

1 **Coagulation performance and floc characteristics of polytitanium**
2 **tetrachloride (PTC) compared with titanium tetrachloride (TiCl₄) and**
3 **ferric chloride (FeCl₃) in algal turbid water**

4 L. Chekli, ^{a, #} C. Eripret, ^{a, #} S.H. Park, ^{b, *} S.A.A. Tabatabai, ^c O. Vronska, ^d B. Tamburic, ^d J.H. Kim ^e
5 and H.K. Shon ^{a, *}

6 ^a School of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of Technology, Sydney, Post Box 129,
7 Broadway, NSW 2007, Australia.

8 ^b Korea Institute of Industrial Technology (KIITECH), 89 Yangdaegiro-gil, Ipjang-myeon, Seobuk-
9 gu, Cheonan-si, Chungcheongnam-do, 331-822, Republic of Korea.

10 ^c Water Desalination and Reuse Center (WDRC), 4700 King Abdullah University of Science and
11 Technology (KAUST), Thuwal 23955-6900, Saudi Arabia.

12 ^d Plant Functional Biology and Climate Change Cluster (C3), Faculty of Science, University of
13 Technology Sydney (UTS), Sydney, NSW 2007, Australia.

14 ^e School of Applied Chemical Engineering and the Institute for Catalysis Research, Chonnam
15 National University, Gwangju 500-757, Korea.

16 ^{*}Corresponding authors: Email: Hokyong.Shon-1@uts.edu.au; Phone: (+61) 02 9514 2629.

17 Email: shpark08@kitech.re.kr; Phone: (+82) 10 84273775

18 [#]L.C. and C.E. equally contributed to this work.

20 **Abstract:**

21 Seasonal green algae blooms in freshwaters have raised attention on the need to develop novel
22 effective treatment processes for the removal of algae in water. In the present study, the performance
23 of newly developed polytitanium tetrachloride (PTC) coagulant for the removal of freshwater
24 microalga *Chlorella vulgaris* has been investigated and compared with titanium tetrachloride (TiCl₄)
25 coagulant and the conventional ferric chloride (FeCl₃) coagulant. The main benefit of using titanium-
26 based coagulants is that the sludge produced after flocculation may be recycled into a valuable
27 product: titanium dioxide photocatalyst. Both titanium-based coagulants achieved good flocculation
28 over a broader pH range and coagulant dose compared to conventional FeCl₃ coagulant. All three
29 coagulants achieved comparable performance in terms of turbidity removal (i.e. turbidity removal
30 efficiency > 97%); although TiCl₄ performed slightly better at the lower tested dose (i.e. < 9 mg/L).
31 Zeta potential measurements indicated that charge neutralisation may not be the sole mechanism
32 involved in the coagulation of algae for all three coagulants. Analysis of the dynamic floc size
33 variation during floc breakage showed no regrowth after floc breakage for the three coagulants. The
34 flocs formed by both Ti-based coagulants were larger than those formed by FeCl₃ and also grew at a
35 faster rate. This study indicates that Ti-based coagulants are effective and promising coagulants for
36 algae removal in water.

37 **Keywords:** Coagulation, Algae, Polytitanium tetrachloride, Titanium tetrachloride, Floc size, Floc
38 strength.

39 1 Introduction

40 The occurrence of seasonal algal blooms (including microalgae and cyanobacteria) in surface waters
41 such as lakes, artificial reservoirs and rivers has raised concerns for water treatment process disruption
42 and maintenance, as well as final drinking water quality. Recent green algae blooms in South Korea's
43 four major rivers have posed a major problem for the quality of drinking water in the country.
44 Cyanobacteria blooms in the Han, Nakdong, Geum and Yeongsan rivers have been attributed to a
45 controversial flood prevention project in the four major rivers [1, 2]. Completed in 2011, the project
46 consisted of dredging of more than 500 million m³ of mud from the rivers and the construction of 16
47 dams. Quiescent water, as a result of dam construction, together with environmental factors such as
48 high temperature and nutrient concentration have been identified as the main factors contributing to
49 cyanobacteria proliferation [2]. Therefore, effective treatment processes to remove algae are required
50 for safe drinking water supply and a healthy ecological system.

51 To date, several methods have been employed to remove or reduce algae growth, including chemical
52 processes such as coagulation/flocculation [3, 4] and chlorination [5]; physical processes such as air
53 flotation [6], media filtration [7] and membrane technologies [8]; and finally electromagnetic
54 radiation such as ultraviolet (UV) light [9] and ultrasonic irradiation [10]. Electromagnetic radiation
55 processes suffer from high capital and maintenance costs [11] while physical processes (e.g.
56 membrane technologies) may impose high cost due to the energy requirement in these systems.
57 Besides, the use of oxidizing agents (e.g. chlorine) in some chemical processes may cause algal cell
58 wall damage, increasing the potential release of taste and odour causing compounds and intracellular
59 organic matter [12]. Finding a low-cost treatment process that can remove algae or limit their growth
60 without causing cell damage would be the optimum solution.

61 Coagulation/flocculation is by far one of the most economical water treatment processes for the
62 removal of algae [13, 14]. Algal cells have a negative surface charge that can be neutralized by the
63 positive charge of cationic ions such as ferric or aluminium and thus destabilized the algae cells to
64 form clusters or flocs, which can then be removed by sedimentation or flotation. However, the main
65 issue related to the use of conventional coagulants is the production of sludge after treatment. In
66 countries with stringent environmental legislation, coagulant-rich sludge requires extensive treatment
67 and handling prior to disposal, all of which contribute to overall cost and complexity of the treatment
68 process [15]. In fact, this has been recognised as one of the most environmentally problematic and
69 costly challenges of water treatment processes [16, 17].

