</i>	127
5.10	STAGE 3 PROCEDURE: CASE STUDY.....	127
5.10.1	<i>Field Notes</i>	128
5.11	ANALYSES	129
5.11.1	<i>Stage 1 Analyses</i>	129
5.11.2	<i>Stage 2 Analyses</i>	132
5.11.3	<i>Stage 3 Analyses</i>	134
CHAPTER 6. STAGE 1 RESULTS		135
6.1	PATIENTS	135
6.2	EPISODES OF CARE	136

6.2.1	<i>Average Length of Stay</i>	136
6.2.2	<i>Admission Unit</i>	136
6.3	TRANSFERS	137
6.4	BEDSPACE MOVES	138
6.5	TRANSFERS BY CLINICAL SPECIALTY	139
6.6	BEDSPACE MOVES BY CLINICAL SPECIALTY	141
6.6.1	<i>Patterns of Patient Movements</i>	141
6.6.2	<i>Transfers by Nursing Shift</i>	143
6.7	MEDICAL-SURGICAL TRANSFERS AND BEDSPACE MOVES	143
6.7.1	<i>Transfers and Bedspace Moves by Medical-Surgical Units</i>	144
6.7.2	<i>Summary</i>	147
CHAPTER 7.	STAGE 2 RESULTS	149
7.1	OBSERVED PATIENT MOVES.....	149
7.1.1	<i>Pattern of Moves</i>	150
7.1.2	<i>Duration of Patient Moves</i>	152
7.2	ACTIVITIES	153
7.2.1	<i>Activities by Activity Category</i>	154
7.2.2	<i>Activities Associated with Transfers and Bedspace Moves</i>	156
7.2.3	<i>Communication</i>	157
7.2.4	<i>Direct Care</i>	158
7.2.5	<i>Documentation</i>	160
7.2.6	<i>Other Activities</i>	160
7.2.7	<i>Indirect Care</i>	162
7.2.8	<i>Administration</i>	163
7.3	NURSES	164
7.3.1	<i>Number of Nurses Involved in each Patient Move</i>	165
7.3.2	<i>Number of Nurses and Duration of Moves</i>	165
7.4	DIRECT NURSING TIME	166

7.4.1	<i>Medical and Surgical Nursing Comparisons</i>	168
7.5	NURSE DESIGNATION.....	168
7.5.1	<i>Activity Category by Nurse Designation</i>	169
7.5.2	<i>Activities by Nurse Designation</i>	170
7.5.3	<i>Comparisons between Registered and Enrolled Nurses</i>	170
7.5.4	<i>Summary</i>	172
CHAPTER 8. STAGE 3: CASE STUDIES		174
8.1	FIELD NOTES.....	174
8.2	CASE 1.....	176
8.3	CASE 2.....	179
8.3.1	<i>Comparisons between Case 1 and Case 2</i>	182
8.3.2	<i>Summary</i>	184
CHAPTER 9. DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION.....		185
9.1	PATIENT FLOW	185
9.2	PATIENT MOVES AND NURSING WORK	190
9.2.1	<i>Patient Transfers and Nurse Staffing Requirements</i>	194
9.2.2	<i>Patient Moves and the Impact on Nursing Workload</i>	195
9.3	POLICY IMPLICATIONS	202
9.4	RECOMMENDATIONS	204
9.4.1	<i>Acuity-adaptable rooms</i>	204
9.4.2	<i>Transport Teams and ADT Nurses</i>	206
9.5	FUTURE RESEARCH.....	208
9.6	LIMITATIONS	208
9.7	CONCLUSION	211
REFERENCES		213
APPENDIX A		245

SYNTAXES FOR TRANSFERS AND BEDSPACE MOVES	245
APPENDIX B	247
STAGE 1 RESULTS	247
APPENDIX C.....	254
RESEARCH STUDIES AND PATIENT TRANSFERS	254
APPENDIX D	271
TRANSFER TIMING TOOL (TTT)	271
APPENDIX E.....	284
STAGE 2 RESULTS	284
APPENDIX F.....	290
STAGE 3: FIELD NOTES	290
APPENDIX G	298
HREC DOCUMENTATION	298

