What works for whom and in which circumstances?

A realist evaluation of a complex intervention for pregnant women with obesity

________________________________________________

Jane Raymond

Submitted to the University of Technology Sydney
In fulfilment of requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

2016
Certificate of original authorship

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Jane Raymond
10 May 2016
Acknowledgements

Writing this section brings me to the end of the long and eventful journey of my PhD. I arrived in Australia almost 10 years ago, and for 8 of those years I have been somewhere along this road. I would like to say some special words to the people who have shared this journey with me and supported me in so many ways.

To Caroline Homer, my principal supervisor; thank you for your endless patience, wisdom and sound guidance and for letting me do this my way, in my time, and not giving up on me during the process. Your ability to turn work around with the speed of light, to be always there when needed (wherever you are in the world), and to stand patiently in the wings when all is going well (or not going well) – is simply legendary. For your faith in me, despite the various setbacks, I will be forever grateful.

To Deb Davis, my second supervisor, you were an important part of the exciting time when the model ‘SSWInG’ became a reality, and it is thanks to you that motivational interviewing has now become so much part of my life. I will not forget how you generously shared your family time on a rainy weekend in Sydney to help me find my (rather desperate) way through the maze of qualitative analysis.

I would like to acknowledge the women and the staff in both hospitals where I collected my data, who so generously gave their time, and to our wonderful SSWInG facilitators Amanda and Judy, whose expertise, courage and professionalism never ceased to amaze. To my friends, colleagues and the research support team at UTS who have walked this journey alongside me, thank you for all the coffee meetings, for providing constructive feedback, and for asking all the right questions at all the right times. A special mention to Karol and Dave for their data recovery and formatting skills – without them this document simply would not be.
To my faithful ‘Research Meeting’ friends – Vanessa Clements, Felicity Copeland and Lyn Passant, thank you for your support and (probably feigned but well disguised) interest over many years as we have morphed from research meetings to nights-out. I have finally caught up with you all, and now we can officially re-name our meetings and move on! 

Vanessa Clements, extra special thanks for your friendship and unwavering support. You have shared so much of this journey – from the time we dreamt up ‘SSWInG’, made it a reality, developed a video about our experience, designed eLearning modules about motivational interviewing and gestational weight gain, taught, presented and published together – the ‘real stuff’ alongside the research has been an invaluable part of this learning experience. Your energy, enthusiasm and ability are truly inspiring.

Finally, to my very special family in the UK – thank you for your wise words, endless support, love and encouragement by phone call, Facetime, Skype and all other means of communication. To my 88 year old mother who remains intensely interested in this study and has diligently ploughed her way through the findings – thank you for your great commentary. A special note to my niece, Rhiannon, to whom I promised I would finish my PhD before she finished her HSC-equivalent. It looks like we will now cross the line together, a little later than planned, as you complete your university degree this month. I look forward to sharing some ‘real’ time with you and Richard, and all my wonderful family and friends in the very near future.
Conference Presentations

NSW Midwives Association conference, Blue Mountains, Australia


Table of Contents

Certificate of original authorship ................................................................................................................................. i
Acknowledgements ......................................................................................................................................................... ii
Conference Presentations .................................................................................................................................................... iv
Table of Contents .............................................................................................................................................................. v
List of Tables ..................................................................................................................................................................... xi
List of Figures ................................................................................................................................................................. xii
Abstract ........................................................................................................................................................................... xiii

CHAPTER 1 - INTRODUCTION .......................................................................................................................... 1
1.1 The intervention ..................................................................................................................................................... 2
1.2 My motivation for undertaking this study .............................................................................................................. 3
1.3 The context for the study .......................................................................................................................................... 5
    1.3.1 Obesity and gestational weight gain .................................................................................................................. 5
    1.3.2 The clinical policy context in Australia in relation to obesity ........................................................................... 7
    1.3.3 The professional context of maternity care in Australia in relation to obesity ............................................ 8
    1.3.4 Complex interventions and the nature of evaluation ........................................................................................ 10
1.4 The research aim and objectives ............................................................................................................................ 11
1.5 Organisation of the thesis ......................................................................................................................................... 12
1.6 Chapter summary .................................................................................................................................................... 13

