World Cities, Translocality and Gender in Financial Service Economies:

Women Professionals and Changing Chinese Lives in China, Hong Kong and Australia

Wai-wan Chan (陳惠雲)
School of International Studies
Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences
University of Technology Sydney
Australia

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy, at the University of Technology Sydney, Australia

2017
Certificate of Original Authorship

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Student:

Date: 18 January 2017
Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I would like to acknowledge the love and support I received from my parents and husband. Stepping onto the plane to commence my journey to Australia to begin my PhD was very difficult for me. I was still grieving after a tragic personal loss and my father was enduring ongoing treatment to deal with cancer, which left him exhausted. My family felt overwhelmed with challenges and difficulties, and I was struggling with deep, conflicting emotions. It was my parents’ deep love and my husband’s unfailing support that made my journey possible.

I acknowledge with gratitude the support I received from the Australian Postgraduate Award and the International Postgraduate Research Scholarship, both funded by the Australian Government’s Department of Innovation, Industry, Science and Research. I would like to express my special gratitude to my supervisor, Prof. Carolyn Cartier for her constructive comments on my proposal which was the basis of my receiving the Award and Scholarship mentioned above. Many thanks to Prof. Cartier’s continued support during my four years of research and learning. I learned a lot from her sagacious examination of my work and the resultant guidance on academic ideas. Her great dedication to research on China is remarkable! I also deeply appreciate the help I received from my alternate supervisor, Prof. Elaine Jeffreys. Her timely support and concern were inspirational. Her deep comments and suggestions were vital.

In Australia, I am especially grateful to Prof. Peter Drake for his consistent support and his great help in finding Chinese women bankers for my interviews. I deeply appreciate his genuine care of foreign students like me and his warm friendship. My special thanks also go to Dr. Ian Maclean who I met at the Australia China Investment Relationship Conference in Canberra in 2012. He gave me his well-thought-out comments on my research ideas and kindly referred me to his colleague Prof. Milind Sathye at the University of Canberra. Prof. Milind Sathye gave me very detailed and constructive comments and suggestions on my initial research proposal. I will never forget their generosity in sharing their expertise with me.
I am also indebted to Ms. Daphne Lowe Kelley at the Chinese Heritage Association of Australia; Dr. Don Stammer; Mr. Simon Stokes; Ms. Debra Hazelton and Ms. Carolyne Yeow at Mizuho Corporate Bank; and Ms. Lyndell Fraser and Mr. Robyn Thomas at Navitas Limited. Their kind referrals and great support helped make it possible to conduct my interviews in Australia. Thanks go out to Ms. Virginia MacDonald and Ms. Carol Au at the Information Department of the Reserve Bank of Australia who provided me with valuable information from their archives. Their professionalism and their unconditional support of my research on Chinese women bankers in Australia was exceptional.

I would also like to thank professors and colleagues at the University of Technology Sydney for providing a warm, intellectual, learning environment. I am deeply thankful to Prof. Maurizio Marinelli (former Director of the Chinese Research Centre) and Prof. Guo Yingjie (now located in the University of Sydney) for their kindness in granting me opportunities to attend conferences in Melbourne and Canberra. These proved invaluable in helping me build local networks and find suitable respondents in Australia.

I am indebted to Dr. Devleena Ghosh, Dr. Chongyi Feng and Dr. Mi Shih for their valuable comments and suggestions to my research proposal when they served as panel members for my PhD candidature assessment in 2013. Dr. Christina Ho and Dr. Hilary Yerbury read some of my work. Their inspired comments and suggestions helped strengthen my arguments. Thanks also go to Prof. Andrew Jakubowicz who shared his articles on ethnic communities in Sydney with me; and Dr. Colin Hawes who shared his article on Chinese banking markets. Their research papers helped me to rethink some of the conceptual ideas for my thesis. Many thanks also go to Prof. Anita Chan, Prof. Waning Sun, Dr. Lai-ha Chan, Dr. Jingqing Yang and Dr. Hu De (visiting scholar from the East China Normal University). They showed personal concern and encouraged me during conversations over the meals or when we ran into each other in the office. Thanks also go to Ms. Liang Ming and Ms. Claire Moore at the Faculty of Arts and Social Science for providing administrative support.
My special thanks and deep appreciation go to Laurence Stevens for his excellent proofreading. His work demonstrated a competent understanding of the text and his passion for language. His professionalism, especially his willingness to do extra work to get the job done on time, and his genuine concern for my well-being as a PhD student truly impressed me.

