

The Constitution of Public Sector Management Work

Christine Shearer

**A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
degree of**

Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)

UTS Business School

University of Technology Sydney

Sydney, Australia

February 2016

Certification

This thesis is submitted in fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of PhD at the University of Technology Sydney Business School, Management Discipline Group. This represents the original work and contribution of the author, except as acknowledged by general and specific references within the dissertation.

I hereby certify that this thesis has not been submitted for a higher degree to any other university or institution.

Ethics Committee Approval has been obtained.

Reference numbers: 2012 457A

UTS Ethics approval number UTS HREC 2012 457A

Signed:

Student's name: Christine Shearer

Date: October 2015

List of Research Publications

Academic publications

Referred conference papers

Clegg, S., Johnston, J. & Shearer, C. 2015, 'The impact of contemporary management ideas: their influence on the constitution of public sector management work', conference paper presented at 5th *Organizations, Artefacts and Practices (OAP) conference: "Managerial Techniques and Materiality in Management and Organisation Studies"*, 7–8 December 2015, workshop topic: Fads and Fashions in Managerial Techniques Adoption and the place of Materiality in this process.

Clegg, S., Johnston, J. & Shearer, C. 2015, 'Leadership by members of a Canberra centric cultural tribe in a political and sometimes virtual place: organisation and disorganisation', conference paper presented at *Asia Pacific Researchers in Organisation Studies (APROS) and European Group for Organisational Studies (EGOS) conference: "Spaces, Constraints, Creativities: Organization Disorganization"*, 9–11 December 2015, workshop stream: conference stream: Re-Conceptualizing Leadership and its Development: Space, Place, and the Virtual World.

Clegg, S., Johnston, J. & Shearer, C. 2016, 'Management or political competence development in the public sector?' Conference paper to be presented at the *European Group for Organisational Studies (EGOS) Colloquium: "Organizing in the Shadow of Power"*, 7-9 July 2016, Naples, Italy general theme: sub-theme 51: 'In the Shadows of Public Sector Reforms'.

Other academic and industry publications

Clegg, S., Johnston, J. & Shearer, C. 2014, 'Bureaucracy and public sector governmentality', in *The Wiley Blackwell Encyclopaedia of Sociology*, 2nd edition.

Academic presentations

Shearer, C. 2013, Doctoral Assessment Stage II presentation to University of Technology Sydney (UTS), Assessment Panel, UTS, Sydney Australia.

Shearer, C. 2014, Thesis presentation to the Australian and New Zealand Academy of Management (ANZAM) Doctoral Workshop, Australian Graduate School of Management (AGSM), University of New South Wales, Sydney, Australia.

Shearer, C. 2015, Doctoral Assessment Stage III presentation to University of Technology Sydney (UTS), Assessment Panel, UTS, Sydney Australia.

Dedication

This thesis is dedicated to

Ladislav, Marie Madeleine, Colin, Zeita and Marcus.

Acknowledgements

I acknowledge my sincere appreciation and gratitude to my principal supervisor Professor Stewart Clegg, for his guidance, advice and mentoring during my candidature, which allowed me to learn the craft of research from a sage. Professor Clegg's approach was exemplary. I also acknowledge my sincere appreciation and gratitude to co-supervisor Associate Professor Judy Johnston, who graciously provided me with co-supervision, which complemented that of my primary supervisor. Associate Professor Judy Johnston was patient, dedicated, persistent, and meticulous in her ability to challenge me to achieve the highest standards during my doctoral candidature.

Professor Paul du Gay of Copenhagen Business School, Professor John Wanna of Australian National University, Professor Hugh Willmott of Cardiff Business School and Professor Barbara Czarniawska of University of Gothenburg are acknowledged for providing me with their views on various concepts and materials relevant to my research.

I acknowledge the participants of my research, the current and former Departmental Secretaries of the Australian Public Service. These participants took large amounts of time out of their extraordinarily busy working schedules to contribute generously, richly and openly to the research. They were willing and gracious in their contribution for which I am grateful and without which this research would not have been possible.