70 An alternative titanium-based coagulant (i.e. titanium tetrachloride - TiCl₄) has been proposed by
71 Shon et al. [18] to resolve the sludge disposal issue associated with conventional Fe and Al salts. The

72 key advantage of titanium-based coagulants is that the sludge can be easily recycled (i.e. sludge
73 dewatering through simple filtration, drying at 100 °C and finally calcination at 600 °C) to produce a
74 valuable by-product [19-23]: titanium dioxide (TiO₂). TiO₂ is a widely used metal oxide with
75 applications in cosmetics, paints, photocatalysts, solar cells or electronic paper [24, 25]. In addition,
76 TiCl₄ has shown comparable or superior performance to conventional coagulants (e.g. Al₂(SO₄)₃,
77 FeCl₃, polyaluminum chloride and polyferric sulfate) during surface water treatment [26]. Besides, the
78 flocs produced by TiCl₄ coagulation were, in most cases, larger and grew faster, resulting in better
79 settleability. Finally, the low toxicity of titanium salts and related compounds (i.e. salicylate,
80 peroxide, oxides, tannate) compared to Al salts has already been reported [27]. In fact, titanium-
81 related compounds are often not reported in any water quality guidelines [21, 28, 29]. Our previous
82 study [18] demonstrated that the concentration of Ti salts remaining in the supernatant after
83 flocculation of wastewater by TiCl₄ was about 10 µg/L. In contrast, titanium concentration usually
84 encountered in drinking water supplies is in the range of 0.5-15 µg/L [28]. Application of TiCl₄ thus
85 provides a cost-effective alternative to dispose of coagulation sludge since the produced sludge can be
86 recycled into a valuable commercial photocatalyst. In fact, the early study by Shon et al. [18]
87 demonstrated that a medium size (i.e. 25,000 m³/d) wastewater treatment plant could produce an
88 average of 446.5 kg/day of photocatalyst.

89 However, it was observed that the optimum coagulation efficiency of TiCl₄ (at a dose of 20 mgTi/L)
90 occurred at low pH (i.e. pH 3.0 to 5.0), which was attributed to the release of large amounts of H⁺
91 during titanium hydrolysis [18, 26]. Thus, new methods were developed to address this issue so as to
92 reduce the need for pH adjustment over a wider range of coagulant dose. A recent study focused on
93 the development of polytitanium salts, which minimizes the release of H⁺ through prehydrolysis of
94 titanium salt [23]. In this study, polytitanium tetrachloride (PTC) was synthesized by a slow alkaline
95 titration method at different basicity values (i.e. at different OH/Ti molar ratios in PTC solution) and
96 tested as an alternative Ti-coagulant to TiCl₄ [23]. Results showed higher or comparable (i.e. based on
97 the parameter being measured) treatment performance of PTC compared to TiCl₄ in terms of removal
98 efficiency for turbidity and organic matter. Additionally, improved floc characteristics such as floc
99 size, growth rate and structure were also observed when using PTC.

100 In this study, coagulation performance of PTC and TiCl₄ coagulants was assessed for the first time for
101 the treatment of algal turbid water in terms of turbidity, zeta potential and floc size and then compared
102 with a commonly used coagulant, namely FeCl₃. Furthermore, a detailed comparative study was also
103 conducted to understand the growth and breakage of flocs formed by all three coagulants. This study
104 uses biomass derived from the model freshwater microalga *Chlorella vulgaris* for
105 coagulation/flocculation experiments. In addition to carrying out photosynthesis and primary

106 production, *Chlorella* also undergoes rapid growth under mixotrophic conditions in the presence of a
107 favourable organic carbon source [30]. Consequently, algal blooms involving *Chlorella* species are
108 frequently observed during freshwater eutrophication events [31].

109 **2 Materials and methods**

110 2.1 Coagulants

111 A stock solution of TiCl_4 (20% w/w) was prepared by slowly adding a predetermined volume (46.4
112 mL) of a concentrated TiCl_4 solution (>99% purity, density $\rho = 1.26 \text{ g/mL}$; Sigma Aldrich, Australia)
113 to frozen cubes of deionized water (initial volume of 400 mL). The concentrated solution was added
114 drop by drop under continuous stirring to reach a final concentration of 20% w/w. The concentration
115 of the final solution was systematically checked using a microwave plasma-atomic emission
116 spectrometer (4100 MP-AES, Agilent Technologies, US) and adjusted to the desired concentration as
117 necessary. Stock solution of FeCl_3 (10 g/L) was obtained by dissolving 2 g of powder in 200 mL of
118 deionized water. The preparation of PTC coagulant has been detailed in a previous study [23]. In
119 brief, a fixed volume (63.3 mL) of sodium hydroxide (200 g/L) was added to 200 mL of the TiCl_4
120 solution (20% w/w) using slow alkaline titration under intensive agitation to avoid formation of
121 precipitate. PTC was prepared with a basicity value (i.e. OH/Ti ratio) of 1.5; this was previously
122 determined to produce the best coagulation performance [23]. Coagulant dose was defined in units of
123 g-Ti/L and g-Fe/L for Ti-coagulants and FeCl_3 , respectively.

124 2.2 Algae culture and algal turbid water

125 *C. vulgaris* is a well-studied species commonly found in eutrophic surface water and was thus
126 selected for this study as a model freshwater microalga. The unicellular chlorophyte microalga *C.*
127 *vulgaris* (CS-42, ANACC, CSIRO) was grown as a suspended culture in MLA medium [32, 33]. 1 L
128 glass conical flasks containing *C. vulgaris* were stored at 21.5°C in an incubator (Labec Pty Ltd,
129 Australia) with fluorescent illumination at a 12h/12h light/dark cycle and a photon flux density of 40
130 $\mu\text{mol.photon/m}^2.\text{s}^2$.

131 A volume of 1 L of approximately 3 weeks old stock culture was used as inoculum to grow 10 L of *C.*
132 *vulgaris* (i.e. diluted in 9 L of fresh MLA medium) in a 15 L modified transparent carboy. Aeration
133 was provided using an air pump (Aqua One 12000 Precision Air Pump) via an air diffuser placed at
134 the bottom of the carboy. An exhaust tube attached to the lid of the carboy was inserted into a vessel
135 with seawater to prevent overflow and distribution of the airborne microalgal cells. The culture was
136 subjected to 12h/12h light/dark cycles and a photon flux density of 100-200 $\mu\text{mol.photon/m}^2.\text{s}^2$ under

137 LED illumination (Aqua Illumination Hydra 52 HD). The setup was located in a constant temperature
138 room maintained at 22°C.