CHAPTER 2 - EXPLORING THE EVIDENCE ........................................................................................................... 14
2.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................................................... 14
2.2 Method ...................................................................................................................................................................... 14
2.3 Obesity and gestational weight gain – an overview ................................................................................................. 15
    2.3.1 Obesity ............................................................................................................................................................... 15
    2.3.2 Gestational weight gain and impact on outcomes ........................................................................................... 21
2.4 Interventions designed to influence gestational weight gain .................................................................................. 29
    2.4.1 Interventions – an overview .............................................................................................................................. 29
    2.4.2 Strategies that have been shown to be helpful ................................................................................................. 31
2.4.3 Recent intervention studies .................................................................33
2.4.4 Interventions in Australia - acceptability and feasibility ..................35
2.4.5 Summary - interventions to limit weight gain in pregnancy ...............36
2.5 The views and beliefs of obese women in relation to antenatal care and gestational weight gain ....................................................................................37
2.5.1 Acceptability of antenatal care ..............................................................37
2.5.2 Maternal knowledge and attitude in relation to gestational weight gain ....39
2.5.3 Maternal motivation for change ...............................................................42
2.5.4 Summary - the views and beliefs of obese women .................................43
2.6 The knowledge, attitudes and practice of health professionals in relation to obesity and gestational weight gain .................................................................43
2.6.1 Reluctance to provide advice .................................................................44
2.6.2 Inadequate expertise and knowledge .......................................................45
2.6.3 Lack of confidence ..................................................................................46
2.6.4 Summary - the knowledge, attitudes and practice of health professionals ......47
2.7 Evidence summary .....................................................................................48
2.8 The research gap – what is known and not known .....................................49

CHAPTER 3 - METHODOLOGY ........................................................................53
3.1 Introduction ..................................................................................................53
3.2 The development of theory-driven evaluation ..............................................53
3.3 Realist evaluation .........................................................................................56
3.3.1 Critical realism .......................................................................................58
3.4 Using the realist evaluation methodology in practice .................................61
3.4.1 The components of the realist evaluation framework ...............................61
3.4.2 Approaches to data collection .................................................................64
3.4.3 The process of analysis and the development of middle range theory ........67
3.4.4 Using the findings from realist evaluation ..............................................69
3.4.5 Examples of studies using the realist evaluation framework ..................70
3.4.6 Challenges and limitations of realist evaluation .....................................72
6.5 Summary of findings ................................................................................................... 210
  6.5.1 The women ........................................................................................................ 210
  6.5.2 The health professionals ................................................................................... 211
  6.5.3 Chapter summary .............................................................................................. 215

CHAPTER 7 .................................................................................................................216
  - REFINEMENT OF THE CONJECTURED CMO CONFIGURATIONS ......................216
  - THE GENERATION OF THEORY .............................................................................216

7.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................ 216
7.2 Refinement of the CMO configurations ...................................................................... 216
  7.2.1 The conjectured CMO configurations – or what was planned .......................... 216
  7.2.2 The refined CMO configurations – or what actually happened ....................... 217
  7.2.3 Section summary ............................................................................................... 227
7.3 The generation of theory ............................................................................................ 228
  7.3.1 Introduction ....................................................................................................... 228
  7.3.2 Defining the theoretical concepts ..................................................................... 229
  7.3.3 Developing the model ....................................................................................... 231
7.4 Chapter summary........................................................................................................ 235

CHAPTER 8 – DISCUSSION ..........................................................................................236
8.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................ 236
8.2 Applying the model for predicting behaviour in relation to gestational weight
  management .................................................................................................................. 236
  8.2.1 Intention (readiness) ......................................................................................... 237
  8.2.2 Ability (skills and knowledge) ............................................................................ 253
  8.2.3 Opportunities (environmental) ......................................................................... 261
  8.2.4 Section summary ............................................................................................... 263
8.3 Pulling it all together – or where to from here? ......................................................... 263
  8.3.1 Implications for practice .................................................................................... 264
  8.3.2 Future research potential .................................................................................. 268
8.4 Chapter summary........................................................................................................ 269
CHAPTER 9 - USING REALIST EVALUATION IN THE REAL WORLD ............................................. 270

9.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................ 270

9.2 Methodological challenges ......................................................................................... 270

9.2.1 Initial theory: getting the context right ............................................................. 272

9.2.2 The issue of timing – and time .......................................................................... 274

9.2.3 The meaning of mechanisms ............................................................................. 275

9.2.4 Testing the CMO configurations ........................................................................ 277

9.3 Limitations of my study............................................................................................... 279

9.4 Future potential for realist evaluation ........................................................................ 283

9.5 Chapter summary........................................................................................................ 284

9.6 Conclusion to the thesis .............................................................................................. 284

Appendices

Appendix 1: Program for the intervention group sessions ................................................ 287
Appendix 2: Ethics approval letters ................................................................................... 289
Appendix 3: Sample consent forms and information sheets ............................................. 293
Appendix 4: The Conjectured CMO Realist Hypothesis Grid ............................................. 297
Appendix 5: Sample focus group questions for staff offering women the intervention at
the booking in visit ...................................................................................................... 302
Appendix 6: NVivo matrix: confidence to discuss weight and weight gain ....................... 303
Appendix 7: Detailed characteristics of the study participants ......................................... 304
Appendix 8: The Refined CMO Realist Hypothesis Grid .................................................... 307