I also valued the opportunity to engage in discussion and debate with other doctoral candidates and colleagues during the various writing classes offered at UTS conducted by Professor Jenny Edwards. Professor Jenny Edwards also gave generously of her time to read, edit and comment on several drafts of my thesis that was of great value to me. Associate Professor Deborah Edwards made herself available to discuss and debate several aspects of my thesis and organised numerous mini conferences, doctoral workshops, and doctoral assessment panels which allowed me to connect with and exchange ideas with other doctoral candidates.

There has also been many other professional and administrative staff at UTS who have assisted me in my research such as the very willing and capable librarians and information management specialists at UTS and other universities who showed

professionalism and patience in our various interactions. People such as Elizabeth Ng and her team at the University Graduate School were most supportive and diligent on all manner of administrative matters.

I also acknowledge the services of Editor Tina Thornton who provided professional copyediting and proofreading services as covered in Parts D and E of the Australian *Standards for Editing Practice* giving the thesis a polished finish.

Most importantly I would like to acknowledge my beloved husband and soul mate Marcus Damian Shearer who so willingly stood by me and provided me with his unconditional support during my PhD journey for which I am very appreciative and forever grateful. His wisdom, warmth, encouragement, and recognition of my work allowed me to complete this endeavour well.

Most importantly I acknowledge the blessings and grace bestowed on me by God, with which this accomplishment was made possible.