139 Microalgal growth was monitored by measuring the cell density, dry weight and chlorophyll *a*
140 concentration based on the protocols described by Borowitzka and Moheimani [34]. In brief, the cell
141 density was determined by fixing a sample of *C. vulgaris* with 1% glutaraldehyde and performing
142 microscopic cell counts with a haemocytometer (Neubauer, Germany). For the determination of the
143 dry weight, a 47 mm GF/C filter (Whatman plc, GE Healthcare, Australia) was pre-dried at 100°C in
144 an oven (Labec Pty Ltd, Australia), cooled in a desiccator and weighted. Then, a known volume of
145 microalgal sample was filtered and washed with 0.65M ammonium formate solution to remove salts.
146 This algal filter was heated at 100°C overnight, cooled and re-weighted to calculate the algal dry
147 mass. Chlorophyll *a* was extracted by filtering a microalgal sample (GF/C filter) and incubating the
148 filter in 100% methanol at 4°C in the dark, followed by sonicating and centrifuging at 4000 rpm
149 (Rotanta 460R centrifuge). The absorbance at 666 nm was measured, and the chlorophyll *a*
150 concentration was calculated according to a method described elsewhere [35]. The approximate
151 optical density in the carboy was also determined as an absorbance at a wavelength of 750 nm
152 (Spectronic 200 spectrophotometer). After each of these measurements, the culture was diluted back
153 to approximately 10 L with fresh MLA medium [33].

154 Before each coagulation experiment, the live algal suspensions were diluted with tap water [36] to
155 prepare stable algal turbid waters with initial turbidity of 20 NTU, typically found in South Korea's
156 rivers during algal bloom [37, 38]. The detailed characteristics of the algal turbid water used in this
157 study are shown in Table 1.

158 **Table 1**

159 2.3 Jar-test

160 Standard jar-tests were carried out using a programmable jar-tester (PB-900TM, Phipps and Bird,
161 USA). The coagulant was added to 300 mL of algal turbid water (i.e. initial turbidity of 20 NTU). The
162 turbidity of the algal turbid water was systematically checked before each experiment with a turbidity
163 meter (2100P turbidity meter, Hach, USA) and adjusted to 20 NTU by either diluting with tap water
164 or by adding more algae solution as necessary. Rapid mixing was first applied for 1.5 min (i.e. 200
165 rpm), followed by slow mixing for 20 min at 40 rpm to promote particle collision and thus floc
166 growth, and finally 20 min of quiescent settling. Water samples were collected from 2 cm below the
167 water surface for further measurements. Residual turbidity and zeta potential were directly measured
168 using a turbidity meter and Zetasizer (Malvern Instruments, UK), respectively. Turbidity and zeta

169 potential measurements were run in triplicate using three independent samples. Data presented in this
170 study are the average value with standard error.

171 Jar tests were conducted to define the optimum coagulation parameters (i.e. pH and coagulant dose).
172 Several jar tests were performed at various coagulant dose and pH values, and coagulation
173 performance was determined based on turbidity removal efficiency. For these experiments, the target
174 pH value was reached by titrating with appropriate volumes of either HCl or NaOH solutions (0.1M).

175 2.4 Floc characterization

176 Throughout the coagulation/flocculation process, the dynamic floc size was continuously measured by
177 a laser diffraction instrument (Mastersizer 2000, Malvern, UK). The representative floc size was
178 highlighted by the median equivalent diameter d_{50} , although similar trends for d_{10} and d_{90} floc sizes
179 were also observed (data not shown). The schematic diagram of the on-line monitoring system for
180 dynamic floc size is detailed in a previous study [39].

181 This set of experiments was conducted under the optimum conditions determined during the jar tests.
182 The investigation of floc properties (i.e. strength and regrowth capacity) was carried out in the
183 following stages: initial growth phase, floc breakage and regrowth cycle of the floc. These stages were
184 achieved by applying different mixing conditions: 15 min at 40 rpm (i.e. growth phase), 1 min at 200
185 rpm (aggregated flocs exposed to high shear force to induce breakage) and finally 20 min at 40 rpm
186 (slow mixing to allow potential floc regrowth). These experiments were run in duplicate for each
187 tested coagulant and the data presented are the average value with standard error.

188 To evaluate the strength and regrowth capacity of the flocs, the strength factor (SF) and recovery
189 factor (RF) were calculated as follow [40, 41]:

$$190 \quad SF = \frac{d_2}{d_1} \times 100 \quad (1)$$

$$191 \quad RF = \frac{d_3 - d_2}{d_1 - d_2} \times 100 \quad (2)$$

192 where d_1 is the steady-state floc size at the plateau before breakage, d_2 is the average floc size after
193 breakage, and d_3 is the average floc size after regrowth to a new plateau.

194 The higher the SF value, the more resistant the flocs are to breakage due to shear. Flocs with high SF
195 are thus considered to be stronger than those remaining in the suspension. Similarly, the higher the RF
196 value, the better is the floc ability to regrow after exposure to high shear force.

197 The floc growth rate was also assessed by determining the slope of the rapid growth period, assuming
198 linear growth [42]:

$$199 \text{ Growth rate} = \frac{\Delta_{size}}{\Delta_{time}} \quad (3)$$

200 **3 Results and discussion**

201 3.1 Determination of flocculation region

202 The combined effect of pH and coagulant dose was used to define a 2D region of good flocculation.
203 Flocculation results, in terms of turbidity removal efficiency, were classified into four categories: (i)
204 optimum flocculation conditions with the lowest residual turbidity after flocculation (limit of
205 detection of 0.01 NTU); (ii) good flocculation when the residual turbidity after flocculation was below
206 1 NTU (or turbidity removal efficiency $\geq 95\%$); (iii) insufficient flocculation when the residual
207 turbidity after flocculation was above 1 NTU and (iv) no visible flocculation or residual turbidity after
208 flocculation above 10 NTU.

