Optimising energy efficiency finance in emerging economies in Southeast Asia

Verena Streitferdt

Institute for Sustainable Futures University of Technology, Sydney

A thesis submitted for the degree of a Doctor of Philosophy

July 2016

Certificate of original authorship

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as part of the collaborative doctoral degree and/or fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Verena Streitferdt, 22nd of July 2016

Abstract

This thesis investigates the relationship between public and private sector efforts to optimise energy efficiency finance initiatives in an emerging country context, using Thailand as a case study.

Demand-side energy efficiency measures could significantly reduce pressures on energy systems in emerging economies in Southeast Asia while at the same time reducing greenhouse gas emissions. Rapidly increasing energy needs, combined with dependence on fossil fuel imports have put energy systems in the region under pressure. Due to high urbanisation growth rates, and comparatively inefficient industries, demand-side energy efficiency measures could be part of the solution.

The lack of external energy efficiency finance for industry and building owners is a major barrier, but reports and country examples contain mixed messages about how to best overcome this challenge. The dominant discourse around energy efficiency finance originates from international organisations who advocate for the public sector to focus all efforts on maximising private sector investments. However, developed country experience and some emerging country examples, suggest that the problem is more complex. Therefore, this thesis focuses on how to optimise energy efficiency finance.

Thailand serves as a case study due to the range of energy efficiency initiatives designed and implemented in that country since the early 1990s. Transition studies and Multi-Level Perspective, were chosen as the theoretical framework and heuristic tool for the analysis. Qualitative data in the form of interviews with forty-eight experts from government, the private sector and academia form the core of this research. The research found that in Thailand, after more than 10 years of public sector support for energy efficiency finance initiatives, success in the private sector has been limited. Challenges identified include: (1) a lack of de-risking measures (2) renewable energy projects receiving most funding; (3) lack of guidance from the Central Bank of Thailand and (4) missing cross-coordination with relevant ministries to create additional demand for energy efficiency finance services. Suggestions for next steps are provided.

The main finding from this research is that EEF in an emerging country context will never be transitioned 100% to the private sector, but will be reliant on long-term consistent support from the public sector. Policy makers and international organisations must therefore carefully evaluate the existing framework conditions before choosing which energy efficiency finance initiatives to support. The Multi-Level Perspective analytical framework could provide such an analytical tool to further unleash the energy efficiency potential in Southeast Asia.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank the following agencies for providing me with financial support during my research: The University of Technology, Sydney for the UTS President's Scholarship, the Hildegard-Dinter Association for a travel fund, the Thai-German programme: Energy Efficiency Development Plan (TGP-EEDP) implemented by the 'Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit' (GIZ) and the Energy Research Centre of the Netherlands (ECN) for some short-term work opportunities in Thailand. One of the project workshops was co-hosted by Nexant, an international consulting firm, at its Bangkok regional office and another was co-hosted by an EU SWITCH-Asia Programme: Greening the Thai Automotive Industry.

My supervisory team saw the best and worst of me during the three and a half years of this endeavour. Their persistence, commitment and knowledge brought me here, so I am forever grateful to: Pierre Mukheibir, for always being available, process-orientated and cheerful; Timon Wehnert, for ad hoc deep analytical discussions at the most exquisite places; Mick Paddon for introducing me to social research and perfecting my English skills with his impeccable vocabulary; and David Crossley for work inspiration, crucial content insights and sharing with me his expansive network in Thailand and the rest of Asia. I cannot express enough how grateful and privileged I feel to have had this support, and in my next job I will miss having the 'four wise men' around me. Also, I would like to thank John Revington for providing a grammatical and typographic edit of the final thesis draft.

Also, my sincere thanks go to the professors, Dr. Surapong, Dr. Menke and the colleagues at the Joint Graduate School of Energy and Environment (JGSEE), King Mongkut's University of Technology in Thonburi and to the Thai-German programme: Energy Efficiency Development (TGP-EEDP) (GIZ) for their support. JGSEE graciously hosted me during my field trips. The JGSEE team and professors welcomed me to join professorial lunches and activities, and provided contacts and references. In particular, I would like to thank my three research assistants, Khun Phapada, Khun Krib and Khun Pan. Without their constant reflection and attentiveness this research would not have been possible. TGP-EEDP also provided me with a work space and due to their insightful discussions and contacts this research received its rich data. In particular, my gratitude goes to Khun Monthon for giving me analytical support, to Tom for facilitation to the programme director Milou Beerepot for her thought-provoking comments. Finally, I would like to thank Peter Du Pont for co-publishing with me a paper and all his support during my research.

