A Joint Analysis of Gross Primary Production and Evapotranspiration of Australia Using Eddy Covariance, Remote Sensing and Land Surface Modelling Approaches

Hao Shi

February 2017

A thesis submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

> School of Life Sciences University of Technology Sydney

Certificate of original authorship

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text. I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature

Date 2017-02-15

Acknowledgements

I have experienced an amazing period in the University of Technology Sydney during the past four years. I am grateful to have a chance to work with distinguished scholars in this world on terrestrial ecosystem functioning.

I am deeply and sincerely appreciative for the guidance and support from my supervisors Prof. Derek Eamus and Dr. Longhui Li. Longhui was the first to set up this PhD project and has always encouraged me in continuing this work. Derek has taught me how to focus on the scientific questions. His suggestions have greatly helped me in developing and structuring my work.

I would like to thank Prof. Qiang Yu. Qiang is professional in ecosystem modelling and even in chats with him I learned a lot in ecosystem mechanisms and modelling. Talks with Qiang are enjoyable and many ideas are inspired.

Many thanks goes to Prof. Alfredo Huete and Dr. James Cleverly. Alfredo is a distinguished scientist in remote sensing and gave me amounts of advice in developing this thesis. Besides, Alfredo is always kind even though I had not much knowledge of remote sensing when being a beginner. James gave me a number of suggestions on writing and always patiently corrected the grammar errors in my manuscripts.

I also sincerely thank all my friends and office buddies for their support and accompany. I am most happy to share a period with them. Many thanks to all my collaborators for their valuable comments on my work. Special thanks to Dr. Xingjie Lu at CIRSO for sharing meteorological forcing data and Mike Lake at UTS for assistance in using UTS HPC.

I would also like to acknowledge the financial support from the Australian Research Council Scholarship and the UTS International Research Scholarship. Without these funding, I could not have completed this work. Many thanks to UTS staff from the School of Life Sciences and the Graduate Research School.

The biggest thanks to my family who always support me and have scarified for me so much, especially my wife. I love you all!

Preface

Accurate estimation of gross primary production (GPP) through vegetation photosynthesis and its coupled evapotranspiration (ET) process is critical for the Earth's life support system. This thesis aims to understand the mechanisms underlying the GPP and ET processes and thus to improve the estimation of them across various spatio-temporal scales. The thesis consists of seven chapters with Chapters two to six written as journal articles. Chapters two to five focus on one of different methods such as eddy covariance, remote sensing and land surface modelling. Chapter six integrates eddy covariance observations, remote sensing products and land surface modelling to investigate the deficits existing in current models. These chapters have been published, submitted or in preparation. This thesis is compiled from above chapters with guidance and support from my supervisors and collaborators from other institutes. The details are as the following:

Chapter 2: Shi, H., L. Li, D. Eamus, J. Cleverly, A. Huete, J. Beringer, Q. Yu, E. v. Gorsel, and L. Hutley (2014), Intrinsic climate dependency of ecosystem light and water-use-efficiencies across Australian biomes, *Environmental Research Letters*, *9*(10), 104002.

Chapter 3: Shi, H., L. Li, D. Eamus, A. Huete, J. Cleverly, X. Tian, Q. Yu, S. Wang, L. Montagnani, V. Magliulo, E. Rotenberg, M. Pavelka, and A. Carrara (2017), Assessing the ability of MODIS EVI to estimate terrestrial ecosystem gross primary production of multiple land cover types, *Ecological Indicators*, *72*, 153-164.

Chapter 4: Shi, H., W. Zhuang, L. Li, J. Beringer, J. Cleverly, J. Dong, D. Eamus, Q. Guo, and Q. Yu (2016), Remote estimation of evapotranspiration for Australian seasonally water-limited ecosystems within an evapotranspiration-vegetation index framework, *Remote Sensing Letters*, submitted.

Chapter 5: Shi, H., L. Li, Y.-P. Wang, J. Beringer, J. Cleverly, L. Cheng, D. Eamus, L. He, X. Lu, L. Zhang, and Q. Yu (2016), Identifying and optimizing key above- and below-ground processes for carbon assimilation and evapotranspiration in the CABLE model across Australian vegetation types, *Journal of Geophysical Research*, internal review.

Chapter 6: Shi, H., L. Li, D. Eamus, X. Lu, Y.-P. Wang, J. Cleverly, J. Beringer, and Q. Yu (2016), Benchmarking the CABLE model using remote sensing GPP and ET products across Australia, *Journal of Hydrometeorology*, in prep.