209 Results in Figure 1 show that the region of good flocculation for both titanium-based coagulants (i.e.
210 TiCl_4 and PTC) is broader compared to the FeCl_3 coagulant. This might be attributed to the formation
211 of reactive hydrolysis species over a broader pH range for these two coagulants. For all three
212 coagulants, pH 7 appears to be the optimum coagulation pH where the lowest residual turbidity was
213 found. This pH falls into the typical pH range found in the main South Korea's rivers [43]. This result
214 is in accordance with our previous study where it was found that, at pH 7, all three coagulants
215 achieved the highest turbidity removal efficiency (i.e. in this study, turbidity was due to the addition
216 of kaolin in synthetic wastewater) [39]. In fact, at this pH, positively charged amorphous hydroxide
217 precipitates are present in high concentrations whereas dissolved cationic hydrolysis species are
218 present at low concentrations. This is in contrast to what occurs at pH 5. *Chlorella vulgaris* has been
219 shown to have a relatively high charge density (i.e. 1.1×10^{-5} neq/cell) [44] and therefore requires a
220 high coagulant demand for complete charge neutralization. As can be seen from the data presented in
221 this study (Table 2), at the coagulant doses tested, charge neutralization of the algal turbid water was
222 not achieved. Therefore, at pH 7, there is not only charge neutralization mechanism but also sweep
223 flocculation, which allows for enmeshment and adsorption of the foulants into and onto the hydroxide
224 precipitates allowing for better turbidity removal at relatively lower dose.

225 For each tested coagulant, insufficient flocculation was observed at dosage lower than 9 mg/L (except
226 for TiCl_4 at pH 5) which differs from previous studies where the optimum coagulant dose for these

227 three coagulants were in the range 8-10 mg/L for the treatment of wastewater containing various
228 concentration of organic compounds and inorganic colloids [23, 39, 45]. This can be attributed to the
229 living algae cells influencing the surface charge by ion transfer across the cell membrane to maintain
230 a negative surface charge, thus remaining stable in suspension [46, 47]. Therefore, high coagulant
231 dosages are necessary to overcome the ion transfer mechanism, leading to more efficient
232 destabilisation. Besides, as discussed in the previous paragraph, the relatively high charge density of
233 *Chlorella vulgaris* requires a high coagulant demand for complete destabilization. These results again
234 suggest that sweep flocculation (i.e. physical entrapment of the algae cells within metal coagulant
235 precipitates formed at high coagulant dose) is involved for the removal of algae from suspension.

236 **Figure 1**

237 Both TiCl_4 and PTC were flocculated readily at any pH with a sufficiently high flocculation dose, in
238 the range 12-20 mg-Ti/L. These results contrast with a previous study on PTC [23] where it was
239 found that pH 9 was the optimum pH in the dosage range 8-10 mg-Ti/L. However, this study focused
240 on the performance of PTC for the removal of humic acid (HA) in synthetic water and thus
241 coagulation mechanisms were most likely different from the ones in the present study. Similarly, it
242 was found in previous studies on TiCl_4 [19, 26] that this coagulant displayed high turbidity removal
243 efficiency under alkaline conditions (i.e. in the pH range 7-9) where TiCl_4 is gradually hydrolysed
244 resulting in better turbidity removal, mainly via charge neutralisation mechanisms. In the present
245 study, the coagulant dose, rather than the pH, seems to play a more important role in the coagulation
246 efficiency.

247 3.2 Coagulation performance: Turbidity removal efficiency and zeta potential

248 The performance of all three coagulants was assessed and compared in terms of turbidity removal
249 efficiency and zeta potential. Results are presented in Figure 2 and Table 2 and show that all tested
250 coagulants achieved very high and similar turbidity removal efficiency (i.e. > 97%) at higher dosage
251 (i.e. > 9 mg/L) suggesting that the coagulant type does not influence removal of algal cells at higher
252 doses. It is interesting to note that TiCl_4 performed better at lower doses (i.e. removal efficiency
253 higher than 70% at each tested dose) as compared to the other two coagulants.

254 **Figure 2**

255 **Table 2**

256
257 Zeta potential measurements are often carried out to assess the changes in floc surface charge to
258 evaluate the ability of a coagulant in destabilizing the constituents in feed water. The changes in floc
259 zeta potential are also generally used to determine which coagulation mechanism is involved (i.e. in
260 terms of charge neutralization or sweep flocculation) [48]. Table 2 shows that, under the optimum

261 conditions defined in section 3.1, the floc zeta potential values after coagulation were -9.5 mV, -12.3
262 mV and -8.3 mV for FeCl₃, TiCl₄ and PTC, respectively. These results suggest that, for the coagulant
263 doses studied, charge neutralisation is unlikely to be the sole mechanism involved in the flocculation
264 of algae for all three coagulants otherwise zeta potential values would have been close to zero after
265 flocculation. These results differ from previous studies on titanium coagulants [19, 23, 26, 49-53]
266 where it was found that the predominant coagulation mechanism for both TiCl₄ and PTC was through
267 charge neutralisation. However, most of these studies were targeting the removal of organic
268 macromolecules during wastewater treatment. The high coagulant dose needed in this study may
269 suggest that sweep flocculation (i.e. adsorption and enmeshment in metal hydroxide precipitates) was
270 also involved in the coagulation of algal cells. In fact, Henderson et al [44] demonstrated that the total
271 charge density of the algae (and associated OM) in water is a better indicator of coagulant demand
272 than other parameters such as density, cell size, cell area, etc. *C. vulgaris* has a relatively high charge
273 density and consequently a high coagulant dose is required to neutralize the charge of the system. The
274 highest removal rate for all three coagulants was observed at pH 7 and relatively high dose (in
275 comparison with previous studies). Under these conditions large concentrations of cationic amorphous
276 hydroxide precipitates are present in the water that can cause sweep flocculation and provide
277 adsorption sites for negatively charged contaminants. The high removal rates at relatively high
278 negative zeta potential values (-8.3 to -12.3) are a consequence of not only charge neutralization but
279 also sweep flocculation mechanisms.

