# POSITIVE DISCRIMINATION MEASURES IN AUSTRALIAN INDIGENOUS HIGHER EDUCATION: LESSONS FOR CHILE

by

Vanessa Jara Labarthé

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment
of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

University of Technology, Sydney

17 December 2015

Supervisory Committee:

Associate Professor Jeffery Browitt, University of Technology, Sydney

Professor N Martin Nakata, University of New South Wales

ABSTRACT

Positive discrimination measures in Australian Indigenous higher education: Lessons for Chile

By Vanessa Jara Labarthé

This thesis explores the conceptualisation, development, and implementation of positive discrimination measures in context of the higher education of Indigenous people. I set out to consider the implications of the Australian experience for the development of approaches to positive discrimination policy and programs for Indigenous people in Chile. I look particularly for lessons in the development and implementation of two positive discrimination measures that have emerged in Australia over the last four decades: ABSTUDY and the National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Education Policy (1989). The Australian experience has been forged over a longer time-frame than Chile and an assumption I am making in this thesis is that lessons from this experience are potentially useful for the Chilean Indigenous higher education context. My inquiry is to understand not just the positive effects but also the limits that positive discrimination measures contribute to the higher education access, participation, and outcomes of Indigenous students.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**TABLE OF CONTENTS** ..... **I**

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS** ..... **IV**

**LIST OF ACRONYMS** ..... **VI**

INTRODUCTORY REMARKS ..... 1

CHAPTER 1 ..... 6

*Indigenous higher education in Latin America* ..... *6*

Bolivia ..... 8

Peru ..... 11

Ecuador ..... 13

Colombia ..... 16

Mexico ..... 19

Guatemala ..... 23

Summary ..... 27

CHAPTER 2 ..... 29

*Indigenous higher education in Chile* ..... *29*

Chilean Indigenous Law 19.253 (*Ley Indígena*) and Indigenous higher education ..... 32

Indigenous Scholarship Program ..... 36

Intercultural Bilingual Education Program – Ministry of Education ..... 38

Universities and Indigenous higher education ..... 38

Pathways to Higher Education, Ford Foundation ..... 41

Summary ..... 44

CHAPTER 3 ..... 47

*The concept of positive discrimination: history, rationales and tensions* ..... *47*

Positive discrimination and higher education ..... 51

The significance of historical and other particularities in national contexts for positive discrimination rationales and practices ..... 55

Positive discrimination as policy and discourse ..... 58

CHAPTER 4 ..... 62

*Methodology* ..... *62*

Archaeology of knowledge and statements ..... 63

Subjects and objects of knowledge ..... 68

Knowledge, power and subjectivity ..... 70

'Truth' and 'claims to know' the Indigenous subject ..... 72
The Cultural Interface ..... 73
Focus of Study ..... 76
CHAPTER 5 ..... 78
*Indigenous higher education and Australian positive discrimination ..... 78*
The context of positive discrimination in Australia ..... 84
Developments in Indigenous higher education in the post-referendum reform period ... 87
Positive discrimination in Indigenous higher education ..... 92
CHAPTER 6 ..... 95
*Stratetgic financial incentives as a positive dicrimination measure ..... 95*
The beginning of Abstudy ..... 96
The 1984 Review of Abstudy ..... 99
Changes in Abstudy following the 1984 Review ..... 116
ABSTUDY in the Howard government era (1997-2007) ..... 121
ABSTUDY under the Rudd and Gillard Labor governments (2008 – 2013) ..... 144
Summation ..... 152
CHAPTER 7 ..... 157
*The national aboriginal policy framework as a positive discrimination measure 1989-1999 ..... 157*
The Emergence of the NATSIEP/AEP ..... 158
The NATSIEP/AEP: premises, rationales, and goals ..... 164
Some Premises of NATSIEP (1989) ..... 164
Rationalising the need for policy ..... 166
The purpose of the policy ..... 169
The 21 long-term goals of NATSIEP ..... 171
The Yunupingu AEP Review 1995 ..... 178
Ministerial Council of Education, Employment, Training and Youth Affairs (1996) ..... 189
Higher education: Indigenous education strategies 1999 – 2001 (DETYA 1999) ..... 194
Summary ..... 202
CHAPTER EIGHT ..... 204
*The onward development and implementation of the national policy measures 2005-2014 ..... 204*
The establishment of the Indigenous Higher Education Advisory Council ..... 205
The role of Universities of Australia ..... 211
Indigenous higher education in the context of the Bradley Review of Australian Higher Education ..... 218

The emergence of cultural competency discourse and as a framework for best practice in Australian higher education ..... 221
The Review of Higher Education Access and Outcomes for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander People ..... 229
The shifting discursive context and responses to the Review of higher education access and outcomes for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people ..... 239
CONCLUDING REMARKS ..... 263
*Lessons for Chile ..... 263*
**REFERENCE LIST ..... 281**

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere appreciation and gratitude to my supervisors, Associate Professor Jeffrey Browitt of the University of Technology Sydney and Professor Martin Nakata of the University of New South Wales for their unfailing support as I researched and wrote this thesis, but also as I overcame personal interruptions to my progress, including childbirth, serious illness to my father, finding my voice in a foreign language, and the innumerable daily challenges of setting up home in another city in a faraway country. I am sure that I wouldn't make it without their help and support during these years.