In Berlin, in particular I would like to thank the Wuppertal Institute for Climate, Environment and Energy for hosting me during my three-month writing internship. Their collegial feedback during roundtables and joint lunches was invaluable. In particular, thanks to Florian Mersmann for MLP brainstorms, Shritu Shrestha for best lunches and Kristina Wagner for her flexible and competent assistance.

Thanks also to my medical support team who kept my health going, especially in the last two years after I contracted dengue fever. Thanks to Margaret for continuously reenergising my body after another dengue relapse, to Trish and Adrianne for nurturing food and conversations, to Tienne, Sinden and Paul for keeping my body and mind

flexible, and to Mira for helping me to experience again the joy of exercise through her contemporary dance classes.

Being a gypsy, friends at home and far afield are the nurturing ground on which I thrive. Internationally, I would like to say thanks to Jana for accountability and park yoga, to Kerstin for constant reflection and diet tips, to Anna for being the best Cambodian host and German adventurer, to Mari for her big Italian wedding, to Budi for her taste buds, to Michael for hosting and reflection time, to Odit for inspiration and to Bernie for long friendship and consistency.

In Berlin, I would like to thank Birgit for an alternative home, to Bere for bike and lunch escapes, to Alex for accommodation and insightful discussions, to Astrid and Kofi for the best rooftop terrace pizza experience, to Juergen and Anja for shelter and kids' distraction, to Silvia for fun activities and best conversations, to Anja for her clear mind, and to Manolo and Christian for Berlin adventures.

In Thailand, my particular thanks go to Martina and Nikola for incredible experiences, such as their newly born son Silvan, good food and great conversations, to Hala for hosting me, for sharing her network and for ad hoc dinners and coffees, to Robert for fun jogs and eating activities, and finally to Khun Ampawa for her hospitality, friendship and passion for her work on sustainable energy.

In Australia, very special thanks go to my flatmates for their hospitality and patience; to Ro for her continuous friendship, regardless of my constant travelling, our invaluable discussions around politics, gender and beautiful walks in Sydney and its surroundings; and to Jay and Louise for hosting me on and off in their beautiful Bronte home, distracting my mind with sharing beautiful 'film' moments, pinning me down to work and also giving me warnings to rest when they saw my health decline.

Further, I would like to thank the community of the Institute for Sustainable Futures and the Faculty of Social Sciences, in particular my pod neighbours Dana, Louise, Emilia, Tanja and Isabel for friendly smiles and chats; Jessica and Tara for friendship and hot chocolates; Chrisanthi and Matt for being loyal writing buddies; Reba for best lunch breaks; Reza for calming walks and delicious Iranian food; Laure-Elise for sharing her worries which made mine seem small; and Judy for coffees and walks and being a life inspiration. Besides university, I would like to thank Doris for best girls' outings; Jerome for shelter and calm perspectives; Janina for her passion for dance, her friendship and her open mind; Austin, Cenk and Alex for lovely memories; and Toni for her adaptiveness and sharing with me a beautiful new experience.

Faraway but always with me in spirit I also would like to thank: my family. The whole family 'Moritz' for our yearly meetings which give me the feeling of groundedness; Dorit and Lothar for cheering calls; my dad and Lucia for our skype conversations; my brother Tobi for wheelchair traveller and time management tips; and my mum, for inspiration, commitment and beautiful spa experiences when most needed – without your constant support I would not be here.

But finally, and most importantly I would like to thank the many Thai and Thai-based international professionals who participated in the interviews and roundtable discussions. Their sharing of their deep experiences with Thailand's energy efficiency policies and programs was invaluable to the success of this research.

I dedicate this thesis to **love** and **hope**:

Love for my brother, Tobias, as without our shared passion for travel this PhD would never have become reality, and

hope to Southeast Asia that it will demonstrate to the world that prosperity and resource efficiency can be achieved together.