280 3.3 Dynamic variation of floc size, floc breakage and recovery

281 The variation of flocs size for the three coagulants (TiCl₄, FeCl₃ and PTC) was monitored on-line by
282 using a Mastersizer 2000 (Malvern, UK). Results are shown in Figure 3 and Table 3. For the three
283 coagulants, the median equivalent diameter (d_{50}) was measured every 30 seconds. As shown in Figure
284 3, the floc size gradually increased for all three coagulants during the slow mixing phase (i.e. 40 rpm)
285 up to a steady-state size after 7-10 minutes. When a shear force (i.e. increasing the mixing speed up to
286 200 rpm for 1 minute) was introduced, the floc size sharply decreased, resulting in an average floc
287 size of up to 70% smaller than the value at steady-state. When the slow mixing speed was re-
288 established, the floc size remained quite stable and no regrowth was observed for all three coagulants.
289 This confirms that sweep flocculation could be the main mechanism involved in the coagulation of
290 algae since it was demonstrated in previous studies that flocs formed by sweep flocculation had a
291 reduced recovery rate than flocs formed by charge neutralisation [54, 55]. This was previously
292 explained by the differences in the internal bonding structure of flocs [40]. Irreversible breakage was
293 seen as evidence that the flocs formed by sweep flocculation were held together by chemical rather
294 than physical bonds suggesting that chemical bonds (e.g. with carboxyl and phenol groups of organic
295 molecules) do not have the capacity to reform after breakage.

296 **Figure 3**

297 Table 3 shows the floc sizes before and after breakage, the floc growth rate as well as the strength
298 factor (i.e. calculated based on equation (1)) for each tested coagulant. It is clear that both titanium-
299 based coagulants had faster growth rate with larger floc sizes compared to the conventional FeCl_3
300 coagulant (see also Figure 3) which suggests that TiCl_4 and PTC can form larger aggregates in a
301 shorter period of time. The larger floc size obtained with both titanium-based coagulants might be
302 attributed to the larger hydrated radius of titanium compared to iron [56] as well as the fact that
303 titanium has a higher valence in TiCl_4 (i.e. 4 instead of 3 for iron in FeCl_3), resulting in the formation
304 of larger metal precipitates and thus larger flocs. Besides, previous studies (e.g. [39]) also found that
305 flocs formed by Ti-salts are not only larger but also more compact; resulting in better settling
306 performance. This is highly advantageous in terms of capital cost and footprint since a shorter
307 retention time combined with larger and more compact flocs will result in smaller and more compact
308 flocculation and sedimentation units [57]. The floc size at steady-state (i.e. d_1) among all three
309 coagulants varied in the following order: PTC (1310 μm) > TiCl_4 (1195 μm) > FeCl_3 (820 μm), which
310 is slightly larger than the floc size obtained in previous studies with these three coagulants [39, 45].
311 This result is not surprising considering that the size of algae cells is significantly larger than the
312 organic macromolecules (e.g. humic acid) used in previous studies [39, 45]. Besides, the higher
313 coagulant dose used in this study (i.e. compared to previous studies on titanium-based coagulants)
314 may lead to the formation of metal hydroxide precipitates (e.g. $\text{Fe}(\text{OH})_3$ or $\text{Ti}(\text{OH})_4$) which lead to the
315 formation of large aggregates. Finally, it was also demonstrated in previous studies that
316 polysaccharide exudates from the algae may play an important role in their flocculation by bridging
317 together the algal cells and hydroxide precipitates to form large flocs [58].

318 The floc growth rates obtained in this study also diverged from previous studies and are
319 comparatively slower; suggesting that algal cells may need more time to flocculate than other
320 particles. This finding corroborates with a previous study [58] where the flocculation of green algae
321 *C. vulgaris* was compared with both kaolin and natural organic matter (NOM) and it was found that
322 the steady-state floc size was achieved after 4, 6 and 25 minutes for kaolin, NOM and algae,
323 respectively. The difference in floc growth rate can be attributed to steric interactions between loosely
324 bound extracellular organic matter (EOM) which can interfere with the coagulation process [59].

325 **Table 3**

326 Floc strength factor (SF) was calculated using equation (1) to investigate the floc ability to withstand
327 an applied shear force (i.e. increasing the mixing speed to 200 rpm). Results gathered in Table 3 show
328 that the SF of all three coagulants was quite similar with values following the order: FeCl_3 (33.1) >
329 TiCl_4 (27.4) > PTC (27.1). These values are lower than those obtained in previous studies focusing on
330 the removal of organic macromolecules [39, 45] but corroborate with another study which found that

331 algal flocs are much weaker compared to NOM flocs on exposure to increased shear (i.e. > 40 rpm)
332 [58]. These results can also be supported by the larger floc size obtained in this study. In fact, it was
333 demonstrated in previous studies [57, 60] that the larger the flocs, the more they are exposed to
334 microscale energy-dissipating eddies, increasing their breakage potential and leading to smaller SF.

335 Figure 4 shows the particle size distribution (PSD) of the three tested coagulants before and after floc
336 breakage. Analysis of the PSD indicates that the floc size after breakage was 3-3.5 times lower than
337 the original value for all three coagulants. Results also show that the flocs formed by FeCl₃ are
338 polydispersed in size with the presence of finer flocs (i.e. presence of 2 additional main peaks with
339 smaller volume at about 100 and 300 μm). The flocs formed by both PTC and TiCl₄ display a much
340 narrower size distribution but also present peaks with small volume (i.e. less than 2.5%) at smaller
341 sizes (i.e. presence of peaks at about 300 μm and 700 μm for both Ti-coagulants). The presence of
342 fine flocs is not desirable in this process since they tend to remain in suspension after flocculation,
343 which ultimately leads to lower turbidity removal efficiency. In this context, Ti-based coagulants are
344 preferable since the floc size at steady-state presents a much narrower PSD.

