

Becoming a Bilingual School: Perspectives of L2FLS Teachers & Principals

Ingrid Weiss

**A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
University of Technology Sydney**

2016

DEDICATION PAGE

This thesis is dedicated to my mother who loved languages, and due to growing up in Argentina in a Swiss family, became fluent in three languages from a young age.

Mutti loved languages and lived in three continents during her lifetime: in two as a language 2 first language speaker (L2FLS). She attended a bilingual school in her primary and high school years and felt Australia should promote and encourage L2 skills in the school system from an early age.

L2FLS teachers and Bilingual Schools are the focus in this thesis. I am saddened Mutti was not able to live to see me complete this thesis but her spirit, passion and love have enabled me to get to the finish and add to the continually expanding body of Australian L2 bilingual school research.

CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP/ ORIGINALITY

I certify that the work in this thesis has not been previously submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Student: _____

Date: _____

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Completing my doctoral journey is overwhelming, an experience of both relief and jubilation. The road to completion was extremely challenging and requires the acknowledgement of those who inspired and assisted along the way.

Firstly, Dr Tony Holland, Dr David Taylor, Dr Clive Chappell and Dr Jennifer Hammond, all exemplary teachers during my Masters course work in Adult Education and Research who stimulated my desire to do a doctorate. Jennifer Hammond was a guiding force in my pilot study which lead to my doctoral proposal. The initial participants in my pilot study were my motivation to continue working in this field. A grand thank you to the teachers and Principals who gave their precious time freely and without whose support and input there would be no research.

My supervisor these past four years, Dr Terry Royce, has been a powerful guide and mentor, who understood and empathised when life's challenges were difficult. His style of supervision, gave me confidence to make all the major research decisions, whilst simultaneously empowering me to trust myself. Emotionally, I feel I may not have completed this journey were it not for Terry's positive feedback, kind nature and patience.

There have also been some intermittent, short term guides during my candidature, such as my initial supervisor, Dr Lesley Ljungdahl whose warmth and kindness are second to none and who along with the UTS Community of Scholars and fellow first year FASS cohort, made the first year of this course less daunting. A special thank you extends to Dr Kitty te Riele, the facilitator 'extraordinaire' of the FASS cohort, who organised the monthly doctoral program workshops, meetings and group debriefs. It was invaluable to meet so many amazing fellow PhD students at UTS and at other student conferences. I thank them for their advice and encouragement during my candidature, particularly Katrina Waite, Prue Salter and Lorraine Beveridge.

Dr David Cole, my supervisor for a short period before his relocation to the University of Western Sydney, was extremely helpful with suggestions after reading my work and provided feedback prior to and after my Doctoral Assessment.

My candidature was emotionally a roller coaster as in the first phase I lost my father and in the last phase I lost my mother. My mother lived with me for many years and caring for her daily, spending precious time together before her death was of utmost importance to me. Emotionally, from a family perspective, and being divorced it was taxing as my only sibling lives interstate and my only son, Dane works overseas. However, my angel hearted son, Dane, assisted me emotionally to stay strong via regular, weekly mother/son phone calls. I am also indebted to all those who understood the road I was travelling and provided up building words and actions. I am thankful to the University of Technology Sydney for granting me leave of absence at these times, during my part-time phase and later during my full-time phase.

After a harrowing time, when returning to complete my research, I was blessed with encountering the kind heartedness of Jennifer Rocco, who despite being at a crossroad in her life, shared her time, friendship and assisted with transcribing Phase 2 interviews. I deeply appreciate her thoroughness and valuable contribution. My heartfelt gratitude also extends to my brother, Paul and my good friend Cheryl Edwards who each read a chapter of my work and gave me valuable feedback. Additionally, I highly appreciate the editorial assistance of Dr Terry Fitzgerald in the last two months before work submission.

Finally, I wish to thank the University of Technology Sydney for the financial support via an UTS doctoral scholarship for 2.5 years of PhD candidature and for student funds to participate and present my research work at an interstate AARE conference. I am extremely proud of being given the opportunity to undertake this higher research degree at such a forward thinking, progressive university.

.

CONTENTS

DEDICATION PAGE.....	II
CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP/ ORIGINALITY	III
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	IV
CONTENTS	VI
LIST OF TABLES & FIGURES	XII
ABBREVIATIONS	XIII
ABSTRACT	XIV
CHAPTER 1: L2FLS TEACHERS IN NSW PRIMARY SCHOOLS	1
1.1 Perspective is Subjective	1
1.2 Background.....	2
1.3 Aim of the Research	4
1.4 The Research Challenge	6
Teacher lived-world change.....	6
Teacher Knowledge and Pedagogy.....	7
Collegial bilingual/monolingual partnerships.....	7
1.5 The Significance of the Study	7
Significance for Teachers	8
Significance for Staffing Procedures.....	9
Significance for Teacher Training.....	10
Significance for Policy Development	11
Significance for School Community	11
1.6 Outline of the Thesis	11
CHAPTER 2: LANGUAGES, TEACHERS & BILINGUAL EDUCATION.....	14