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Certification..... | ii |
| List of Research Publications | iii |
| Dedication | v |
| Acknowledgements | vi |
| Table of Contents | viii |
| List of Tables..... | xii |
| List of Figures | xiii |
| Abstract | xiv |
| List of Abbreviations..... | xv |
| Chapter 1 Introduction..... | 1 |
| 1.1. Context and Background..... | 1 |
| 1.2. Research Rationale..... | 7 |
| 1.3. Theoretical Framework..... | 7 |
| 1.4. Research Questions..... | 9 |
| 1.5. Research Methodology | 10 |
| 1.6. Research Contribution | 11 |
| 1.7. Outline of Thesis..... | 12 |
| Chapter 2 Literature Review..... | 13 |
| 2.1. Introduction..... | 13 |
| 2.2. Economic Rationalism: The Seeds of Public Sector Reform Across Anglo-American Polities | 15 |
| 2.3. Public Sector Reforms Across Anglo-American Polities (Excluding Australia)..... | 21 |
| 2.3.1. United Kingdom (UK)..... | 21 |
| 2.3.2. The United States of America (USA)..... | 28 |
| 2.3.3. Canada | 34 |
| 2.3.4. New Zealand (NZ)..... | 40 |
| 2.3.5. The Constitution of Public Sector Management Work Across Anglo- American Polities (Excluding Australia)..... | 47 |
| 2.4. Public Sector Reforms in Australia..... | 57 |
| 2.4.1. Policies, Processes and Practices of Public Sector Reform..... | 57 |
| 2.4.2. Outcomes of Public Sector Reform | 65 |
| 2.4.3. Implications for the Constitution of Public Sector Management Work ... | 68 |
| Chapter 3 Methodology | 74 |
| 3.1. Introduction..... | 74 |
| 3.2. Research Strategy..... | 74 |
| 3.3. Research Paradigm Justification | 78 |
| 3.4. Research Questions..... | 90 |
| 3.5. Research Design Framework | 90 |
| 3.6. Data Collection Methods | 91 |
| 3.6.1. Unit of Analysis..... | 91 |
| 3.6.2. Selecting Participants | 92 |
| 3.6.3. Gaining Access and Rapport Building | 93 |
| 3.6.4. Purposeful Sampling..... | 94 |
| 3.7. Data Collection | 95 |
| 3.7.1. Semi-Structured Interviews | 95 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| 3.7.2. Document Analysis..... | 96 |
| 3.8. Data Analysis..... | 97 |
| 3.8.1. Coding..... | 99 |
| 3.9. Limitations, Risks and Evaluation..... | 100 |
| 3.9.1. Risks and Limitations..... | 100 |
| 3.10. Evaluating the Quality of the Research..... | 103 |
| 3.11. Trustworthiness Criteria..... | 104 |
| 3.12. Ethical Considerations..... | 107 |
| 3.13. Summary..... | 109 |
| Chapter 4 Departmental Secretaries: The Public Actors who Constitute Public Sector Management Work..... | 110 |
| 4.1. Introduction..... | 110 |
| 4.2. Departmental Secretary Backgrounds – Demographics..... | 111 |
| 4.3. Recruitment of Departmental Secretaries – Public Service Archetypes.... | 114 |
| 4.4. Appointment by Ministers..... | 116 |
| 4.5. Technical-Professional Knowledge – Professionalisation..... | 122 |
| 4.5.1. Technical Expertise and Professional Knowledge..... | 122 |
| 4.5.2. Experience Gained From Practice – Learning on the Job..... | 124 |
| 4.6. Departmental Secretaries and Cultural Tribalism..... | 126 |
| 4.7. Public Service Ethos – Ethics..... | 130 |
| 4.8. Discussion and Conclusion..... | 137 |
| 4.8.1. Discussion..... | 138 |
| 4.8.2. Conclusion..... | 144 |
| Chapter 5 The Environments in Which Departmental Secretaries Constitute Public Sector Management Work..... | 146 |
| 5.1. Introduction..... | 146 |
| 5.2. The Political Environment..... | 148 |
| 5.3. The Constitutional, Legislative and Regulatory Environment (Acts of Parliament, Regulations and Administrative Arrangements Orders)– Legislation..... | 167 |
| 5.4. The Financial Environment–Appropriated Funds and Allocated Budgets– Cost Management..... | 174 |
| 5.5. The Modern Media and ‘Social Media’ Environment–Complexities and Vicissitudes..... | 182 |
| 5.6. Discussion and Conclusion..... | 189 |
| 5.6.1. Discussion..... | 189 |
| 5.6.2. Conclusion..... | 200 |
| Chapter 6 Roles and Responsibilities – Boundary Riding a Duality of Activities on a Spectrum..... | 202 |
| 6.1. Introduction..... | 202 |
| 6.2. Rational-Instrumental Activities..... | 205 |
| 6.2.1. Transformational or Transactional Leadership..... | 205 |
| 6.2.2. Assurance via Governance..... | 211 |
| 6.2.3. Subordination of Administration..... | 214 |
| 6.3. Political-Interpretive Activities..... | 217 |
| 6.3.1. Trojan Horse of Stewardship..... | 217 |
| 6.3.2. Stakeholder Management – Concurrence or Conflict..... | 222 |
| 6.3.3. Contestability of Policy..... | 228 |
| 6.4. Substantive Constitution Within the Spectrum..... | 234 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| 6.5. Discussion and Conclusion | 235 |
| 6.5.1. Discussion | 235 |
| 6.5.2. Conclusion | 241 |
| Chapter 7 The Impact of Contemporary Management Ideas: Their Influence on the Constitution of Public Sector Management Work ... | 243 |
| 7.1. Introduction | 243 |
| 7.2. Disposition to Contemporary Management Ideas | 244 |
| 7.2.1. Fads and Fashions | 245 |
| 7.2.2. Exposure to Local and Globalising Webs | 247 |
| 7.3. Legitimacy and Acceptance of Contemporary Management Ideas | 252 |
| 7.3.1. Role of Government and the Four Central Agencies | 252 |
| 7.3.2. Role of the Public Sector Workforce | 256 |
| 7.4. Adoption of Contemporary Management Ideas | 257 |
| 7.4.1. Tailoring, Translation and Transformation | 257 |
| 7.4.2. Equilibrium and Incremental Change | 263 |
| 7.5. Discussion and Conclusion | 266 |
| 7.5.1. Discussion | 266 |
| 7.5.2. Conclusion | 273 |
| Chapter 8 Conclusion, Conceptual Model, and Contributions..... | 275 |
| 8.1. Summary | 275 |
| 8.2. Conceptual Model of the Constitution of Public Sector Management Work | 277 |
| 8.2.1. Primary Factors | 280 |
| 8.2.2. Influencing Factors and Mediating Processes | 284 |
| 8.2.3. Impacts | 286 |
| 8.2.4. Competing Logics | 286 |
| 8.3. Contributions to Theory and Practice | 287 |
| 8.3.1. Contribution to Public Administration Theory | 287 |
| 8.3.2. Contribution to New Institutional Theory | 288 |
| 8.3.3. Implications for Practice – Reform | 289 |
| 8.3.4. Implications for Practice – Contemporary Management Ideas | 290 |
| 8.4. Recommendations for Future Research | 291 |
| References | 294 |
| Appendices | 344 |
| Appendix A : Literature Review Travel, Translation and Transformation of Ideas | 345 |
| A.1 Introduction | 345 |
| A.2 Role of Imitation/Copying and Diffusion of Contemporary Management Ideas | 345 |
| A.3 The Translation and Transformation of Contemporary Management Ideas as they Travel | 351 |
| A.4 Implications of Translation for the Constitution of Public Sector Management Work | 356 |
| Appendix B: Documents Analysed | 359 |
| Appendix C: Extended Literature Review: Influences, Objectives and Outcomes of Public Sector Reform in Anglo-American Polities (Excluding Australia) | 360 |
| C.1 United Kingdom | 360 |
| C.2 United States of America | 369 |