345 The analysis of the breakage profile of algal flocs can also provide information on the breakup
346 mechanisms. According to Jarvis et al. [61], there are two mechanisms of floc breakup: surface
347 erosion (slow) and large-scale fragmentation (rapid). Flocs with weak and loose structure will
348 preferentially breakup via fragmentation mechanism whereby flocs split into pieces of comparable
349 size. It is clear from Figure 4 that large-scale fragmentation was the main breakup mechanism since
350 the flocs size was reduced to 200-300 μm with the complete disappearance of the main peak before
351 breakage. These results are supported by the low SF values (i.e. ratio of flocs size before and after
352 breakage) obtained in this study. Finally, it was found that this floc breakage pattern was very similar
353 to the one obtained with NOM + polymer flocs suggesting that EOM, and more specifically polymeric
354 algal EOM, play a significant role in algal flocculation [40].

355 **Figure 4**

356 **Conclusions**

357 In the present study, the performance of Ti-based coagulants (PTC and TiCl₄) was tested and
358 compared with conventional FeCl₃ coagulant for the removal of freshwater algae. The performance
359 was assessed in terms of turbidity removal efficiency, coagulation mechanisms and floc
360 characteristics. The following findings have been drawn from this study:

- 361 1. Both Ti-based coagulants had a broader region of good flocculation in terms of pH and
362 coagulant dose compared to FeCl₃. All three coagulants had to be operated at higher dose in
363 comparison with previous studies based on the removal of organic macromolecules during
364 wastewater treatment.

- 365 2. Zeta potential measurements combined with analysis of the dynamic floc size variation upon
366 exposure to shear force showed a negative surface charge after flocculation and no regrowth
367 of the floc after breakage suggesting that charge neutralisation may not be the sole
368 coagulation mechanism.
- 369 3. Ti-based coagulants produced the largest floc size with the fastest growth rate, which is
370 highly advantageous in terms of compact mixing and sedimentation tanks. The flocs formed
371 by all three coagulants were larger than those formed by the coagulation of organic
372 macromolecules; suggesting that EOM may play a role in the coagulation of algae through
373 bridging mechanisms.

374 **Acknowledgements**

375 This work was supported by the SMEs Partnership Project for strengthening tech-competitiveness
376 funded by Korea Small and Medium Business Administration in 2016 (Grant n° S2317919).

- 378 [1] S.B. Park, Algal blooms hit South Korean rivers, Nature News, 21 (2012).
- 379 [2] A. Srivastava, C.-Y. Ahn, R.K. Asthana, H.-G. Lee, H.-M. Oh, Status, alert system, and prediction
380 of cyanobacterial bloom in South Korea, BioMed research international, (2015).
- 381 [3] H.-Y. Pei, C.-X. Ma, W.-R. Hu, F. Sun, The behaviors of *Microcystis aeruginosa* cells and
382 extracellular microcystins during chitosan flocculation and flocs storage processes, Bioresour.
383 Technol., 151 (2014) 314-322.
- 384 [4] E.S. Beach, M.J. Eckelman, Z. Cui, L. Brentner, J.B. Zimmerman, Preferential technological and
385 life cycle environmental performance of chitosan flocculation for harvesting of the green algae
386 *Neochloris oleoabundans*, Bioresour. Technol., 121 (2012) 445-449.
- 387 [5] M. Ma, R. Liu, H. Liu, J. Qu, W. Jefferson, Effects and mechanisms of pre-chlorination on
388 *Microcystis aeruginosa* removal by alum coagulation: Significance of the released intracellular
389 organic matter, Sep. Purif. Technol., 86 (2012) 19-25.
- 390 [6] W.R. Bare, N.B. Jones, E.J. Middlebrooks, Algae removal using dissolved air flotation, Journal
391 (Water Pollution Control Federation), (1975) 153-169.
- 392 [7] B. Naghavi, R. Malone, Algae removal by fine sand/silt filtration, Water Res., 20 (1986) 377-383.
- 393 [8] X. Sun, C. Wang, Y. Tong, W. Wang, J. Wei, A comparative study of microfiltration and
394 ultrafiltration for algae harvesting, Algal Research, 2 (2013) 437-444.
- 395 [9] H. Sakai, K. Oguma, H. Katayama, S. Ohgaki, Effects of low-or medium-pressure ultraviolet lamp
396 irradiation on *Microcystis aeruginosa* and *Anabaena variabilis*, Water Res., 41 (2007) 11-18.
- 397 [10] L. Heng, N. Jun, H. Wen-jie, L. Guibai, Algae removal by ultrasonic irradiation-coagulation,
398 Desalination, 239 (2009) 191-197.
- 399 [11] S.A. Fast, B. Kokabian, V.G. Gude, Chitosan enhanced coagulation of algal turbid waters-
400 Comparison between rapid mix and ultrasound coagulation methods, Chem. Eng. J., 244 (2014) 403-
401 410.
- 402 [12] J.D. Plummer, J.K. Edzwald, Effect of ozone on algae as precursors for trihalomethane and
403 haloacetic acid production, Environ. Sci. Technol., 35 (2001) 3661-3668.
- 404 [13] J.-J. Chen, H.-H. Yeh, I. Tseng, Effect of ozone and permanganate on algae coagulation
405 removal-Pilot and bench scale tests, Chemosphere, 74 (2009) 840-846.
- 406 [14] C.-D. Wu, X.-J. Xu, J.-L. Liang, Q. Wang, Q. Dong, W.-L. Liang, Enhanced coagulation for
407 treating slightly polluted algae-containing surface water combining polyaluminum chloride (PAC)
408 with diatomite, Desalination, 279 (2011) 140-145.
- 409 [15] S.A.A. Tabatabai, M.D. Kennedy, G.L. Amy, J.C. Schippers, Optimizing inline coagulation to
410 reduce chemical consumption in MF/UF systems, Desalin. Water Treat., 6 (2009) 94-101.
- 411 [16] M. Kane, Conventry Area Sewage Sludge Disposal Scheme: Development of Strategy and
412 Early Operating Experiences, Water and Environment Journal, 1 (1987) 305-314.
- 413 [17] A.M. Nassar, M. Smith, S. Afifi, Palestinian experience with sewage sludge utilizing reed beds,
414 Water and Environment Journal, 23 (2009) 75-82.
- 415 [18] H. Shon, S. Vigneswaran, I.S. Kim, J. Cho, G. Kim, J. Kim, J.H. Kim, Preparation of Titanium
416 Dioxide (TiO₂) from Sludge Produced by Titanium Tetrachloride (TiCl₄) Flocculation of Wastewater,
417 Environ. Sci. Technol., 41 (2007) 1372-1377.
- 418 [19] Y. Zhao, B. Gao, B. Cao, Z. Yang, Q. Yue, H. Shon, J.-H. Kim, Comparison of coagulation
419 behavior and floc characteristics of titanium tetrachloride (TiCl₄) and polyaluminum chloride (PACl)
420 with surface water treatment, Chem. Eng. J., 166 (2011) 544-550.
- 421 [20] H. Shon, S. Vigneswaran, J. Kandasamy, M. Zareie, J. Kim, D. Cho, J.-H. Kim, Preparation and
422 characterization of titanium dioxide (TiO₂) from sludge produced by TiCl₄ flocculation with FeCl₃,
423 Al₂(SO₄)₃ and Ca(OH)₂ coagulant aids in wastewater, Sep. Sci. Technol., 44 (2009) 1525-1543.
- 424 [21] B. Lee, S. Kim, H. Shon, S. Vigneswaran, S. Kim, J. Cho, I.S. Kim, K. Choi, J. Kim, H. Park,
425 Aquatic toxicity evaluation of TiO₂ nanoparticle produced from sludge of TiCl₄ flocculation of
426 wastewater and seawater, J. Nanopart. Res., 11 (2009) 2087-2096.
- 427 [22] Y. Okour, H. Shon, I. El Saliby, R. Naidu, J. Kim, J.-H. Kim, Preparation and characterisation of
428 titanium dioxide (TiO₂) and thiourea-doped titanate nanotubes prepared from wastewater flocculated
429 sludge, Bioresour. Technol., 101 (2010) 1453-1458.