Contents

Certifica	ate of original authorship	2
Abstrac	zt	3
Acknow	/ledgements	5
Conten	ts	9
List of figures		12
List of t	_ist of tables	
List of r	_ist of relevant publications	
List of a	acronyms	15
Glossai	ry	17
Chapte	r I: Introduction	21
1.1	Relevance and complexity of external EEF	22
1.2	Multi-level perspective –opportunity to analyse broader influences	25
1.3	Research areas	27
1.4	Methods and data collection approach	28
1.5	Definitions	29
1.6	Contribution to knowledge	31
1.7	Thesis outline	32
Chapte	r II: The opportunity for private sector capital for Energy Efficiency	
	Finance	
2.1	Introduction	38
2.2	Energy efficiency as a win-win situation for emerging economies?	
2.3	Lack of access to capital: an important barrier to EE	
2.4	Public support mechanisms for EEF	48
2.5	EEF initiatives world wide	52
2.6	Research gap and overall research question	59
2.7	Conclusion	60
Chapte	r III: Research design	63
3.1	Introduction	64
3.2	Thailand as a case study	64
3.3	Transition studies and MLP	65
3.4	Research approach	78
3.5	Analysis of the field trips and adaptation of the research questions	87
2.6	Conclusion	00

Chapte	er IV: Public sector energy efficiency finance mechanisms	91
4.1	Introduction	92
4.2	Public sector efforts to support energy efficiency finance from 1992-2014	94
4.3	In-depth analysis of the EERF and the ESCO Fund	103
4.4	Discussion	111
4.5	Conclusion	115
Chapte	r V: Private sector energy efficiency finance models	119
5.1	Introduction	120
5.2	The development of private sector EEF models over time	121
5.3	In-depth analysis of existing private sector EEF models	122
5.4	Discussion	147
5.5	Conclusions	154
Chapte	r VI: Framework conditions for energy efficiency finance	157
6.1	Introduction	158
6.2	Analysis of the Thai framework conditions over time	161
6.3	Are the framework conditions in the Thailand case study conducive to EEF	?172
6.4	Conclusion	179
Chapte	r VII: The way forward for Thailand	183
7.1	Introduction	184
7.2	Recommendations for the next steps for Thailand	195
7.3	Conclusions	202
Chapte	r VIII: Exploring the context with MLP as an analysis tool	205
8.1	Introduction	206
8.2	Multi-Level Perspective -a tool to explore the context	208
8.3	Conclusions	225
Chapte	r IX: Conclusions	229
9.1	Introduction	230
9.2	Challenging the current discourse	231
9.3	Optimising energy efficiency finance in emerging economies	233
9.4	Multi-level perspective – an useful analysis tool to explore the context	237
9.5	Opportunities for future research	240
9.6	Policy implications	241
9.7	Conclusion	243

Appendix I: Energy efficiency barriers identified from the literature	245
Appendix II: Energy efficiency finance approaches	246
Appendix III: Semi-structured interview – schedule (Field Trip I)	249
Appendix IV: Interview schedule for the financial sector (Field trip I)	252
Appendix V: Draft interview schedule for ESCOs	254
Appendix VI: Draft interview schedule for EEF customers	257
Appendix VII: Terms of reference for a seminar: 'Explore ESCO business in China and what the EEF initiatives are in Thailand'	
Appendix VIII: Agenda for the EU-Switch Asia Seminar on EEF held at the Eastin Hotel	261
Appendix IX: Web-based Thai bank analysis	262
References	265