| | | |
|-------------|--|-----|
| C.3 | Canada..... | 383 |
| C.4 | New Zealand | 396 |
| C.5 | Summary of Components that Comprise the Constitution of Public Sector Management in Australia..... | 405 |
| Appendix D: | Departmental Secretaries’ Demographic Details..... | 408 |
| Appendix E: | Departmental Secretaries’ Public Service Career Details..... | 410 |
| Appendix F: | Empirical Findings from a Public Actor Perspective..... | 412 |
| Appendix G: | Summary of the Impact of the Environments and Their Elements on the Constitution of Public Sector Management | 414 |
| Appendix H: | Empirical Findings from the Public Sector Environment Perspective | 417 |
| Appendix I: | Government Leadership Forums..... | 419 |
| Appendix J: | Departmental Secretary Stakeholders | 420 |
| Appendix K: | Empirical Findings from a Roles and Responsibilities Perspective..... | 421 |
| Appendix L: | Empirical Findings from a Contemporary Management Ideas Perspective | 423 |

List of Tables

| | |
|---|-----|
| Table 1.1 The Essence of New Public Management as Proposed by Pollitt | 4 |
| Table 2.1 The Constitution of Public Sector Management Work Across the Anglo-American Polities (excluding Australia) Post Reforms: Common and Uncommon Elements. | 51 |
| Table 3.1 Characteristics of Qualitative Research | 76 |
| Table 3.2 Philosophical Assumptions with Implications for Practice | 79 |
| Table 3.3 The Methodology of Constructivist Inquiry | 88 |
| Table 5.1 Overview of the Impact of the Environments and their Elements on the Constitution of Public Sector Management Work..... | 147 |
| Table C1. United Kingdom: Influences of Public Sector Reform | 362 |
| Table C2. United Kingdom: Objectives of Public Sector Reform..... | 364 |
| Table C3. United Kingdom: Outcomes of Public Sector Reform..... | 368 |
| Table C4. USA: Influences of Public Sector Reform | 375 |
| Table C5. USA: Objectives of Public Sector Reform..... | 377 |
| Table C6. USA: Outcomes of Public Sector Reform..... | 382 |
| Table C7. Canada: Influences of Public Sector Reform | 385 |
| Table C8. Canada: Objectives of Public Sector Reform..... | 389 |
| Table C9. Canada: Outcomes of Public Sector Reform..... | 395 |
| Table C10. New Zealand: Influences of Public Sector Reform..... | 398 |
| Table C11. New Zealand: Objectives of Public Sector Reform | 400 |
| Table C12. New Zealand: Outcomes of Public Sector Reform | 404 |
| Table C13. Constitution of Public Sector Management Work in Australia Post Reforms | 406 |
| Table D1. Current Departmental Secretaries' Demographic Details..... | 408 |
| Table D2. Former Departmental Secretaries' Demographic Details | 409 |
| Table E1. Current Departmental Secretaries' Public Service Career Details | 410 |
| Table E2. Former Departmental Secretaries' Public Service Career Details..... | 411 |
| Table F1. Empirical Findings From a Public Actor Perspective | 412 |
| Table G1. Summary of the Impact of the Environments and their Elements on the Constitution of Public Sector Management Work..... | 414 |
| Table H1. Empirical Findings from the Public Sector Environment Perspective.. | 417 |
| Table J1. Departmental Secretary Stakeholders..... | 420 |
| Table K1. Empirical Findings from a Roles and Responsibilities Perspective..... | 421 |
| Table L1. Empirical Findings from a Contemporary Management Ideas Perspective | 423 |