2.1 Introduction.....	14
2.2 Why Focus on Bilingual L2FLS Teachers?	15
2.3 Teachers in NSW and Languages Background	16
2.4 Languages Policies and Initiatives in Australia	18
The Global Context and Trends	19
Languages History in Australia and the Asian Languages Strategy	19
L2 and Bilingual Education in Australia.....	21
Contextualizing Bilingual Education in NSW	22
2.5 Bilingual Teachers.....	28
Who are They?	28
Primary Teacher Conversion Courses for Overseas Trained Teachers.....	29
2.6 The L2s: Chinese, Japanese, Korean, French.....	30
Chinese	30
Japanese.....	31
Korean	32
French	32
2.7 Terms of Reference	33
Bilingual, Bilingualism; Multilingualism; Balanced Bilingualism.....	33
Bilingual Education, Immersion Programs and Bilingual Programs	34
Categorisation by Enrolment.....	37
Community Language Programs and Languages Other than English (LOTE)	37
Native Speakers; Background Speakers; Heritage Languages.....	38
Curriculum, Key Learning Areas and Pedagogy/Bilingual Pedagogy.....	39
2.8 The Language Methodology Debates.....	42
2.9 Chapter 2 Summary.....	43
CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY.....	45

3.1 Introduction.....	45
3.2 Methodology	46
3.3 Research Timeline	50
The Project Initiation	51
3.4 Research Approach.....	53
Narrative Style	58
Phenomenography Approach.....	59
Thematic Coding	60
3.5 Study Design and Enactment.....	60
Stakeholders	61
Research Sites	62
Recruitment	64
3.6 Data Generation	66
Interviews	66
3.7 Ethical Considerations	72
3.8 Data Analysis Methods.....	74
3.9 The Participants.....	82
The L2FLS Teachers.....	82
The Principals.....	86
The School Environments	86
3.10 Chapter 3 Summary.....	87
CHAPTER 4: THE SCHOOL VOICE	88
4.1 Introduction.....	88
4.2 Narrative Context: Overview	88
4.3 The Value of Narrative in the Teaching Profession.....	89
How the story is told.....	91

4.4 The Narrative Sketch: Who Tells What and Why	92
The Contextual Aspect: Work Environment and Staffing.....	93
The Framework: The Bilingual Programs 2012-13	96
Teacher Attitudes	103
Classroom Pedagogy.....	104
Teacher Professional Development.....	105
4.5 Narrative Inquiry Structure Summary	108
CHAPTER 5: CHANGE AND EMPOWERMENT – SCHOOL 1	110
5.1 Introduction.....	110
5.2 The Voices of School 1.....	110
5.3 Naseba Naru – The Bilingual School Journey of School 1	111
5.4 If You Take Action - 2012.....	113
5.5 It Will Become - 2013	117
5.6 The School 1 Story Summary.....	121
CHAPTER 6: COLLEGIAL HARMONY - SCHOOL 2	123
6.1 Introduction.....	123
6.2 The Voices of School 2.....	124
6.3 Dduhsi itnuhn kose kiri itda –The Bilingual School Journey of School 2.....	124
6.4 In a Place Where There’s a Will – 2012	130
6.5 There is a Road - 2013	132
6.6 The School 2 Story Summary.....	136
CHAPTER 7: PEDAGOGICAL CHALLENGES - SCHOOL 3.....	138
7.1 Introduction.....	138
7.2 The Voices of School 3.....	138
7.3 Wàn shì kāi tóu nán: Difficult before easy	139
7.4 Wàn shì kāi – All things are difficult - 2012	144

7.5 Tóu nán - Before they are easy - 2013	149
7.6 The School 3 Story Summary	153
CHAPTER 8: AUTONOMY, OR A COLLECTIVE VOICE – SCHOOL 4.....	156
8.1 Introduction.....	156
8.2 The Narrative of Old: Sought Destinations	159
Resultant Discordance	179
8.3 The Narrative of the New: Renovations of the Old.....	180
8.4 The School 4 Story Summary.....	193
CHAPTER 9: L2FLS TEACHERS’ EXPERIENCE OF ADAPTING.....	195
9.1 Introduction.....	195
9.2 L2FLS Phase 1.....	196
9.3 Data Generation for the Phenomenographic Approach	197
Participants	197
The Questions	198
9.4 Phenomenographic Data Analysis.....	199
Section 1 – The Five Categories in the Asian Teacher Group	200
Section 2 – The Seven Categories in the French Teacher Group	200
9.5 The Manner of Adapting to Bilingual Teaching.....	201
Asian L2 Bilingual Schools	202
French L2FLS Teachers.....	213
9.6 Phenomenographical Analysis Conclusions	229
CHAPTER 10: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION.....	233
10.1 Introduction.....	233
10.2 The L2FLS Teacher Experience	237
Teachers Lived World Change	238
Bilingual Pedagogy.....	246