List of figures

Figure 1: Multi-level perspective on transitions (adapted from Geels & Schot 2007)	
Figure 2: Graphical overview of the thesis structure	
Figure 3: Energy related CO ₂ emissions by scenario and abatement measures	
Figure 4: Energy intensity by region (1990–2035) (APEC 2013)	
Figure 5: Global GHG abatement cost curve beyond business as usual – 2030	
Figure 6: Financing barriers to industrial energy efficiency (Limaye et al. 2012)	46
Figure 7: Conceptual figure of shift from public sector funded EE measures to private	
sector investment (Selmet 2012; Sudo 2012)	
Figure 8: Range of public and private sector EEF (adapted from (Wang et al. 2013)	
Figure 9: Multi-level perspective on transitions (Geels & Schot 2007, p.401)	
Figure 10: Multi-level perspective on transitions (adapted from (Geels & Schot 2007)	74
Figure 11: Socio-technical trajectories of the finance provision and consumption	76
Figure 12: Socio-technical trajectories of the electricity and EE provision and	
consumption	
Figure 13: Field trips and the evolution of the research questions	
Figure 14: World Cafe on ESCO-arranged finance	86
Figure 15: World Cafe with SMEs of the Thai automotive industry on their experience	
with EEF initiatives	87
Figure 16: Range of public and private sector financing (adapted from (Wang et al.	
2013)	
Figure 17: Overview of EEF relevant events in the Thailand case study	
Figure 18: Investment from banks vs. public sector for the five phases of the EERF	
Figure 19: Project (THB million) vs. ESCO Fund investment (THB million) (DEDE 2014)	
Figure 20: ESCO Fund SME and large customers for Phases I and II	109
Figure 21: Public sector EEF mechanisms according to the stage of market	
development	
Figure 22: Guaranteed Savings Energy Performance Contract Model	124
Figure 23: Shared Savings Energy Performance Contract Model	133
Figure 24: Proportion of ESCO-arranged finance in the whole Thai ESCO market	135
Figure 25: Composition of FTI's active ESCO stakeholders (FTI 2014)	136
Figure 26: Shared saving contracts vs. guaranteed saving contracts from ESCO	
companies from 2011-2013 (Federation of Thai Industries 2014)	
Figure 27: Comparison of loans, bonds and stocks (Bank of Thailand 2014)	166
Figure 28: Energy consumption development in Thailand (Source: EPPO) and	
Electricity consumption in Thailand in 2013 (Source: DEDE)	169
Figure 29: Spread of institutions involved in the governance of the electricity sector In	
Thailand (verified during Exit Workshop I)	
Figure 30: Summary of Thailand Integrated Energy Blueprint (Kaewtathip 2015)	171
Figure 31: Mechanics of risk guarantee mechanism (Venugopal 2012, p.10)	196
Figure 32: SME credit guarantee mechanism provided by the TCG (Warakul 2015)	198
Figure 33: Multi-level perspective applied to this research	207
Figure 34: Suggested analysis tool to assess the context of EEF in an emerging	
economy	
Figure 35: EEF from the public to the private sector (Sudo 2012)	221

Figure 36: Possible EEF initiatives accompanied by an increase of private sector	
investment over time, given certain framework conditions	. 222
Figure 37: Transition from public sector to commercial financing for the three analysed	
EE initiatives EE lending, ESCO arranged finance and EE leasing	. 223
List of tables	
Table 1: EEF initiatives and barriers addressed (Wang et al. 2013)	50
Table 2: Important framework conditions for EEF	51
Table 3: Overview of global EEF initiatives	
Table 4: Categorisation of the 20 interviewees of Field Trip I	83
Table 5: Categorisation of the interviewees of Field Trip II	84
Table 6: EEF models found in the Thailand case study	86
Table 7: Important framework conditions for EEF	89
Table 8: In 2014 running private sector EEF model in the banking sector	. 125
Table 9: Private sector EEF business models according to SNM criteria	. 149
Table 10: Conducive framework conditions for EEF, identified from the literature	. 159
Table 11: Overview of the transformation of the finance and electricity sector in Thailand	
from the perspective of time	
Table 12: Comparison between the framework conditions identifie7d in the literature and	ĺ
in the Thailand case study	. 172
Table 13: Illustration of external events that could influence the policy support for EEF	
initiatives	. 213
Table 14: Illustration of the political systems in emerging countries that could influence	
the policy support for EEF initiatives	. 214
Table 15: Important aspects of the electricity and finance regimes for EEF with	
reference to which of the seven MLP concepts they belong to (in brackets)	. 215
Table 16: Illustration of relevant issues of the electricity and finance regimes in selected	
emerging countries	. 217
Table 17: Overview of possible EEF models, defined by the actors, customers and	
project size	. 219