List of Figures

| | |
|---|-----|
| Figure 3.1 The Data Analysis Spiral | 98 |
| Figure 5.1 Model Depicting Dilemma of the Urgent Over the Important | 186 |
| Figure 6.1 Execution of Departmental Secretaries' Roles and Responsibilities Across a Spectrum | 203 |
| Figure 8.1 Conceptual Model of the Constitution of Public Sector Management Work | 278 |
| Figure A1. Ideal Types, Arrayed by Degree of Resonance, and Latitude for, Translation of "new" Managerial Practices..... | 350 |

Abstract

Public sector management work contributes directly to political systems of western democracy. This contribution has far-reaching consequences for the public sector, other sectors and citizens. From the 1980s public sectors have experienced significant reforms by successive governments across Anglo-American polities. Such reforms and the contemporary management ideas on which they were based, including new managerialism and ‘new public management’ (NPM) travelled, were translated and transformed, some accepted and others rejected. These reforms have changed the public sector, but how these reforms have influenced and changed the constitution of public sector management work is less clear. This research sought to understand ‘*how do current and former Departmental Secretaries in the Australian Public Service (APS) constitute public sector management work, in the context of evolving reforms?*’ using a qualitative case study. What it finds is that Departmental Secretaries constitute public sector management work to suit the institutionalised, governmental, bureaucratic and political domain of the public sector, in which they work, rather than the market-oriented managerialism or new public management advocated by reformers. This research makes an original contribution to public administration theory and also to a lesser extent to new institutional theory as it pertains to the travel of ideas.

List of Abbreviations

| | |
|--------|--|
| AAOs | Administrative Arrangements Orders |
| AHRI | Australian Human Resources Institute |
| AICD | Australian Institute of Company Directors |
| AIM | Australian Institute of Management |
| APS | Australian Public Service |
| APSC | Australian Public Service Commission |
| CAC | Commonwealth Authorities Corporations of Australia Act |
| CCT | Compulsory Competitive Tendering |
| COAG | Council of Australian Governments |
| DS | Departmental Secretary |
| EQ | Emotional Intelligence |
| FMA | Financial Management Act (1997) |
| FMIP | Financial Management Improvement Program |
| FOI | Freedom of Information |
| G20 | Group of 20 |
| GATT | General Agreement on Trade and Tariffs |
| GDP | Gross Domestic Product |
| HRM | Human Resources Management |
| IMF | International Monetary Fund |
| INSEAD | Institut Européen des Affaires d'Administration |
| IPAA | Institute of Public Administration Australia |
| ISO | International Organisation for Standardisation |
| ITC | Information and Communication Technology |
| JCPAA | Joint Committee of Public Accounts and Audits |
| KPI | Key Performance Indicator |
| KRA | Key Results Area |
| MAC | Management Advisory Committee |
| MBO | Management by Objectives |
| MTM | Market-type Mechanism |
| NPM | New Public Management |

| | |
|-------|--|
| NPR | National Performance Review |
| OECD | Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development |
| PART | Program Assessment Rating Tool |
| PGPA | Public Governance, Performance and Accountability Act (2013) |
| PM | Prime Minister |
| PM&C | Prime Minister and Cabinet |
| PMB | Program Management and Budget |
| PMS | Performance Management System |
| PPBS | Planning Programming and Budgeting System |
| PRP | Performance Related Pay |
| PS | Public Sector Management |
| PSA | Public Service Act 1999 (amended 2013) |
| PSR | Public Sector Reform |
| SES | Senior Executive Service |
| SRA | Strategic Results Area |
| TBS | Treasury Board Secretariat |
| TQM | Total Quality Management |
| W.O.G | Whole of Government |
| WB | World Bank |