

**The development of a clinical reflective practice model
for paediatric nursing specialist students in Indonesia
using an action research approach**

DESSIE WANDA

Submitted for the examination for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Faculty of Health, University of Technology Sydney

2015

CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP/ORIGINALITY

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Student

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Undertaking this PhD study was like riding a rollercoaster, sometimes I was up in the air, but other times I was at the bottom of the rail. At the end, a happy feeling fulfilled my heart when I was finally able to finish my PhD study, just like when the rollercoaster stop.

I am sincerely grateful to my supervisors, Professor Valerie Wilson and Professor Cathrine Fowler for their persistent and unending support during my endeavour as a PhD student. I learned many things from both of you, not only about the content of the thesis, but also how to be a great supervisor for the students. I could not say anything except a sincere thank you for accepting me as your student three years ago.

I would also like to thank my participants, the clinical educators and student nurses, who involved in this study. I believe that all of you may not aware that I learned many things from you in this study; many times I reflected myself as a clinical educator in our interactions. I really hope that this study enrich yourself as a practitioner.

This PhD study could not be conducted without financial supports from Directorate General of Higher Education-Ministry of Education and Culture (DGHE Postgraduate Scholarship) for the first three years of the study. University of Technology Sydney also gave me opportunity to have UTS President's scholarship for the last 6 months of my study, as well as financial support for attending a conference from Vice Chancellor Conference Award and HSP Research Student Development Award.

Throughout my endeavour in Sydney, I received wonderful support from my lovely friends: Sarah T, mb Linna, Penny, Ying, Hiba, Vijay, Ponndara, Annette, Melanie, Jeffrey, and Sarah W. Thank you for every moment that all of you shared with me during my stay in Sydney. You gave me strength to be able to come everyday to our

room, CB10.07.300. Administrative support from Priya and Belinda also made a smooth endeavour within this three years-three months time here.

I believe the source of the strength also from my parents who always pray for me, at least five times a day after they finished *sholat*. Predominantly, prayers from my lovely children: Nabil, Syabil, Hanin, Hana who always pray I could go home 'ASAP'. I felt like 'down in the dumps' every time I left you. Lastly, I dedicated this thesis to my great husband, who never gave up on me and because of that I was confident to take and complete this PhD study. Al-Hamdu Lillah..

Table of Content

CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP/ORIGINALITY	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	iii
Table of Content	v
List of Figures	ix
List of Tables	xi
Abstract.....	xii
Abstrak (Bahasa Indonesia)	xiv
1 Introduction and Background	1
1.1 Indonesia: Its Geographical and Culture Description.....	1
1.2 Nursing Education Development in Indonesia	3
1.3 An Overview of Reflective Practice as the Study Background	8
1.4 The Influence of Culture in Reflective Practice	13
1.5 Significance of the Study	24
1.6 Aim of the Study.....	25
1.7 Overview of the Thesis.....	25
2 Literature Review	28
2.1 Introduction	28
2.2 A Learning Process through Reflective Practice	31
2.3 Methods to Facilitate Reflection	40
2.4 Clinical Educators' Roles in Reflective Practice	44
2.5 Summary	46
3 Research Design and Methodology	48

3.1	Introduction	48
3.2	Action Research as an Approach	48
3.3	Study Design	56
3.4	Data Collection Procedures	61
3.5	Translation.....	69
3.6	Data Analysis	71
3.7	Rigour	75
3.8	Ethical Considerations.....	79
3.9	Summary	83
4	Action Research Cycles	85
4.1	Introduction	85
4.2	First AR Cycle (July-December 2013).....	85
4.3	Second AR Cycle (February-June 2014).....	98
4.4	Summary	103
5	Findings from First AR Cycle.....	105
5.1	Introduction	105
5.2	Clinical Educators.....	105
5.3	Student Nurses	123
5.4	Summary	145
6	Findings from Second AR Cycle.....	147
6.1	Introduction	147
6.2	Clinical Educators.....	147
6.3	Student Nurses	163
6.4	Findings from the Evaluation Session.....	177

6.5	Summary	197
7	Interconnectedness of Data	199
7.1	Introduction	199
7.2	Learning to walk	199
7.3	Finding your feet	203
7.4	Taking a stand	207
7.5	Summary	209
8	Discussion	211
8.1	Introduction	211
8.2	The Richness of Students' Learning through Culture Changing	211
8.3	Clinical Educators' Role Changes	222
8.4	Engagement and Active Participation	225
8.5	Strengths and Limitations of the Study	230
9	An Insider Researcher's Reflection	233
9.1	Introduction	233
9.2	The Learning Process of a Novice Action Researcher	234
9.3	The Experiences of an Insider Researcher	237
9.4	Engagement with the Clinical Educators	239
9.5	Relationship with Student Nurses	243
	Appendices.....	252
	Appendix A. Permission letter from Nurse Education Today	252
	Appendix B. Ethical approval letter from HREC FoN UI	254
	Appendix C. Ethical approval letter from HREC UTS	255