I would also like to thank my husband Sergio Jiménez who was a pillar of support at all times, especially when I had to deal with my father's life-threatening illness. Thanks for your patience and love. To my daughter Magdalena who was born when I was starting this journey. She was – and still is – the best partner with her smiles, cuddles and love.

I would also like to thank my family, especially mom and dad, who gave me all the love and strength I needed to overcome the final and hardest times in Sydney. I would also like to thank my brother, my cousin Jean and his wife Margarita, and my aunties and uncles for their constant support in Sydney and in Chile. And thanks to all the amazing people I met during these years, here and there, all of you have a very special place in my heart and in my life.

I would also like to give my sincere thanks to the School of International Studies in the Faculty of Arts & Social Sciences at the University of Technology Sydney (UTS) as well as the library staff at the University of Technology for their generous support and the staff at Nura Gili Indigenous Programs Unit at the University of New South Wales for their warm welcome at the beginning of this study and their support through these years.

I would like to thank to the National Commission of Scientific and Technological Research (CONICYT), BECASCHILE, and the Chilean government for their financial support during these years. Without your support, none of this would have been possible.

Finally, I would like to dedicate this study to my dad, Rene, who taught me that nothing is impossible, to find ways to overcome difficulties, and to always give the best of me—giving me the best example: his own life. Thanks dad for all your love, courage and tenacity. You are the best!

# LIST OF ACRONYMS

**ABSEG** Aboriginal Secondary Grants Scheme (Australia)

**ABSTUDY** Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Study Scheme (Australia)

**ACT** Australian Capital Territory (Australia)

**AECG** Aboriginal Education Consultative Group

**AEP** Aboriginal Education Policy (Australia)

**AESIP** Aboriginal Education Strategic Initiatives Program (Australia)

**AHRC** Australian Human Rights Commission

**AIME** Australian Indigenous Mentoring Experience

**ANU** Australian National University (Australia)

**APA** Australian Postgraduate Award (Australia)

**ATAR** Australian Tertiary Admission Rank

**ATSIHEAC** Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Higher Education Advisory Council

**ATSIC** Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Commission (Australia)

**AUSTUDY** Australian Government Scheme of Educational Allowances (Australia)

**AVCC** Australian Vice Chancellors' Committee (Australia)

**CASEN** National Socioeconomic Survey (Chile)

**CDEYA** Commonwealth Department of Education and Youth Affairs (Australia)

**CGEIB** General Coordination of Bilingual Intercultural Education (Mexico)

**CODISRA** Presidential Commission against Racism and Discrimination (Guatemala)

**CONADI** National Corporation of Indigenous Development (Chile)

**DEET** Department of Employment, Education and Training (Australia)

**DEETYA** Department of Employment, Education, Training and Youth Affairs (Australia)

**DEST** Department of Education, Science and Training (Australia)

**DETYA** Department of Education, Training and Youth Affairs (Australia)

**FCAATSI** The Federal Council for the Advancement of Aborigines and Torres Strait Islanders (Australia)

**ICIE** Indian Control of Indian Education (Canada)

**IESALC** International Higher Education Office for Latin America and the Caribbean

**IEU** Indigenous Education Unit

**IHEAC** Indigenous Higher Education Advisory Council (Australia)

**ILO** International Labour Organization

**INALI** National Institute for Languages (Mexico)

**ITAS** Indigenous Tutorial Assistance Scheme

**JUNAEB** National Board of Student Aid and Scholarships (Chile)

**MCEETYA** Ministerial Council for Employment, Education, Training and Youth Affairs (Australi

**MEF** Maori Education Foundation (New Zealand)

**NAAF** National Aboriginal Achievement Foundation (Canada)

**NAEC** National Aboriginal Education Committee (Australia)

**NATSIEP** National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Education Policy (Australia)

**NESA** National Employment Strategy for Aboriginals

**PAAEA** Aymara student Support Program (Chile)

**PAAEM** Program for Mapuche Student Support (Chile)

**PAE** Special Admission Program (Colombia)

**PES** Pensioner Supplement Scheme (Australia)

**PNUD** United Nations Program for Development

**PRODEPINE** Project for the Development of Black and Indigenous peoples of Ecuador (Ecuador)

**PRONABES** Mexican national program of scholarships for higher education (Mexico)

**PSSSP** Post-Secondary Student Support Program (Canada)

**PSU** University Selection Test (Chile)

**RACS** Office for the Andean Region and the Southern Cone

**SFSS** Student Financial Supplement Scheme (Australia)

**TAFE** Technical and Further Education (Australia)

**TEPA** Tertiary Education Program for Aborigines (Australia)

**TES** Tertiary Education Strategy 2002/2007 (New Zealand)

**UAIM** Autonomous Indigenous University of Mexico (Mexico)

**UCT** Catholic University of Temuco (Chile)

**UFRO** University of La Frontera (Chile)

**UINPI** Intercultural University of Indigenous Peoples and Nationalities (Ecuador)

**UNAP** Arturo Prat University (Chile)

**UNDA** University of Notre Dame (Australia)

**UNESCO** United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

**UNIBOL** Bolivian Indigenous Universities (Bolivia)

**UNIK** Intercultural Indigenous University Kawsay (Bolivia)

**URNG** National Revolutionary Unity of Guatemala (Guatemala)

**USAC** University of San Carlos (Guatemala)

**UTA** University of Tarapaca (Chile)

**UTS** University of Technology Sydney (Australia)

**VET** Vocational Education Training

**WAACHS** Western Australian Aboriginal Child Health Survey (Australia)