Other coauthored papers include:

- Bai, J., J. Wang, X. Chen, G. Luo, H. Shi, L. Li, and J. Li (2015), Seasonal and inter-annual variations in carbon fluxes and evapotranspiration over cotton field under drip irrigation with plastic mulch in an arid region of Northwest China, *Journal of Arid Land*, 7(2), 272-284.
- L.H. Li, Y.P. Wang, D. Eamus, V.K. Arora, H. Shi, L. Cheng, J. Cleverly, T. Hajima, D.Y. Ji, C. Jones, M. Kawamiya, W.P. Li, J. Tjiputra, A. Wiltshire, T.W. Wu, Q. Yu, and L. Zhang (2015), Benchmarking global land surface models in CMIP5: analysis of ecosystem water- and light-use efficiencies within a Budyko framework, *Journal of Climate*, under review.
- 3. L.H. Li, Y.P. Wang, J. Beringer, H. Shi, D. Eamus, A. Huete, J. Cleverly (2015), Coherent and positive response of gross primary production to precipitation across Australian arid and semi-arid biomes, *Scientific Reports*, under review.
- X.L. Yuan, L.H. Li, X. Chen, H. Shi (2015), Effects of Precipitation Intensity on NDVI-Based Grass Change over Northern China During the Period from 1982 to 2011, *Remote Sensing*, vol. 7, no. 8, doi:10.3390/rs70810164

Contents

Certificate of original authorship	i
Acknowledgements	ii
Preface	iv
Abstract	1
Chapter 1. Introduction	2
1.1 GPP and ET	2
1.1.1 GPP	2
1.1.2 Evapotranspiration (ET)	3
1.2 Main approaches for measurements and estimation of GPP and ET	4
1.2.1 Eddy covariance method	4
1.2.2 Remote sensing techniques	5
1.2.3 Land surface models	6
1.3 Progress on estimation of GPP and ET	7
1.3.1 GPP estimation	7
1.3.2 ET estimation	9
1.4 Study area	
1.5 Aims and overview	
Chapter 2: Intrinsic climate dependency of ecosystem light and water-use-efficie	encies across
Australian biomes	
Abstract	
2.1 Introduction	
2.2 Methods	
2.2.1 Sites and data processing	
2.2.2 Wavelet aggregation method	
2.3 Results	
2.3.1 GPP responses to PAR and ET	

2.3.2 Relationships of eLUE and eWUE with climate	38
2.3.3 Relationships of eLUE and eWUE to SWC and LAI	41
2.3.4 Behavior of eLUE and eWUE in summer and winter	45
2.4 Discussion	47
2.4.1 Relationships between GPP, PAR and ET	47
2.4.2 Climate dependence of eLUE and eWUE among biomes	48
2.4.3 Seasonal patterns of eLUE and eWUE across biomes	49
2.5 Conclusions	50
Chapter 3. Assessing the ability of MODIS EVI to estimate terrestrial ecosystem g primary production of multiple land cover types	gross 58
Abstract	58
3.1 Introduction	59
3.2 Data and Methods	62
3.2.1 Eddy covariance and meteorological data	62
3.2.2 Benchmark dataset	64
3.2.3 Satellite data	65
3.2.4 Statistical analyses	69
3.3 Results	70
3.3.1 The overall relationship between GPP and iEVI without biomes categorization .	70
3.3.2 Biome-specific relationships between GPP and iEVI	71
3.3.3 Global application of biome-specific GPP-iEVI relationships	76
3.3.3 LAI and precipitation effects on biome-specific GPP-iEVI relationships	80
3.4 Discussion	81
3.4.1 Uncertainty analysis	81
3.4.2 Relationships between EVI and GPP	83
3.4.3 Environmental constraints on the ability of EVI to estimate GPP	84
3.5 Conclusions	86

Chapter 4: Remote estimation of evapotranspiration for Australian seasonal	lly water-limited
ecosystems within an evapotranspiration-vegetation index framework	
Abstract	
4.1 Introduction	
4.2 Data and Methods	
4.2.1 Data	
4.2.2 Development of the ET-EVI Framework	
4.2.3 A Simple EVI-Based ET Model	
4.3 Results	
4.3.1 Performance of the TG-SM Model across Sites	
4.3.2 Performance of the TG-SM Model within Sites	113
4.3.3 Performance of the TG-SM Model at the Regional Scale	116
4.4 Discussion and conclusions	119
Chapter 5. Identifying and optimizing key above- and below-ground proce assimilation and evapotranspiration in the CABLE model across Australian	esses for carbon vegetation types
Abstract	
5.1 Introduction	
5.2 Data and Methods	
5.2.1 Sites and Measurements	
5.2.2 The CABLE Model	
5.2.3 Sensitivity Analysis	
5.2.4 Parameter Optimization	141
5.2.5 Statistical Metrics	144
5.3 Results	144
5.3.1 Important Parameters for GPP and Qle	144
5.3.2 Distribution of Optimized Parameters	146
5.3.3 Performance of Optimization at the Hourly Time-scale	

