The Role of Emotional Intelligence in the Management of Large Construction Projects

PETER VINCENT LIVESEY

BSc (Hons), MBA, FAIPM, MIAMA, CPPD

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

[2016]
Statement of Original Authorship

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

P. V. Livesey

P. V. Livesey

27th February 2016
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank all the people who have motivated and assisted me in my doctoral study. I would like to especially thank my supervisors Professor Spike Boydell, Adjunct Professor Goran Runeson and Dr. M. Nugapitiya for their continuous support and many useful suggestions.

I would like to thank all of the Delphi study participants for giving up their valuable time to be part of the study and for the many well-thought-out comments made by them that added to the quality of the study.

Finally, I would like to thank my wife, Marilyn, who was very supportive and understanding during my journey. I would also like to thank Helen Whitney for proofreading my thesis.
Table of Contents

Chapter 1 Introduction ............................................................................................................ 1
  1.1 Background .................................................................................................................. 1
  1.2 Research Aim ............................................................................................................. 4
  1.3 Significance of the Research ..................................................................................... 5
  1.4 Methodology of this Thesis ....................................................................................... 6
  1.5 Outline of this Thesis ............................................................................................... 7
  1.6 Definitions ................................................................................................................. 8
  1.7 Delimitations of Scope and Key Assumptions ......................................................... 9
  1.8 Summary .................................................................................................................. 10

Chapter 2 Literature Review ............................................................................................... 11
  2.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................... 11
  2.2 Initial Developments in Project Management Theory ............................................. 12
    2.2.1 Development of Critical Success Factors (CSF) and Project Success Criteria (PSC) .... 12
    2.2.2 Development of PMBoK ...................................................................................... 16
  2.3 Issues Associated with Nature of Projects ............................................................. 18
    2.3.1 The Impact of Time ........................................................................................... 18
    2.3.2 The Impact of Geographic Location on the Nature of Projects ...................... 24
    2.3.3 Problems in Project Decision-Making ............................................................... 24
    2.3.4 Summary .......................................................................................................... 26
  2.4 Overview of the Role of Leadership in Project Success ....................................... 27
  2.5 Significant Contributions to Project Management Theory from Other Areas .. 29
    2.5.1 Contribution from Contingency Theory ......................................................... 29
    2.5.2 Actor Network Theory (ANT) ......................................................................... 30
    2.5.3 Action Research (AR) ...................................................................................... 31
    2.5.4 Complexity Theory ......................................................................................... 31
  2.6 Recent Approaches to Identifying the Skills Used by Project Managers in the Practice of Project Management .......................................................... 34
    2.6.1 The Traditional Skills approach ....................................................................... 34
    2.6.2 The Cooperative Approach ............................................................................. 36
    2.6.3 The Autoethnographic Approach ................................................................... 37
    2.6.4 The Emotional Intelligence Approach ............................................................. 38
    2.6.5 The Reflective Approach ............................................................................... 40
    2.6.6 Summary of Various Approaches .................................................................. 45
  2.7 Major Developments in the Understanding of Project Management Practice . 45
  2.8 The Development of EI theory .............................................................................. 50
    2.8.1 Mayer and Salovey Model .............................................................................. 50
    2.8.2 Competency and Mixed Models ...................................................................... 51
    2.8.3 Petrides and Furnham Model .......................................................................... 57
    2.8.4 Joseph and Newman Model ............................................................................ 58
    2.8.5 Discussion of Model Types ............................................................................. 59
    2.8.6 Measurement of EI ........................................................................................ 61
    2.8.7 Model Validity ................................................................................................ 63
    2.8.8 Other Issues .................................................................................................... 63
    2.8.9 Summary ....................................................................................................... 66
  2.9 Conclusion ............................................................................................................... 70
7.2 Summary of the Research........................................................................................................ 204
  7.2.1 Research Methodology ................................................................................................... 205
  7.2.2 Results and Analysis of My Autoethnography ............................................................ 206
  7.2.3 Results and Analysis of the Delphi Study ...................................................................... 207

