

Moving Towards Inclusion:
Servant Leadership and the
Aged Care Resident

Barb Vindin Illingworth

Master of Professional Ethics, University of New South Wales
Bachelor of Arts (Psychology), Macquarie University

Doctor of Philosophy

2015

UNIVERSITY OF TECHNOLOGY, SYDNEY

CERTIFICATE OF ORIGINAL AUTHORSHIP

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Production Note:

Signature removed prior to publication.

Barb Vindin Illingworth

Date: 10.2.16

ABSTRACT

While it is accepted that the style of leadership in organisations has a profound effect on the welfare, satisfaction and productivity of staff, to date there has been little mention of the effect of leadership on the client stakeholder.

This work involves a large provider organisation in the not-for-profit Faith-based aged and community care sector, and the impact of Servant Leadership on the experience of residents in that organisation's care.

The leadership literature provided little evidence about leadership from the client stakeholders' or consumers' perspective.

I explored the origin and development of FaithCare, its adoption of a particular leadership model and how that leadership model is transmitted to the residents.

My philosophical stance was one of pragmatism because of its applicability to the real world and its outcome orientation. Pragmatism aims to create desirable communities. This is both the stated and implicit aim of FaithCare and it would be expected to be that of organisations generally.

The methodology adopted for this research rested on my pragmatic approach and involved mixed methods research, incorporating grounded theory into some of its elements. It is said that pragmatism has a philosophical foothold in the mixed methods research domain. Using mixed methods research enabled both qualitative and quantitative assumptions to be drawn, different world views to be taken into account and different forms of data collection and analysis to be used.

Residents' interviews exposed a lack of participation in areas they considered important to them, despite the feedback systems FaithCare has put in place to record residents' comments and complaints.

This thesis established that organisational culture is the way in which leadership is transmitted via the staff to residents in this organisation.

Analysis of the data collected revealed that although the leadership model adopted by FaithCare is ideal for staff, the contribution of today's residents in this not-for-profit Faith-based organisation is compromised by the model. Further, it was found that the residents of the future, the baby boomers, will expect a degree of empowerment that FaithCare seems not to be aware it should provide.

The outcome of this work is twofold:

- to add to the existing body of leadership research by placing the 'third-party stakeholder' within Russell and Morse's (2002) Servant Leadership Model; and
- to develop the idea of 'Successful Presence', in which residents are potentially able to achieve a feeling of quiet satisfaction and peace within their community.

Publications

Sankaran, S., Dick, B., Shaw, K., Cartwright, C., Davies, A., Kelly, J. & Vindin, B. 2014, 'Application of Scenario-based Approaches in Leadership Research: An Action Research Intervention as Three Sets of Interlinked Practices', *Systemic Practice and Action Research*, 27:551-573.

Sankaran, S., Illingworth, B., Shaw, K., Dick, B., Davies, A., Cartwright, C. & Yamak, S. 2013, 'Using Delphi as a Democratic Research Method Facilitating Involvement to Investigate Leadership Capability Development in Australia', 13th EURAM Conference, 26-29 June, Istanbul.

Cartwright, C., Shaw, K., Banbury, A., Sankaran, S., Craig, J., Soar, J., Kelly, J., Morgan, A., Sibley, A., Dick, B., Davies, A., Vindin, B. & Ryan, N. 2013, 'An Innovative Model of Leadership Development for the Not-For-Profit Aged and Community Care Sector, Report to the Australian Research Council, Lutheran Community Care and Baptist Community Services.

Sankaran, S., Dick, B., Shaw, K., Cartwright, C., Davies, A., Illingworth, B., Volberda, H. 2012, 'Scenario planning and analysis in practice: Investigating leadership development using action research in faith-based not-for-profit organisations in Australia', 12th EURAM Conference, 6-8 June, Rotterdam.

Vindin-Illingworth, B., Sankaran, S., Keogh, J. & Shaw, K. 2011, 'Relational leadership development in a Faith-based non-profit organization: A case study', International Faith and Spirit at Work Conference, 7-9 November, University of Arkansas.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many thanks to:

My supervisors Professor Shankar Sankaran and Dr Kelly Shaw whose help, advice and encouragement were crucial throughout my doctoral journey, and who welcomed me into their family homes.