References ................................................................................................................... 315
List of Tables

Table 1: World Health Organization BMI categories ........................................................... 16
Table 2: Institute of Medicine guidelines for gestational weight gain ................................. 23
Table 3: Summary of the evidence reviewed in Chapter 2.................................................. 48
Table 4: The intervention compared to standard antenatal care ........................................ 84
Table 5: Demographic and maternity contexts of Location A and B .................................. 89
Table 6: Variations in design and delivery of the intervention at locations A and B .......... 90
Table 7: Stages of the realist evaluation cycle..................................................................... 98
Table 8: Examples of local and evidence-based contextual (C) features ........................... 100
Table 9: Examples of intended mechanisms (M) and target groups ................................. 101
Table 10: Examples of intended outcomes (O) and target groups ..................................... 101
Table 11: CMO configurations developed for this study ................................................... 102
Table 12: Forms of data collected for my study and their origin ....................................... 103
Table 13: Study participants at each location.................................................................... 104
Table 14: Summary of the women’s demographic characteristics and selected birth outcomes........................................................................................................... 125
Table 15: What worked, for whom and in which circumstances – women who participated in the study........................................................................................................... 151
Table 16: Summary of midwives’ and midwifery students’ demographic characteristics 152
Table 17: What worked, for whom and in which circumstances – midwives and midwifery students offering the intervention........................................................................ 172
Table 18: Summary of the facilitators’ professional group and location of work ............... 173
Table 19: What worked, for whom and in which circumstances – facilitators delivering the intervention........................................................................................................... 193
Table 20: Summary of the additional key stakeholders’ occupation and location of work ................................................................................................................................. 194
Table 21: Strategies for successful sustainability and transferability of the intervention 206
Table 22: What worked, for whom and in which circumstances – additional stakeholders involved in the intervention................................................................................ 209
List of Figures

Figure 1: The analysis framework of the study ................................................................. 117
Figure 2: Example of a recurring CMO configuration ....................................................... 223
Figure 3: Example of a negative CMO case ................................................................. 225
Figure 4: Example of a positive feedback loop ............................................................ 226
Figure 5: Example of a negative feedback loop ............................................................ 227
Figure 6: Model of Gestational Weight Management Behaviour Prediction ............... 232
Abstract

Background
Maternal obesity (BMI $\geq 30$kg/m$^2$) is a global public health concern, impacting negatively on the health of women and their babies. Women who are obese are more likely than women of normal weight (BMI $< 25$kg/m$^2$) to gain excessive weight during pregnancy, increasing their risk of adverse outcomes. Evidence supports the view that gestational weight gain can be influenced through lifestyle intervention, but few antenatal services with this specific aim exist in Australia. This study describes a realist evaluation of a complex healthcare intervention designed to support obese women to achieve a healthy weight gain during pregnancy.

Setting
The intervention was introduced simultaneously in 2 locations in Sydney, Australia and these provided comparative case studies for the evaluation. Antenatal care was provided in a group setting, and focussed on supporting obese pregnant women to achieve a ‘healthy’ gestational weight during pregnancy, according to the Institute of Medicine gestational weight gain guidelines.

Design
A theory-driven evaluation approach, employing the realist evaluation framework, was used to develop theory around what worked for whom and in which circumstances, for clinicians, managers and women who participated in the intervention. The intervention strategies were supported by initial theory (self-efficacy), described by Context-Mechanism-Outcome (CMO) configurations. These configurations were examined and refined during analysis, enabling the development of middle range theory.
Methods
A mixed method approach was utilised, employing both quantitative and qualitative data. The analysis involved a two-phase sequential process; comparative analysis followed by thematic analysis.

Findings
The findings highlighted that context has a strong influence on outcomes, and that unseen mechanisms can act as both barriers and enablers. Self-efficacy does play an important part in predicting positive gestational weight gain behaviour, for both clinicians and obese pregnant women. However, the refined theory underpinning the intervention was more complex than originally hypothesised. A theoretical model was developed to describe the interplay between intention, ability and opportunity in predicting individuals’ response to the intervention and the possibility of change. The Theory of Planned Behaviour and Social Learning Theory are the middle range theories underpinning this model.

Implications for practice
Group antenatal care designed to support women to achieve a healthy gestational weight gain has not previously been identified as an intervention to address the risks presented by maternal obesity. The theoretical model developed through the process of realist evaluation highlights key features that would enable a similar intervention to ‘work’ in an alternative setting.