List of relevant publications

The analysis of the public energy efficiency finance mechanisms in Thailand discussed in Chapter V of this doctoral thesis have been published and are under review. The publications are listed below:

- 1) Streitferdt, V. & Chirarattananon, S. 2015, 'Energy Efficiency Finance Support in Thailand: Lessons learned from the Energy Efficiency Revolving Fund', *Journal of Sustainable Energy & Environment*, vol.6, pp. 21-26.
- 2) Streitferdt, V., Chirarattananon, S. & Du Pont, P. 2016, 'Lessons learned from Studying of Public Initiatives to support Energy Efficiency Financing in Thailand from 1992 to 2014', *Energy Efficiency* () 1-19. DOI: 10.1007/s12053-016-9492-1

List of acronyms

ADB Asian Development Bank
AFD French development agency

APEC Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation

ASEAN Association of South East Asian Nations

BOI Board of investment

CHUEE China Utility-Based Energy Efficiency Finance Programme

CIMB Commerce International Merchant Bank

CSR corporate social responsibility

DANIDA Denmark's development cooperation

DEDE Department of Alternative Energy Development and Energy Efficiency

DFID Department for International Development

DSM demand-side management

EE energy efficiency

ECFT Energy Conservation Foundation of Thailand

EECT Energy Efficiency Centre of Thailand
EEDP Energy Efficiency Development Plan

EEF energy efficiency finance

EforE Energy for Environment Foundation

EGAT Electricity Generating Authority of Thailand

EERF Energy Efficiency Revolving Fund

EERS Energy Efficiency Resource Standards

ENCON energy conservation

EPC energy performance contracts
EPPO Energy Policy and Planning Office

ESCO energy service company
ESC energy supply contracts
ESI electricity service industry
FTI Federation of Thai Industries
GEF Global Environment Facility

GHG greenhouse gas

GIZ German technical development cooperation

GS - EPCs guaranteed savings – energy performance contracts

IDB Inter-American development Bank
IFC International Finance Corporation

IFCT Industrial Finance Corporation of Thailand

IMF International Monetary Fund

IPEEC International Partnership for Energy Efficiency Corporation

IPCC Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change

JGSEE Joint Graduate School for Energy and Environment

KfW Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau

ktoe kilotonne of oil equivalent

kWh kilowatt hour

MEA Metropolitan Electrification Authority

MLP multi-level perspective

NAMA nationally appropriate mitigation action

NEPO National Energy Policy Office

OECD Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development

PEA Provincial Electrification Authority

PTT Petroleum Authority of Thailand (PTT) Public Company Limited

RE renewable energy

SS – EPCs shared savings – energy performance contracts

SME small and medium enterprises

SME Bank Small and Medium Enterprise Development Bank of Thailand

SOP Standard Offer Program

TGO Thailand's Greenhouse Gas Organisation

TGP-EEDP Thai-German programme: Energy Efficiency Development Plan

THB Thai Bath

TIS technology innovation systems

TM transition management

UK United Kingdom

UNDP United Nations Development Programme
UNEP United Nations Environment Programme

UNESCAP United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific

UNFCCC United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change

UNIDO United Nations Industrial Development Organisation

US United States of America

USAID US Foreign Assistance programme
UTS University of Technology, Sydney

Glossary

Asian developing and emerging economies

Asian developing and emerging economies are characterised by rapid economic growth, high urbanisation, and high levels of poverty (APERC 2013). This definition deliberately includes both developing and emerging economies, as energy systems are especially challenged during the transition from a developing to an emerging economy. They differ for example in the support they receive from international organisations.

Demand-side energy efficiency measures These are measures which reduce the energy consumption of consumers, for the same productive output, or providing higher energy services or production for the same amount of energy consumption. Energy Efficiency measures include improvements to the existing infrastructure stock of industry and buildings as well as the provision of energy-efficient solutions for new projects in the industry and building sectors (Selmet 2012).

De-risking measures

These are measures which help investors and EE service providers to manage specific types of risks. These measures can be, for example, loan guarantees, insurance, or foreign exchange/liquidity facilities. The public sector could directly provide the finance or provide the finance to a financial institution at a subsidised rate (Venugopal 2012).