My husband Roger for his unfailing quiet encouragement. My mother, who has always supported me in everything and would be proud of me now had dementia not stolen her understanding and enthusiasm. My children and grandchildren who have waited patiently for me to finish.

My UTS librarian David Litting and the staff on my floor at UTS, Research Manager Ann Hobson and Executive Assistant Robyn Vear.

My work colleagues Allen Sibley, who enabled me to continue working while studying, and Dr Maree Duddle, who redirected my efforts at a crucial moment.

My 'ARC Leadership Research' friends Professor Colleen Cartwright, Emeritus Professor Alan Davies, Dr Bob Dick and Jocelyn Craig who were a source of great inspiration and kindness.

The three external examiners whose comments and constructive criticism helped me strengthen my thesis.

Hazel Baker who provided some editing in accordance with the UTS guidelines.

My friends Moira Sharp and Jean Russell who helped me with formatting.

The residents, managers, staff and baby boomers who enthusiastically and generously shared their experiences and opinions with me.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1 APPROACHING THE RESEARCH	1
The structure of the thesis	4
CHAPTER 2 ABOUT AGED CARE	6
Government funding	7
The residents	8
The workforce	9
The organisation	10
The value statements of the organisation.....	10
CHAPTER 3 ABOUT LEADERSHIP	12
Historical and cultural perspective	13
Review of leadership theories	15
Trait theories – the qualities of leaders	17
Power and influence theories – power and leaders.....	18
Behavioural theories.....	18
Situational leadership and contingency theories.....	18
Transactional leadership.....	19
Transformational leadership	19
Limitations of leadership in the not-for-profit sector	20
Servant and relational leadership	20
CHAPTER 4 ABOUT ORGANISATIONAL CULTURE.....	26
Leadership and organisational culture	26
Organisational culture	26
Definitions	27
Manifestations of organisational culture.....	28
CHAPTER 5 APPROACHING THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS.....	32
Philosophy and methodology	32
Pragmatism	32
Mixed methods research	34
Justification for using mixed methods.....	35
Pragmatism and mixed methods research.....	38
Researcher’s prior relationship with participants	39
Participants	41
Research design	41
The main focus	41
Mixed method design.....	41
<i>The priority decision</i>	43
First stage: QUAN.....	43

Second stage: QUAL	44
Third stage: QUAN + quan + qual	45
Sampling – criteria and selection.....	45
Aged care homes.....	47
Data collection	47
Sources of data – extant data.....	47
Sources of data – primary qualitative data	48
Sources of data – new quantitative data	48
Methods of collection.....	49
Interviews – residents and baby boomers	49
Focus group.....	49
Observation	49
Questionnaire	50
Data analysis	51
Grounded theory	51
Qualitative data analysis	51
Coding.....	52
Quantitative data analysis.....	53
<i>Research rigour.....</i>	<i>53</i>
Ethical considerations.....	54
Overcoming ethical obstacles.....	55
The three main ethical issues.....	55
<i>Respect.....</i>	<i>55</i>
<i>Privacy of information</i>	<i>56</i>
<i>Research involving people in dependent or unequal relationships.....</i>	<i>56</i>
Other ethical issues.....	57
<i>Informed consent</i>	<i>57</i>
<i>Anonymity.....</i>	<i>57</i>
<i>Confidentiality</i>	<i>58</i>
<i>Voluntary participation</i>	<i>58</i>
<i>Recording of interviews.....</i>	<i>58</i>
<i>Storage of data.....</i>	<i>58</i>
<i>Special care taken by this researcher</i>	<i>58</i>
<i>Avoiding prejudice</i>	<i>59</i>
The research problem.....	59
CHAPTER 6 THE LEADERSHIP MODEL AND CULTURE	61
The organisation’s leadership model.....	63
The managers.....	64
Interview technique	66
Results – LDP Manager interviews.....	67
The staff.....	71
Organizational Culture Assessment Instrument (OCAI).....	71