I am also grateful for many friends and peers in Sydney for their warm friendship and emotional support during the past four years. Kevin Lin and Yichi Zhang shared a house with my husband and I for many months. They helped with expenses, which was especially appreciated when my scholarship finished, and shared in both stimulating discussions and home-made fun and laughs. Their friendship and example encouraged me during long periods of writing. The friendship, support and enriching ideas of Wang Pan, Zhou Shan, Chen Minglu, Chen Shuxia, Lei Wei, Gao Yu, Sophie Wang, Natalie Galea, John Roberts, Cheng Mingming, Chen Jiandong, Miguel Martínez and Tan Ming are much appreciated.

In Sydney, I am also grateful for the unselfish help and the family-like warmth from the Gao family: Mike, Carol, Chloe and Jayden. With their help, my husband and I settled into our new life in a new country. I will always cherish the joyful nights spent at their house. Also, the warm Christian love from my friends in the local community of Jehovah’s Witnesses is a great source of encouragement and happiness, for which I am most grateful.

In Hong Kong, my special thanks go to Prof. Chan Kwok-bun, my former supervisor whom I first came to know during my undergraduate days when he taught migration studies in 2001. Over the years, I have received unfailing support, concern, and encouragement from him. He gave me many valuable intellectual insights and much guidance. I am deeply moved by his passion for sociology and his staunch love and trust in his students.
Thanks go out to my good friends Erica Choi and Hakan Ng in Hong Kong for their support. For more than 20 years, their unshakable friendship and deep understanding have touched my heart.

My thanks also go to Auntie Chow, Iris Lam, Xiaoying, Yilian Chan, Sunny Ng, Qizhi Hong, Chohong Choi, Hayes Tang, Ross Cheung and Dick Chong in Hong Kong. Their kind referrals and other various help greatly helped me to complete my interviews in Hong Kong.

In mainland China, I am very grateful to Prof. Li Xiyuan at Sun Yat-sen University. She gave me constructive comments for my Chinese journal article. She provided the opportunity for me to present my initial findings at a conference held at her university and referred me to her former students working in banks. I truly appreciate her most valuable support and help. I am also indebted to Prof. Sun Dongchun at South China University of Technology and Dr. Victor Pan in Guangzhou. Without their kind referrals, it would have been extremely difficult for me to find so many women bankers to interview in China.

As I mentioned, I owe my deepest gratitude to my parents. I still vividly remember the last, short phone conversation with my father before he fell into a sleep he is yet to awake from. I will cherish his deep love for me and his indomitable spirit, which will always remain a great source of strength helping me to persist and to deal with life’s challenges. My mother’s deep, self-sacrificing love and her unshakable belief in her four children is at the core of my family’s unity. My three older brothers and my sisters-in-law consistently show me heartfelt care and support. They cared for my parents when I was away from home. For this, I am deeply indebted to them.

My special thanks also go to my husband’s family in Indonesia. I always received a lot of gifts from my parents-in-law, my brothers-in-law (Hayanto and Donal). Their love and support is deeply appreciated. My husband, Riky Hidajat always stood by me. During my bouts of ill-health, and especially during two years of shuttling between Sydney and
Hong Kong to visit my father in hospital, his unshakable love, patience, support and care helped me to successfully navigate this stage of my life journey.

I gained a deep understanding of the emerging feminisation of the financial industry in the Asia-Pacific through my PhD research. I firmly believe that all sociological studies must come from life, and then return to where they have come from to improve life. I acknowledge and express my gratitude to all those that have helped me accomplish this goal.