Energy efficiency

Energy efficiency is defined in this thesis either consuming less energy for the same productive output, or providing higher energy services or production for the same amount of energy consumption (Selmet 2012).

Energy efficiency finance

Energy efficiency finance means funding energy efficiency projects for demand-side measures within the industry, building, residential and public sectors (Taylor 2012).

Energy efficiency finance initiatives

EEF initiatives are public and private sector efforts to provide financial tools to provide external EEF to customers in the industry and building sectors (Taylor 2012). Some have defined these as supply-side policies to support EEF. However, due to the confusion about the terms demand-side and supply-side energy efficiency the term supply-side policies will not be used in this thesis.

Energy efficiency projects

Energy efficiency projects are projects that use less energy for the same service than previously consumed (previous performance). This can be measured compared to the existing practice of that industry or standards (if available in the country).

Energy supply contracts

In ESC, the ESCO provides specific energy efficiency services for an agreed fee. In this model maintenance and operation stays with the ESCO company and the customer pays the ESCO for the electricity for a

long period of time (10-15 years). The output is measured in verified megawatt hours provided to the customer by the ESCO, but does not involve a performance contract (MacLean & Purcell 2014; Würtenberger 2012).

External energy efficiency finance

External EEF here means all funding that does not directly come from corporations' earnings, but always uses third parties to mobilise finance. These third parties could for example be banks, leasing companies, ESCOs (Taylor 2012).

Framework conditions

National circumstances in a country that influence EEF initiatives: electricity sector (electricity price, EE regulations, institutional set-up); finance sector (institutional set-up, regulations), but also external pressures or underlying cultural and political circumstances. The framework conditions in the theoretical language used are the landscape and the regime(s) level.

Framework conditions

These are the national circumstances in a country that influence EEF initiatives. For the electricity sector, they include: electricity prices, EE regulations, institutional set-ups. For the finance sector, they include: institutional set-up, and regulations. They also include external pressures or underlying cultural and political circumstances. The framework conditions in the MLP framework are defined at the level of the landscape and the regime(s).

Guaranteed savings – energy performance contracts

In guaranteed savings – energy performance contracts the ESCO guarantees to the customer a certain amount of energy savings; any revenues that are generated beyond those energy savings are kept by the ESCO (Crossley & Wang 2013).

Landscape

Landscapes are defined by transition studies as external pressures and non-changeable framework conditions. Thus the landscape is defined as the 'whole set of impacts outside the level of niches and regimes, which have influence' (Lachman 2013, p.271). It also includes the 'deep structural relationships' of society (Baker, Newell & Phillips 2014, p.794). So, in this research landscape conditions can include (1) fluctuations in oil prices; (2) financial crises; (3) national, regional or international political pressures (e.g. from the IMF); (4) the political system, (5) corruption and (6) cultural characteristics.

Niche

A niche is a protected space where technological innovation can evolve and develop towards penetrating the dominant market structures (Kemp, Schot & Hoogma 1998). For this research, energy efficiency finance for the building and industry sectors is defined as the 'radical social innovation', and the niche is defined as the existing EEF initiatives (Witkamp, Raven & Royakkers 2006, p.2).

Private sector energy efficiency finance models Energy efficiency finance models are defined as primary transaction structures that have been created by the private financial sector to reap the business opportunities of the EE investment niche market (MacLean & Purcell 2014; Würtenberger 2012).

Public energy efficiency finance mechanisms Public energy efficiency finance mechanisms (PEEFMs) are 'arrangements amongst institutions and market players to finance and implement energy efficiency projects' (Kats et al. 2012). In this thesis the focus is on external funding that leads to EE implementation by the industry and commercial building sector (Taylor 2012).

Regime

A regime is 'a variety of mutually reinforcing and entrenching cognitive, social, economic, institutional and technological processes that sustain existing trajectories of development' (Smith, 2007:p.428). So, in this research the electricity and the financial regimes are the core focus of the analysis.

Shared savings energy performance contracts Under the shared savings energy performance contract model the ESCO and the customer share the cost savings from implementing the EE measures at an agreed percentage for a fixed number of years (Crossley & Wang 2013).