<i>OCAI Questionnaire method</i>	72
<i>Reliability of the OCAI</i>	73
<i>Validity of the OCAI</i>	73
<i>The Competing Values Framework</i>	74
Description of the four culture types	75
<i>The dominant culture</i>	79
<i>Discrepancy between present and preferred culture</i>	79
<i>Cultural Congruence</i>	80
OCAI – staff	81
<i>Comparison of age groups</i>	83
<i>Findings</i>	85
Staff Surveys.....	87
Areas that reflect leadership and culture	88
Staff survey results.....	88
Focus Group.....	92
<i>Communication</i>	94
<i>Nurturing</i>	97
<i>Respect</i>	97
<i>End of life</i>	98
<i>Activities</i>	99
<i>Vision and Values</i>	99
<i>Environment</i>	99
<i>Biblical reference</i>	99
<i>Leadership</i>	99
<i>Continuous improvement</i>	99
CHAPTER 7 THE RESIDENTS' VIEW	101
The IBM CEO Surveys	103
Aged and Consumer Care Leadership Survey	104
Revisiting the OCAI	108
Resident Interviews	108
Activities	114
Staff.....	115
Food.....	116
Environment	117
Quality of care	119
Emotions.....	119
Communication	120
Other themes.....	122
<i>Organisational culture</i>	122
<i>Independence</i>	123
<i>Change from the past</i>	124
<i>Leadership</i>	124

<i>Feeling at home</i>	125
<i>Change into the future</i>	126
<i>Power</i>	126
<i>Self-denial – thinking of others</i>	127
Client Survey (CS)	127
Findings from the Client Surveys.....	129
Comments and Complaints Forms	131
Findings from Comments and Complaints Forms	133
Minutes of residents’ meetings	141
Observation of residents’ meetings	143
Findings from observation of residents’ meetings	145
<i>Alignment between the meetings and the minutes</i>	146
<i>The opportunity to have a voice</i>	146
<i>Follow-through from one meeting to the next</i>	147
<i>Food</i>	147
<i>Environment</i>	147
<i>Communication</i>	148
<i>Activities</i>	148
<i>Staffing</i>	148
CHAPTER 8 THE BABY BOOMERS’ VIEW	149
Selecting Baby Boomers	151
Baby boomer interviews – knowledgeable	152
<i>Activities</i>	154
<i>Power</i>	155
<i>Facilities provided</i>	156
<i>Care</i>	157
<i>Food</i>	158
<i>Comparison of NFP-FP-Government</i>	159
<i>Involvement in running the aged care home</i>	160
<i>Future of aged care</i>	160
<i>Staff</i>	161
<i>Space</i>	162
<i>Religion</i>	162
<i>Pets</i>	162
<i>Choice</i>	163
<i>Couples/de facto/same-sex</i>	163
Baby boomer interviews – naïve	164
<i>Activities</i>	165
<i>Power</i>	167
<i>Comparison of NFP-FP-Government</i>	169
<i>Food</i>	171
<i>Facilities</i>	172

<i>Future of aged care</i>	174
<i>Religion</i>	175
<i>Involvement in running the aged care home</i>	175
<i>Staff</i>	176
<i>Space</i>	177
<i>Couples/de facto/same-sex</i>	177
<i>Care</i>	178
<i>Pets</i>	179
<i>Choice</i>	179
CHAPTER 9 ABOUT SUCCESSFUL PRESENCE	181
The research problem and research questions	181
The research problem	181
The research questions	182
Servant Leadership	185
Successful Presence	191
CHAPTER 10 THE CONCLUSION	194
Restatement of the research problem	194
Restatement of the research questions	196
The impact of Servant Leadership on residents	197
Key contributions from the research based on the evidence	199
Implications for practice	201
Implications for policy	201
Implications for methodology	201
Limitations	201
Areas for further research	202
BIBLIOGRAPHY	204
APPENDICES	213