I have had three journal articles from my thesis chapters published, one in English and two in Chinese. These appear in *Cosmopolitan Civil Societies Journal* (Australia), *Studies on Hong Kong and Macao* (China) and *Hong Kong and Macau Affairs* (Hong Kong):


# Table of Contents

Acknowledgements ....................................................................................................................... iii

List of Tables and Figures .............................................................................................................. x

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................ xi

Chapter 1. Introduction ................................................................................................................. 1
  1.1 World Cities and Global Cities............................................................................................... 2
  1.2 Globalised Economic Space, Transnationalism and Translocality ....................................... 5
  1.3 Gendered Banking Industry.................................................................................................... 8
  1.4 Research Subjects and Research Focus ............................................................................... 10
  1.5 Conceptualisation and Approach: An Integrative Framework ............................................. 15
  1.6 Content and Organisation .................................................................................................. 17

Chapter 2. Research Localities and Research Methodology ......................................................... 22
  2.1 Global and Transnational Finance Centres: Hong Kong, Shanghai and Sydney as Three Main Research Sites .............................................................................................................. 23
  2.2 Research Methodology: Qualitative Research .................................................................... 28
  2.3 Respondents’ Demographic and Work Background ............................................................ 31

Chapter 3. Locality, Power and Career Opportunity .................................................................... 40
  3.1 Transformation and Opportunity in Australia ..................................................................... 41
  3.2 Place-based Impression Management and Politics of Ethnicity in Hong Kong .................... 49
  3.3 Power Hierarchy of City and Personal Recognition in Mainland China ............................... 63
  3.4 Conclusions ..................................................................................................................... 72

Chapter 4. City Connectivity, Mobility and Translocality ............................................................ 75
  4.1 Globalised Economic Space, Transnationalism and Translocality ...................................... 77
  4.2 Global Connectedness: Women Bankers as Mobile Travellers .......................................... 85
  4.3 Local, Non-local and Translocal Politics ............................................................................. 94
  4.4 Conclusions ..................................................................................................................... 109

Chapter 5. Workplace, Culture and Career Mobility: Gender Dynamics in Banks ..................... 111
  5.1 Gender Identity and Gender Politics .................................................................................... 113
  5.2 Gendered Attributes for Urban Service Economics ............................................................ 115
  5.3 The Feminising Middle-Managerial Layer ......................................................................... 122
5.4 Desirable Womanhood in Middle Management .......................................................... 126
5.5 ‘Nü Hanzi’ (Tough Lady 女汉子) and ‘Business after Wine’ Culture .............................. 136
5.6 The Top: Men’s Club .................................................................................................. 142
5.7 Discrimination Against Women Moving to the Top: Women’s Collusion of Gender Inequality .......................................................................................................................... 147
5.8 Conclusions ............................................................................................................... 155

Chapter 6. Work and Family: Cooperation and Resistance .............................................. 158
6.1 Life-stage and the Family ............................................................................................ 162
6.2 Challenges and Difficulties at Home ......................................................................... 167
6.3 City-based Coping Strategies: The Tales of Professional Working Mothers in Sydney, Hong Kong and Shanghai .......................................................... 176
6.4 Expected and the Unexpected Consequences: Three Contradictions and Ironies ......... 186
6.5 Conclusions ............................................................................................................... 202

Chapter 7. Conclusions: Gender, Negotiated Opportunities and Politics of Trust ............ 204
7.1 Geographical Location and Negotiated Opportunities .............................................. 206
7.2 Spatial Interconnectedness and Politics of Trust .................................................... 208
7.3 Place and Space: Nü Hanzi and Desirable Womanhood in Banks .............................. 212
7.4 The Intersection of Work and Private Life: Conflict, Confrontation and Cooperation...... 215

Appendices ...................................................................................................................... 221
Appendix A - Invitation to Participate in a Study of Chinese Women Bankers in Australia and China .......................................................................................................................... 221
Appendix B - Interview Guide for Research on Chinese Women Professionals Working in the Finance Services and Banking Sector ................................................................. 225

Glossary ............................................................................................................................. 229

References ......................................................................................................................... 237
List of Tables and Figures