Appendix D. Information sheet and consent form for clinical educators in English	256
Appendix E. Information sheet and consent form for clinical educators in Bahasa Indonesia	258
Appendix F. Information sheet and consent form for student nurses in English	260
Appendix G. Information sheet and consent form for student nurses in Bahasa Indonesia	262
Appendix H. Questionnaires for the clinical educators	263
Appendix I. Questionnaires for the student nurses	264
Appendix J. Focus-group discussion guidelines.	265
Appendix K. Examples of Research News Update	267
Appendix L. Examples of a student’s reflective report in the 1st AR cycle	269
Appendix M. Examples of a student’s reflective report in the 2nd AR cycle	271
References.....	273

List of Figures

Figure 1. A map of Indonesia	2
Figure 2. Nursing education pathway in Indonesia.....	6
Figure 3. Search strategy result	29
Figure 4. Kemmis and McTaggart's moments of action research	57
Figure 5. Burnard's analysis procedure	74
Figure 6. The structured reflection	89
Figure 7. The Clinical Reflective Practice Model	90
Figure 8. The 5Ds structured reflection	98
Figure 9. The Revised Clinical Reflective Practice model	100
Figure 10. Clinical educators' themes and sub-themes in the first AR	106
Figure 11. Theme 1: Varied strategies used and its sub-themes	107
Figure 12. Theme 2: Towards self-development and its sub-themes.....	112
Figure 13. Theme 3: Avoiding behaviour and its sub-themes.....	115
Figure 14. Theme 4: Areas for improvement and its sub-themes	119
Figure 15. Student nurses' themes and sub-themes in the first AR	123
Figure 16. Theme 1: Making sense of reflective practice and its sub-themes.....	124
Figure 17. Theme 2: Positive impacts and its sub-themes.....	130
Figure 18. Theme 3: Struggling with the writing process and its sub-themes	135
Figure 19. Theme 4: Uncertainty in supervision process and its sub-themes	139
Figure 20. Theme 5: Supervision needs to be improved and its sub-themes	143
Figure 21. Clinical educators' themes and sub-themes in the second AR	148
Figure 22. Theme 1: Struggling with the implementation and its sub-themes.....	149
Figure 23. Theme 2: Challenging the culture and its sub-themes.....	154

Figure 24. Theme 3: 'Students changing' and its sub-themes	158
Figure 25. Student nurses' themes and sub-themes	163
Figure 26. Theme 1: Developing expertise and its sub-themes.....	164
Figure 27. Theme 2: Feeling competent in practice and its sub-themes.....	169
Figure 28. The image of a rose	234
Figure 29. The image of a puzzle	238
Figure 30. A spider and its spider's web.....	242
Figure 31. A joint musical play	246

List of Tables

Table 1. The searching strategies.	28
Table 2. Summary of reviewed articles.	30
Table 3. Differences of AR forms	53
Table 4. Summary of the activities in the CRP study.	58
Table 5. Clinical educators' and student nurses' characteristics.	60
Table 6. Data collection methods.	62
Table 7. An example of field notes.	64
Table 8. Examples of back-translation process.	70
Table 9. Template analysis for clinical educators' and student nurses' data.	73
Table 10. Strategies to achieve trustworthiness of the study.	76

Abstract

Reflective practice (RP) is extensively used to facilitate students' learning from their experiences and to improve practice. Despite substantial literature regarding RP effectiveness, Indonesian nursing education had not systematically applied RP within education programs. Most RP models have been developed and applied in Western countries with a number of studies indicating that culture may influence implementation in Eastern countries. This current study aimed to develop and implement a RP model that integrates Indonesian cultural characteristics to improve students' clinical learning. An action research (AR) approach was used with reflection as a core step in each cycle.

In AR cycle one, the researcher and six clinical educators developed a clinical reflective practice (CRP) model that considered Indonesian culture. The educators and 23 students implemented the model over a six months period. Data were collected through reflection sessions with educators and students conducted at the end of cycle one. Data were analysed separately for both groups with four themes from clinical educators (varied strategies used; towards self-development; avoiding behaviour; and areas for improvement) and five from students (making sense of RP; positive impacts; struggling with the writing process; uncertainty in supervision process; and supervision needs to be improved). These findings demonstrated that the CRP model was in the beginning stage of acceptance and needed some improvements.