LIST OF TABLES

Table 6.1 Visual depiction of data sets	62
Table 6.2 The leadership model and the culture	64
Table 6.3 Demographic details of LDP Managers	66
Table 6.4 Shifting the emphasis towards a Christian culture	68
Table 6.5 The success of the LDP	68
Table 6.6 Identifying leadership style	69
Table 6.7 Secondary themes	70
Table 6.8 Staff OCAI participants	72
Table 6.9 Clan culture.....	75
Table 6.10 Adhocracy culture	75
Table 6.11 Market culture.....	76
Table 6.12 Hierarchy culture	76
Table 6.13 Data for total scores	78
Table 6.14 Changes under culture headings.....	81
Table 6.15 Comparison of older and younger groups	84
Table 6.16 Group statistics for older and younger age groups.....	85
Table 6.17 Excerpt from Staff Survey Summary, February 2010.....	89
Table 6.18 Excerpt from Staff Survey Summary, February 2010.....	89
Table 6.19 Questions from the staff survey and OCAI.....	90
Table 6.20 Focus group participants	92
Table 6.21 Question and answers from leadership survey.....	94
Table 6.22 Focus group categories and representative data.....	96
Table 7.1 Research questions and data sources	102
Table 7.2 Stakeholders' decision-making now.....	105
Table 7.3 Management decision-making.....	106
Table 7.4 Decision-making around the mission	107
Table 7.5 Data relating to residents.....	108
Table 7.6 The three aged care homes used in this research	110
Table 7.7 Code numbers and demographics of residents	111
Table 7.8 Themes – Residents.....	113
Table 7.9 Activities	114
Table 7.10 Staff.....	115
Table 7.11 Food	116
Table 7.12 Environment	118
Table 7.13 Quality of care	119
Table 7.14 Emotions.....	120

Table 7.15 Communication	120
Table 7.16 Organisational culture	122
Table 7.17 Independence	123
Table 7.18 Change from the past	124
Table 7.19 Leadership	124
Table 7.20 Feeling at home	125
Table 7.21 Change into the future	126
Table 7.22 Power	126
Table 7.23 Self-denial	127
Table 7.24 Percentage of residents who agreed with statements	129
Table 7.25 CS – actions taken	131
Table 7.26 Residents’ complaints and suggestions at <i>Greentrees</i>	133
Table 7.27 Typical complaints from the CCFs	134
Table 7.28 Number of residents’ complaints in five year groupings	135
Table 7.29 CCF – actions undertaken	137
Table 7.30 Comparison of data relating to top five issues	139
Table 8.1 Code numbers and demographics of BKs	153
Table 8.2 Themes – knowledgeable baby boomers	154
Table 8.3 Activities	154
Table 8.4 Power	155
Table 8.5 Facilities	156
Table 8.6 Care	157
Table 8.7 Food	158
Table 8.8 Comparison of NFP-FP-Government	159
Table 8.9 Involvement in running the aged care home	160
Table 8.10 Future of aged care	160
Table 8.11 Staff	161
Table 8.12 Space	162
Table 8.13 Religion	162
Table 8.14 Pets	163
Table 8.15 Choice	163
Table 8.16 Couples/de facto/same-sex	163
Table 8.17 Code numbers and demographics of BNs	165
Table 8.18 Themes – naïve baby boomers	165
Table 8.19 Activities	165
Table 8.20 Power	168
Table 8.21 Comparison of NFP-FP-Government	170
Table 8.22 Food	171
Table 8.23 Facilities	172
Table 8.24 Future of aged care	174
Table 8.25 Religion	175

Table 8.26 Involvement in running the aged care home	175
Table 8.27 Staff.....	176
Table 8.28 Space.....	177
Table 8.29 Couples/de facto/same-sex.....	177
Table 8.30 Care.....	178
Table 8.31 Pets	179
Table 8.32 Choice	180
Table 9.1 Summary of main research findings.....	183
Table 9.2 Comparison of data relating to top five issues	192
Table 10.1 Summary of research contributions.....	200

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1 Integrated Leadership Model.....	16
Figure 3.2 Servant Leadership Model	24
Figure 5.1 Mixed method design matrix and research designs	41
Figure 5.2 Concurrent Nested Design	42
Figure 6.1 Competing values quadrants and their culture	74
Figure 6.2 Comparison of Now and Preferred cultural archetypes	78
Figure 6.3 Comparison of older and younger age group scores	84
Figure 6.4 Focus group discussion areas.....	94
Figure 9.1 Servant Leadership Model	187
Figure 9.2 Servant Leadership Model incorporating the resident.....	188