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Definitions used in this thesis	13
Table 2: Summary Table showing the Three distinct Research Stages	101
Table 3: Episodic, Patient and Transfer Variables	104
Table 4: Clinical Specialities as Coded in this Thesis	110
Table 5: Sending Transfer Categories and Activities	115
Table 6: Receiving Transfer Activities and Categories.....	116
Table 7: Calculation of Bedspace Moves.....	132
Table 8: Admission Unit	137
Table 9: Transfers and Bedspace Moves by Episode of Care	138
Table 10: Frequency of Patient Transfers by Clinical Specialty	140
Table 11: Frequency of Bedspace Moves by Clinical Specialty	141
Table 12: Admissions, Transfers and Bedspace Moves by Day of the Week	142
Table 13: Admissions, Transfers and Bedspace Moves by Nursing Shift	143
Table 14: Frequency of Patient Moves in the Medical Units	145
Table 15: Frequency of Transfers and Bedspace Moves within Surgical Units	147
Table 16: Patient Moves by Ward Type	150
Table 17: The Five Activities that Accounted for the most Time (minutes)	156
Table 18: Nurse Time Spent on Communication Activities	158
Table 19: Nurse Time Spent on Direct Care Activities.....	160
Table 20: Nurse Time Spent on 'Other' Activities	162
Table 21: Nurse Time Spent on Indirect Care Activities	163
Table 22: Nurse Time Spent on Administration Activities.....	164
Table 23: Duration of Move by the Number of Nurses and Direct Nursing Time by Type of Move	167
Table 24: Frequency of Activities by Nurse Designation	170
Table 25: Time (minutes) Spent on Activity Categories by Registered and Enrolled Nurses	171
Table 26: Differences in Mean Time (minutes) Spent by Registered and Enrolled Nurses by Activity Categories.....	172

Table 27: Selected Field Notes Highlighting the Effect of Patient Moves on Nurses' Work	175
Table 28: Case 1 Sending Transfer of Short Duration	177
Table 29: Case 2 Sending Transfer of Lengthy Duration	181
Table 30: Comparisons of Time (Minutes) spent on Nurse Activities for Cases 1 and 2	183

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Medical-Surgical Patient Moves by Month of the Year.....	144
Figure 2: Percentage of Transfers and Bedspace Moves by Weekday.....	151
Figure 3: Time of Observed Transfers and Bedspace Moves	152
Figure 4: Duration by Type of Move.....	153
Figure 5: Percentage of Time Spent by Nurses by Activity Category	154
Figure 6: Percentage of Activity Categories by Type of Move	155
Figure 7: Percentage of Frequency of Activities within the Communication Category	157
Figure 8: Percentage of Frequency of Activities within the Direct Care Category	159
Figure 9: Percentage of 'Other' Activities.....	161
Figure 10: Percentage of Administrative Activities	163
Figure 11: Percentage of Activity Categories by Nurse Designation	169

Abstract

This multiple methods study explores the impact of moving patients between and within wards on nursing workload. While patient transfers (between clinical units) and bedspace moves (between beds on the same ward) are a routine part of nursing practice in acute hospitals, the rate of transfers has increased in recent times, due primarily to a shortage of hospital beds and an increasing demand for health services. The organisation and preparation of the patient prior, during and post transfer or bedspace move and the related communication processes forms a component of nursing work that has not been comprehensively explored. As a consequence, the impact of patient moves on nursing workload has not been fully realised nor captured in staffing models.

A three-stage, sequential approach was used in this study. Stage 1 retrospectively examined 2008-2009 financial and patient administrative data to explore the incidence and destination of patient moves in one Australian metropolitan hospital over a financial year. Results identified that the majority of patient movements involved medical-surgical wards ($n=12$) and were therefore suitable contexts for more in-depth investigation.

Stage 2 consisted of a direct observational-timing study conducted over a seven week period. Based on Stage 1 results, one medical and one surgical ward with a high rate of patient moves were selected for observation. A purpose-designed data collection tool was used to record and time nursing activities associated with observed patient moves ($n=75$). From these observational records and field notes, two case studies were developed in Stage 3 to demonstrate in detail the sequence of nursing activities, the

role of the nurse and the factors that can impact on the time taken to transfer a patient to another ward.

The results of Stage 1 identified that at the selected hospital, 10,733 patients who remained in hospital for 48 hours or more experienced 34,715 transfers and bedspace moves in the selected year. The largest single group (48.6%, n=16,861) of these moves involved medical-surgical wards. The results from Stage 2 indicated that the average patient transfer took 65.8 minutes and bedspace moves 29.2 minutes to complete. Of this time, over 40 minutes of nurses' time was spent on patient transfers and 11 minutes on bedspace moves. This means that for medical-surgical wards alone, 3.9 FTE nurses are necessary for all the moves that occur each month.

The impact of patient transfers and bedspace moves on nurses' workload is considerable. Time spent moving patients means that less time is available for other patients and their care needs. In addition, many transfer activities could be performed by other members of the team. Given the impact on nurses' workload, it is timely for hospitals to consider strategies to minimise the frequency and improve the efficiency of patient transfers.

Author Publications Associated with this Thesis

- Blay, N., Duffield, C., Gallagher, R. & Roche, M. 2014, 'Methodological Integrative Review of the Work Sampling Technique used in Nursing Workload Research', *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, vol. 70, no. 11, pp. 2434-2449.
- Blay, N., Duffield, C., Gallagher, R. & Roche, M. 2014, 'A Systematic Review of Time Studies to Assess the Impact of Patient Transfers on Nurse Workload', *International Journal of Nursing Practice*, vol. 20, no. 6, pp. 662-73.
- Blay, N., Duffield, C.M. & Gallagher, R. 2012, 'Patient transfers in Australia: implications for nursing workload and patient outcomes', *Journal of Nursing Management*, vol. 20, no. 3, pp. 302-10.