Table 1: The Top 30 Global Financial Centres
Table 2: Financial Centres by Connectivity, Diversity and Speciality
Table 3: Australia Respondents’ Current and Previous Banks of Employment
Table 4: Australia Respondents’ Background Information
Table 5: Hong Kong Respondents’ Current and Previous Banks of Employment
Table 6: Hong Kong Respondents’ Background Information
Table 7: Mainland China Respondents’ Current and Previous Banks of Employment
Table 8: Mainland China Respondents’ Background Information
Table 9: Median Monthly Domestic Household Income by District
Table 10: Statistical Information on Three Cities Lily Worked In
Table 11: Finance and Insurance Industry Employment by Gender
Table 12: Top 10 Female Qualities Best Suited for Front-office Positions
Table 13: Positive Characteristics of Chinese Female Managers in Banks – Provided by Respondents in Australia
Table 14: Positive Characteristics of Chinese Female Managers in Banks – Provided by Respondents in Hong Kong
Table 15: Positive Characteristics of Chinese Female Managers in Banks – Provided by Respondents in Mainland China
Table 16: List of Negative Qualities of Female Bosses Compared with Positive Qualities of Male Bosses Provided by Respondents
Table 17: Age Group of Respondents
Table 18: Marital Status of Respondents
Table 19: Age Group of Respondents’ Children
Table 20: Family Challenges Faced by Women in the Banking Industry in Australia
Table 21: Family Challenges Faced by Women in the Banking Industry in Hong Kong
Table 22: Family Challenges Faced by Women in the Banking Industry in Mainland China
Figure 1: Branch Locations of Ginny’s Employment in Sydney
Figure 2: Daisy’s Career Development Path
Figure 3: Branch Locations (the circle) of Daisy’s Previous and Current Employment
Figure 4: Branch Locations of Lily’s Employment in Guangzhou Province
Figure 5: Sally’s Work and Family Networks and Daily Routine
Figure 6: Finance Industry – Gender Composition
Abstract

Women are emerging as significant actors in international financial industries concentrated in world and global cities. This study explores the feminisation of mid-level management teams in world and global cities in the Asia-Pacific. It draws on 51 in-depth interviews with Chinese women professionals working in the financial industry in Sydney, Hong Kong, Shanghai and four other cities in Australia and China. Using intersectionality analysis, it examines the interplay between geographical location, gender and career mobility.

This study has four key findings. First, a bank’s location is embedded within hierarchical fields of power. There are spatial politics within a city, among different cities and across nations, which interweave with the politics of race, ethnicity and gender as urban economies respond to increasing numbers of immigrants. Particular areas within a city exert the power of spatial coding while the level of development and real and symbolic political power differs among cities. These factors impact the upward mobility of women professionals.

Second, ‘seeing face’ and ‘giving face’ are correlated to building trust and maintaining a ‘personalised relationship’ in Chinese business culture. Hence, global financial capitalism requires professionals to maintain a high frequency of local and international travel. Upwardly mobile Chinese women professionals play a key role in shaping the daily practise of transnationalism and in building and maintaining dynamic global-to-local and local-to-local connectivity.

Third, women professionals are adept at performing gender: they perform the role of a ‘nü hanzi’ (女汉子 tough lady) to build a ‘code of brotherhood’ with male clients and bosses; and they also use charismatic womanhood and heterosexual attraction both in business dealings and in the office. Ironically, women professionals often face discrimination from other women. Their own misogynistic gendered perception of female bosses reflects a ‘crab-pot mentality’ which has a negative impact on the limited opportunities for women to move into top managerial positions.

Finally, the thesis reveals three place-based coping strategies: (1) cooperation between husband and wife who use gender role flexibility and exchangeability to divide labour at home, in Australia; (2) cooperation between women professionals and live-in, female, domestic helpers to do housework and child care, in Hong Kong; and (3) vertical cooperation between mothers and daughters, where a professional’s mother becomes the key care giver to young children, in mainland China. The comparative analysis of challenges and coping strategies reveal an intricate and complex lineage between coping strategies, state policy, an individual’s resources and place-based culture and norms.