In AR cycle two, the CRP model was revised in line with the findings from cycle one and was implemented over a three month period, followed by further data collection. Three themes emerged from the clinical educators' experiences (struggling with the implementation; challenging the culture; and students changing) and four from the students' experiences (developing expertise; feeling competent in practice; creating a safe space; and courage to speak up). An evaluation session held with students six weeks after completing their placement resulted in further themes (expanding their views, safe place, a light in the dark, self-awareness booster, and learning through experience). Findings indicate that clinical educators were still in a

process of accepting the CRP model, whilst the students gained more positive benefits, resulting in an enhanced learning experience.

The CRP model implementation highlights the cultural challenge for clinical educators in using a reflection process that resulted in students driving their own learning; thereby enhancing their overall learning experience. The resulting changes from the CRP model within the leading nursing education institution in Indonesia may influence other institutions to implement RP to improve students' clinical learning.

Abstrak (Bahasa Indonesia)

Praktik reflektif (PR) telah banyak digunakan untuk memfasilitasi mahasiswa belajar dari pengalamannya untuk memperbaiki praktik mereka. Meskipun telah banyak studi terkait efektifitas PR, pendidikan keperawatan di Indonesia masih belum menerapkan hal ini secara sistematis dalam program pendidikannya. Studi kepustakaan menunjukkan bahwa sebagian besar model PR dikembangkan di negara Barat dimana beberapa penelitian mengindikasikan bahwa budaya mungkin mempengaruhi implementasi PR di negara Timur. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengembangkan dan mengimplementasikan model PR yang mengintegrasikan budaya Indonesia untuk memperbaiki pembelajaran klinik mahasiswa. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengembangkan dan mengimplementasikan sebuah model PR yang mengintegrasikan karakteristik budaya Indonesia untuk memperbaiki pembelajaran klinik mahasiswa. Pendekatan Riset Aksi (RA) digunakan dalam penelitian ini dengan refleksi sebagai langkah utama dalam tiap siklusnya.

Pada siklus pertama RA, peneliti dan enam pembimbing klinik mengembangkan model Praktik Klinik Reflektif (PiKiR) dengan mempertimbangkan budaya Indonesia. Pembimbing klinik dan 23 mahasiswa mengimplementasikan model tersebut selama enam bulan. Data dikumpulkan melalui sesi refleksi dengan pembimbing klinik dan mahasiswa yang dilakukan pada akhir siklus pertama. Data dianalisis secara terpisah untuk dua kelompok partisipan dimana empat tema muncul dari pembimbing klinik (variasi dalam strategi; menuju ke pengembangan diri; perilaku menghindar; dan hal yang perlu diperbaiki) dan lima tema dari mahasiswa (berusaha memahami praktik reflektif; dampak positif; kesulitan dalam proses menulis; ketidakjelasan proses supervisi; dan supervisi perlu diperbaiki). Temuan ini menunjukkan bahwa model PiKiR ini berada dalam tahap awal penerimaan dan masih membutuhkan perbaikan.

Pada siklus RA yang kedua, model PiKiR direvisi sesuai dengan temuan pada siklus pertama RA dan diimplementasikan selama lebih dari tiga bulan, diikuti dengan pengumpulan data lebih lanjut. Tiga tema diidentifikasi dari pengalaman pembimbing klinik (kesulitan dalam implementasi; tantangan dari aspek budaya; dan

perubahan mahasiswa) dan empat tema dari pengalaman mahasiswa (keahliannya berkembang; merasa kompeten dalam praktik; rasa aman tercipta; dan berani berbicara). Sesi evaluasi dilakukan pada mahasiswa pada enam minggu setelah mereka menyelesaikan praktik klinik dan teridentifikasi beberapa tema lain (pandangan yang meluas; tempat yang aman; lampu di kegelapan; stimulasi kesadaran diri; dan belajar melalui pengalaman). Temuan ini mengindikasikan bahwa pembimbing klinik masih dalam proses menerima model PiKiR ini, namun mahasiswa mendapatkan manfaat yang positif dari model ini dalam hal peningkatan pengalaman belajar mereka.

Implementasi model PiKiR ini menekankan pada perubahan budaya pada pembimbing klinik dalam menggunakan proses refleksi yang berakibat pada mahasiswa mampu menentukan arah pembelajarannya sendiri; yang berdampak pada peningkatan pengalaman belajar mahasiswa secara umum. Perubahan yang terjadi dari model PiKiR ini pada institusi yang menjadi pusat pendidikan keperawatan di Indonesia dapat mempengaruhi insitusi lain untuk mengimplementasikan PR yang bertujuan untuk memperbaiki pembelajaran klinik mahasiswa.