430 [23] Y. Zhao, S. Phuntsho, B. Gao, X. Huang, Q. Qi, Q. Yue, Y. Wang, J.-H. Kim, H. Shon,
431 Preparation and Characterization of Novel Polytitanium Tetrachloride Coagulant for Water
432 Purification, *Environ. Sci. Technol.*, 47 (2013) 12966-12975.

433 [24] M.R. Hoffmann, S.T. Martin, W. Choi, D.W. Bahnemann, Environmental applications of
434 semiconductor photocatalysis, *Chem. Rev.*, 95 (1995) 69-96.

435 [25] T.N. Obee, R.T. Brown, TiO₂ photocatalysis for indoor air applications: effects of humidity and
436 trace contaminant levels on the oxidation rates of formaldehyde, toluene, and 1, 3-butadiene, *Environ.*
437 *Sci. Technol.*, 29 (1995) 1223-1231.

438 [26] Y.X. Zhao, B.Y. Gao, H.K. Shon, B.C. Cao, J.H. Kim, Coagulation characteristics of titanium
439 (Ti) salt coagulant compared with aluminum (Al) and iron (Fe) salts, *J. Hazard. Mater.*, 185 (2011)
440 1536-1542.

441 [27] J. Emsley, *Nature's building blocks: an AZ guide to the elements*, Oxford University Press, 2011.

442 [28] Environmental Health Criteria 24: Titanium, in, World Health Organization, 1982.

443 [29] Y.-F. Wu, W. Liu, N.-Y. Gao, T. Tao, A study of titanium sulfate flocculation for water
444 treatment, *Water Res.*, 45 (2011) 3704-3711.

445 [30] D. Haass, W. Tanner, Regulation of hexose transport in *Chlorella vulgaris* Characteristics of
446 induction and turnover, *Plant Physiol.*, 53 (1974) 14-20.

447 [31] T.J. Smayda, Harmful algal blooms: their ecophysiology and general relevance to phytoplankton
448 blooms in the sea, *Limnology and oceanography*, 42 (1997) 1137-1153.

449 [32] P. Gorham, J. McLachlan, U. Hammer, W. Kim, Isolation and culture of toxic strains of
450 *Anabaena flos-aquae* (Lyngb.) de Bréb, *Verhandlungen des Internationalen Verein Limnologie*, 15
451 (1964) 796-804.

452 [33] C.J. Bolch, S.I. Blackburn, Isolation and purification of Australian isolates of the toxic
453 cyanobacterium *Microcystis aeruginosa* Kütz, *J. Appl. Phycol.*, 8 (1996) 5-13.

454 [34] M.A. Borowitzka, N.R. Moheimani, *Algae for biofuels and energy*, Springer, 2013.

455 [35] M. Henriques, A. Silva, J. Rocha, Extraction and quantification of pigments from a marine
456 microalga: a simple and reproducible method, *Communicating Current Research and Educational*
457 *Topics and Trends in Applied Microbiology Formatex*, (2007) 586-593.

458 [36] *Water analysis: Potts Hill water supply system in, Sydney Water*, 2016.

459 [37] D.K. KIM, K.S. JEONG, P.A. Whigham, G.J. JOO, Winter diatom blooms in a regulated river in
460 South Korea: explanations based on evolutionary computation, *Freshwater biology*, 52 (2007) 2021-
461 2041.