7.3 Conclusions .................................................................................................................................. 209
  7.3.1 Conclusion Regarding the Relevance of EI in the Management of the Project
        Problems Identified in the Academic Literature .......................................................... 211
  7.3.2 Conclusion Regarding the Validity of Autoethnography as a Research ..................... 212
  7.3.3 Conclusion Concerning the Impact of Project Size on the Need for Team
        Management and PMBoK Skills .................................................................................... 212
  7.3.4 Conclusion Concerning Project Problems Resulting from the Unique Nature of
        Projects ............................................................................................................................ 213
  7.3.5 Conclusion Regarding Project Problems Additional to those Identified from a
        Consideration of the Nature of Projects ......................................................................... 213
  7.3.6 Conclusion Regarding Factors Contributing to the Successful Delivery of a
        Project .............................................................................................................................. 213
  7.3.7 Conclusion Regarding the Importance of Reflection in Project Management ............. 214

7.4 Limitation of this Research ........................................................................................................ 214
  7.5 Recommendation for Further Work .................................................................................... 215
  7.5.1 Recommendation for Further work With Regard to the Use of Autoethnography ....... 216
  7.5.2 Recommendation for Further Work on the Impact of Project Size ............................ 216
  7.5.3 Recommendation for Further Work on the Impact of Procurement Method and
        Project Prospective ........................................................................................................ 217
  7.5.4 Recommendation for Further Work on Project Problems Resulting from the Nature of
        Projects .......................................................................................................................... 217
  7.5.5 Recommendations Regarding Project Problems Additional to those Suggested in the
        Academic literature ...................................................................................................... 218
  7.5.6 Recommendations for Further Work on Factors Contributing to the Successful
        Delivery of a Project ...................................................................................................... 218
  7.3.7 Recommendations for Further Work on the Relevance of EI in the Management of
        the Project Problems Identified in the Academic Literature ......................................... 219
  7.3.8 Recommendations for Further Work to Broaden the Basis of this Study .................. 219

References ......................................................................................................................................... 221
Appendix A Details of the Delphi Study ......................................................................................... 239
List of Figures

Figure 1  Project management knowledge areas and process evolved from Turner (2007) using PMBoK (PMI 2013) ................................................................. 17
Figure 2  Joseph and Newman Model adopted from Joseph and Newman (2010) .............................................................................................................. 59
Figure 3  Panel members’ views of the relative importance of team management skills and PMBoK-type skills as project size increases ... 139
Figure 4  Panel members’ views of the importance of Gantt charts ................. 140
Figure 5  Problems associated with project-limited time frame ..................... 145
Figure 6  Problems associated with the team members’ diverse backgrounds .... 146
Figure 7  Problems associated with the stakeholders’ diverse backgrounds ....... 147
Figure 8  Problems associated with the unique issues of each project ............. 148
Figure 9  Problems associated with ambiguity and change ................................ 149
Figure 10 Problems associated with changes in the project team and stakeholder personnel ......................................................................................... 150
Figure 11 Problems associated with conflicts (the disagreements that arise prior to a formal dispute) that arise during a project ........................................ 151
Figure 12 Panel members’ views of the additional problems identified in project management .................................................................................................. 157
Figure 13 The consensus position of panel members on commentary regarding success factors associated with team management ........................................ 159
Figure 14 The significance of reflection on career development and the management of project problems ................................................................. 162
Figure 15 Perceived benefit of project management methodologies compared with experience adopted from Wells (2012) ............................................... 183
List of Tables