Collegiality.....	252
Key Points from the Experience of Adapting.....	256
Key Variation Between L2FLS groups	259
10.3 The Principals’ Experiences	260
Bureaucratic Issues	261
10.4 Research Implications, Limitations and Recommendations	262
Utilisation of L2FLS teachers and State Registry	264
Bilingual Professional Development of Teachers and Leaders.....	264
10.5 Policy Amendments.....	268
10.6 Conclusion	269
REFERENCES	270
APPENDIX A ETHICS APPROVAL.....	282
APPENDIX B RESEARCH TOOLS.....	284
Appendix B1 Questionnaire.....	284
Appendix B2 Teacher Interview 1	286
Questions	286
Appendix B3 Principal Interview 1	287
Questions	287
Appendix B4 Teacher Interview 2	288
Questions	288
Appendix B5 Principal Interview 2	290
Questions	290
APPENDIX C: LETTERS TO SCHOOL PRINCIPALS	292
APPENDIX D: INFORMATION SHEETS.....	294
APPENDIX E: CONSENT FORM	296
APPENDIX F: COMPUTER SOFTWARE	298

List of TABLES & FIGURES

Table 1 Phenomenographic Analysis Group	84
Table 2 L2 Teachers - Phase 1 and 2	85
Table 3 Principals	86
Table 4 Demographics of Schools	94
Table 5 School Staff and Pupil Logistics	96
Table 6 School Bilingual Education Programs	100
Figure 9.1 Asian L2FLS Category Structural Variations	212
Figure 9.2 French L2FLS Category Structural Variations	228

ABBREVIATIONS

ABS	Australian Bureau of Statistics
ACARA	Australian Curriculum, Assessment and Reporting Authority
ACER	Australian Council for Educational Research
AITSL	Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership
AITSL	Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership
BOSTES	(Board of Studies Teaching & Educational Standards
BSP	Bilingual School Program
CESE	Centre for Educational Statistics and Evaluation
CLIL	Content and Language Integrated Learning
CPL	Community Languages Programs
DEECD	Department of Education and Early Childhood Development
DEEWR	Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations
DEST	Department of Education Science and Training
DoE	Department of Education
EALD	English an Additional Languages/Dialect
ESL	English as a Second Language
FLL	First Language Learner
FLS	First Language Speaker
HREC	Human Research Ethics Clearance
KLA	Key Learning Area
L1	Language 1
L2	Language 2
L2FLS	Language 2 First Language Speaker
L2SLS	L2 Second Language Speaker
LBOTE	Language Background Other Than English
LOTE	Languages Other Than English
MCEETYA	Ministerial Council on Education, Employment, Training & Youth Affairs
NALSSP	National Asian Languages and Studies in School Program
NAPLAN	National Assessment Program – Literacy and Numeracy
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PEAT	The Professional English Assessment for Teachers
PISA	Program for International Student Assessment
PS	Public School
RFF	Relief from Face to Face
SERAP	State Education Research Applications Process
SES	Socio-economic Status
SLA	Second Language Acquisition
SLL	Second Language Learner
TESOL	Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages

ABSTRACT

This thesis explores the experiences of teachers who are new to bilingual education in the NSW government, primary school settings and their adaptation to bilingual teaching and learning. The core group of eleven teachers are Language 2 First Language Speakers (L2FLS) with less than four years' work experience in public bilingual schools. All the teachers completed their schooling overseas. The study also involved five Principals, four bilingual schools and seven other L2 school staff participants.

In addition to investigating how L2FLS teachers experience adapting to their new roles, the research examines the process of becoming a bilingual school from the perspective of the Principals, and L2 support staff. A contrast is made between three schools that are using a partial-immersion content and language integrated learning (CLIL) approach, and a fourth school which is using a Principal-devised bilingual program.

The study is longitudinal as it captures two specific snapshots of teachers' and Principals' views, 2012 and 2013, spaced a year apart, via individual interviews. A dual qualitative methodological approach of developmental phenomenography and narrative inquiry is employed for the data analysis. The L2FLS teacher's views are presented via phenomenographic analyses, and the multiplicity of voices provided by the Principals' and other L2 teachers' perspectives are reflected via narrative inquiry. The main foci of discussion in the thesis are the similarities and variations between the conclusions of the two data sources. The study adds discussion to the theory of the 'nature of awareness' conceived by Marton and Booth (1997) and theories relating to teacher agency and change such as the Language Teacher Conceptual Change framework developed by Kubanyiova 2012.

The research findings highlight the need for improved utilisation and CLIL training of L2FLS and bilingual class teachers for better student L2 outcomes. Other recommendations are the provision of State K-6 bilingual curricula; minimum 7.5 hours per week of L2; ongoing, regular professional development in bilingual pedagogy for bilingual school staff; mentoring of new L2FLS and provision of L2 competent supervisors

at each school; and bilingual leadership training. State or Regional jurisdictions also need to provide thorough preparation of school staff transitioning to become bilingual schools.

The research concludes by proposing the establishment of a state registry of NSW teachers' L2 skills; and basic pre-service teacher training in L2 pedagogy. The L2FLS recommendation is for an amendment to the Department of Education (DoE) policy which is discriminatory by requiring L1 accreditation from teachers who have completed L1 university degrees, and that bilingual schools should be staffed with bilingual teachers.

Keywords: Bilingual, primary school, elementary, L2 teachers, CLIL programs