462 [38] K.-S. Jeong, F. Recknagel, G.-J. Joo, Prediction and elucidation of population dynamics of the
463 blue-green algae *Microcystis aeruginosa* and the diatom *Stephanodiscus hantzschii* in the Nakdong
464 River-Reservoir System (South Korea) by a recurrent artificial neural network, in: *Ecological*
465 *Informatics*, Springer, 2006, pp. 255-273.

466 [39] L. Chekli, J. Galloux, Y. Zhao, B. Gao, H. Shon, Coagulation performance and floc
467 characteristics of polytitanium tetrachloride (PTC) compared with titanium tetrachloride (TiCl₄) and
468 iron salts in humic acid-kaolin synthetic water treatment, *Sep. Purif. Technol.*, 142 (2015) 155-161.

469 [40] P. Jarvis, B. Jefferson, S.A. Parsons, Breakage, regrowth, and fractal nature of natural organic
470 matter flocs, *Environ. Sci. Technol.*, 39 (2005) 2307-2314.

471 [41] M.A. Yukselen, J. Gregory, Breakage and re-formation of alum flocs, *Environ. Eng. Sci.*, 19
472 (2002) 229-236.

473 [42] F. Xiao, P. Yi, X.-R. Pan, B.-J. Zhang, C. Lee, Comparative study of the effects of experimental
474 variables on growth rates of aluminum and iron hydroxide flocs during coagulation and their
475 structural characteristics, *Desalination*, 250 (2010) 902-907.

476 [43] H. Chang, Spatial analysis of water quality trends in the Han River basin, South Korea, *Water*
477 *Res.*, 42 (2008) 3285-3304.

478 [44] R. Henderson, S. Parsons, B. Jefferson, Successful removal of algae through the control of zeta
479 potential, *Sep. Sci. Technol.*, 43 (2008) 1653-1666.

480 [45] J. Galloux, L. Chekli, S. Phuntsho, L. Tijng, S. Jeong, Y. Zhao, B. Gao, S. Park, H. Shon,
481 Coagulation performance and floc characteristics of polytitanium tetrachloride and titanium
482 tetrachloride compared with ferric chloride for coal mining wastewater treatment, *Sep. Purif.*
483 *Technol.*, 152 (2015) 94-100.

484 [46] A. Pieterse, A. Cloot, Algal cells and coagulation, flocculation and sedimentation processes,
485 Water Sci. Technol., 36 (1997) 111-118.

486 [47] Z. Ulberg, L. Marochko, The electrophoretic properties and stability of the cell suspensions,
487 Colloids Surf., A, 159 (1999) 513-518.

488 [48] J. Gregory, J. Duan, Hydrolyzing metal salts as coagulants, Pure Appl. Chem., 73 (2001) 2017-
489 2026.

490 [49] Y. Zhao, B. Gao, H. Shon, J.-H. Kim, Q. Yue, Effect of shear force, solution pH and breakage
491 period on characteristics of flocs formed by Titanium tetrachloride (TiCl₄) and Polyaluminum
492 chloride (PACl) with surface water treatment, J. Hazard. Mater., 187 (2011) 495-501.

493 [50] Y. Zhao, B. Gao, H. Shon, J.-H. Kim, Q. Yue, Y. Wang, Floc characteristics of titanium
494 tetrachloride (TiCl₄) compared with aluminum and iron salts in humic acid-kaolin synthetic water
495 treatment, Sep. Purif. Technol., 81 (2011) 332-338.

496 [51] Y. Zhao, B. Gao, G. Zhang, S. Phuntsho, Y. Wang, Q. Yue, Q. Li, H. Shon, Comparative study
497 of floc characteristics with titanium tetrachloride against conventional coagulants: Effect of coagulant
498 dose, solution pH, shear force and break-up period, Chem. Eng. J., 233 (2013) 70-79.

499 [52] Y. Zhao, B. Gao, G. Zhang, Q. Qi, Y. Wang, S. Phuntsho, J.-H. Kim, H. Shon, Q. Yue, Q. Li,
500 Coagulation and sludge recovery using titanium tetrachloride as coagulant for real water treatment: A
501 comparison against traditional aluminum and iron salts, Sep. Purif. Technol., 130 (2014) 19-27.

502 [53] Y. Zhao, H. Shon, S. Phuntsho, B. Gao, Removal of natural organic matter by titanium
503 tetrachloride: The effect of total hardness and ionic strength, Journal of Environmental Management,
504 134 (2014) 20-29.

505 [54] M. Aguilar, J. Saez, M. Llorens, A. Soler, J. Ortuno, Microscopic observation of particle
506 reduction in slaughterhouse wastewater by coagulation-flocculation using ferric sulphate as coagulant
507 and different coagulant aids, Water Res., 37 (2003) 2233-2241.

508 [55] P. Jarvis, B. Jefferson, S. Parsons, The duplicity of floc strength, Water Science & Technology,
509 50 (2004) 63-70.

510 [56] E. Nightingale Jr, Phenomenological theory of ion solvation. Effective radii of hydrated ions,
511 The Journal of Physical Chemistry, 63 (1959) 1381-1387.

512 [57] M. Boller, S. Blaser, Particles under stress, Water Sci. Technol., 37 (1998) 9-29.

513 [58] R. Henderson, E. Sharp, P. Jarvis, S. Parsons, B. Jefferson, Identifying the linkage between
514 particle characteristics and understanding coagulation performance, Water science and technology:
515 water supply, 6 (2006) 31-38.

516 [59] H. Bernhardt, O. Hoyer, H. Schell, B. Lüsse, Reaction mechanisms involved in the influence of
517 algogenic organic matter on flocculation, Zeitschrift für Wasser-und Abwasser-Forschung, 18 (1985)
518 18-30.

519 [60] D. Thomas, S. Judd, N. Fawcett, Flocculation modelling: a review, Water Res., 33 (1999) 1579-
520 1592.

521 [61] P. Jarvis, B. Jefferson, J. Gregory, S.A. Parsons, A review of floc strength and breakage, Water
522 Res., 39 (2005) 3121-3137.