Table 1  Critical Success Factors ................................................................. 13
Table 2  The six dimensions of time adapted from George and Jones (2000) .... 19
Table 3  Characteristics of temporary organisations developed from Tyssen et al. (2013) .................................................................................................. 22
Table 4  Characteristics of temporary organisations developed from Hanisch and Wald (2014) ...................................................................................... 23
Table 5  Remington and Pollack’s model of project complexity .................... 32
Table 6  Summary of papers discussing the role of EI in project management .... 41
Table 7  Techniques used in researching the practice of project management .... 47
Table 8  Summary of the milestones in development of project management theory ................................................................................................................. 49
Table 9  Summary of Mayer and Salovey EI model ........................................ 52
Table 10 Summary of the Goleman-Boyatzis model .................................... 53
Table 11 Summary of the Bar-On model ...................................................... 55
Table 12 Summary of the Dulewicz and Higgs model .................................. 556
Table 13 Summary of the Petrides and Furnham model ............................. 58
Table 14 Summary of model types and tests developed from McEnrue et al. (2010) ................................................................................................................. 60
Table 15 EI model and test results, developed from work by McEnrue et al. (2010), McEnrue and Groves (2006) and O’Boyle et al. (2011) ...................... 65
Table 16 Validity measures adapted from Nunnally (2010), Nunnally and Bernstein (1994) ........................................................................................................ 66
Table 17 Identification of appropriate research methodology ....................... 74
Table 18 Appropriate focus based on research type ....................................... 75
Table 19 Likert scale options for the questions put to panel members and associated score .......................................................... 96
Table 20 Frequency intervals and associated midpoints ............................... 97
Table 21 Delphi panel members’ demographics ............................................ 138
Table 22 Relative importance index for problem categories ........................ 152
Table 23 Relative importance index for individual problems ....................... 153
Table 24 Problem areas by mean frequency ............................................... 156
Table 25 Additional project problems identified by panel members ............... 158
Table 26 The consensus position of panel members on commentary regarding success factors associated with team management ................................. 160
Table 27 Problems reviewed by the panel in evaluating the relevance of the EI competencies ........................................................................................................ 164
Table 28 Importance index for competencies in the self-awareness cluster........165
Table 29 Competencies found not relevant in the self-awareness cluster ..........166
Table 30 Importance Index for competencies in the self-management cluster......167
Table 31 Competencies found not relevant in the self-management cluster ........168
Table 32 Wilcoxon test results for self-management cluster............................168
Table 33 Importance index for competencies in the social-awareness cluster ......170
Table 34 Competencies found not relevant in the social awareness cluster ........170
Table 35 Importance index for competencies in the relationship management cluster........................................................................................................171
Table 36 Competencies found not relevant in the relationship management cluster........................................................................................................172
Table 37 Wilcoxon test results for the relationship management cluster ..........172
Table 38 Summary of the competencies identified in my autoethnography.......177
Table 39 Comparison of autoethnography and Delphi study results.................179
Table 40 Analysis of the top 13 items in the relative importance index by problem........................................................................................................185
Table 41 Significance ratings resulting from the relative importance index result ........................................................................................................186
Table 42 Comparison of top significance ranking problems with their position using the relative importat index .........................................................188
Table 43 Relevance of competencies in the Goleman-Boyatzis model in dealing with the project in project management.................................200
Table 44 Summary of additional problems and key success factors identified by the Delphi panel.................................................................209
Abstract

The research examines the relevance of the Goleman-Boyatzis model of emotional intelligence in dealing with the problems in large, complex construction projects in the mining and construction industries.

The study accomplishes this by examining the relative importance of hard and soft skills in project management as project size increases.

It investigates this topic using the lived experience of project managers, via an autoethnography and a Delphi study, where all participants had managed large and complex projects.

The Delphi study confirmed the problems identified in the literature review and the autoethnography and suggested additional problems and key success factors based on the experience of project managers.

By confirming the importance of emotional intelligence and the relevance of the Goleman-Boyatzis model and also identifying additional problems and key success factors this research adds to the understanding of necessary skills needed by a project manager in the management of large projects.

As the findings of the autoethnography are confirmed by the Delphi study the work also lends credibility to the use of autoethnography as a research method in construction management.