5.3.4 Simulated SWC, GPP and ET at the Daily Time-scale	
5.3.5 Seasonal Responses of Simulated GPP and Qle to Water Deficits	
5.3.6 Effects of Optimization on GPP and ET at Different Time-scales	
5.4 Discussion	
5.4.1 Key Parameters and Processes for GPP and ET	
5.4.2 Applications of the Model-data Fusion Framework	
5.4.3 Further Model Uncertainties	164
5.5 Conclusions	
Chapter 6. Benchmarking the CABLE model using remote sensing GPP and across Australia.	I ET products
Abstract	
6.1 Introduction	
6.2 Data and Methods	
6.2.1 Flux sites	
6.2.2 Spatial data	
6.2.3 Remote sensing GPP models	
6.2.4 Remote sensing ET models	
6.2.5 The CABLE Model	
6.2.6 Data-driven product	
6.2.7 Statistical metrics	
6.3 Results	
6.3.1 Temporal benchmarking	
6.3.2 Spatial benchmarking	
6.4 Discussion	
6.5 Conclusions	
Chapter 7. General discussion and conclusions	
7.1 General discussion	

7.1.1 Coupling of GPP and ET across Australian biomes	. 209
7.1.2 EVI-based GPP model	. 209
7.1.3 TG-SM ET model	. 210
7.1.4 Optimization of the CABLE model	. 211
7.1.5 Benchmarking CABLE using remote sensing products	. 212
7.2 Future research	. 212

List of Figures

Figure 1.2. Framework of this thesis. The horizontal axis indicates time-scale while the vertical axis indicates spatial scale. The box for thesis step represents the spatio-temporal scales at which the research is conducted. The solid arrow lines indicate methods used in the chapter while the dashed arrow lines indicate output of the chapter into following steps...... 14

Figure 2.5. Relationships between (left) daily (eLUE_d), eight day (eLUE_{8d}), monthly (eLUE_m) eLUE and SWC and between (right) daily (eWUE_d), eight day (eWUE_{8d}), monthly (eWUE_m) eWUE and SWC for seven sites. Ellipses indicate 95% confidence boundaries of eLUE and eWUE. Bars indicate one standard deviation of annual eLUE, eWUE or SWC at each site. Also shown are logarithmically fitted functions, coefficients of determination (R^2) and p values.

Figure 3.2. Relationship between derived annual GPP from iEVI (GPP_{iEVI}) and eddy covariance tower measured GPP (GPP_{EC}) since 2000 based on all sites and across 12 different biomes. The inset shows *ln*-transformed annual GPP_{EC} and annual iEVI for all site-years. The solid line represents the least squares regression line. The dashed line represents the 1:1 line.

Figure 3.7. Spatial comparison of (A) the mean annual GPP from iEVI (GPP_{iEVI}, g C m⁻² yr⁻¹) (2000-2013) with (B) the benchmark GPP (GPP_{MTE}, g C m⁻² yr⁻¹) (1982-2008) and the distribution of (C) the residual (g C m⁻² yr⁻¹) between GPP_{iEVI} and GPP_{MTE} within the 5-95% quantile.

Figure 3.8. Latitudinal patterns (0.5° bands) of mean annual GPP by iEVI (GPP_{iEVI}, 2000-2013) and the benchmark (GPP_{MTE}, 1982-2008), respectively. The red shaded area represents the standard deviation of all GPP_{iEVI} values of cells along the latitude. The grey shaded area represents the standard deviation of all GPP_{MTE} values of cells along the latitude.

Figure 3.9. Strength (R^2) and slopes of relationships between $ln(\text{GPP}_{\text{EC}})$ and ln(iEVI) for each biome as a function of either mean annual precipitation (Prcp, inset) or mean annual maximum LAI in each biome. Black lines represent the segmented linear regression line. The dashed vertical line indicates the breakpoint of the segmented linear relationship. The shaded area represents 95% confidence band. 80

Figure 4.8. Spatial comparisons of mean annual TG-SM ET (a) and mean annual MOD16A2 ET (b) against mean annual ET-MTE (c) during 2001-2011. Figure 4.8d is the probability density distributions of spatial mean values. The red, blue and green dashed lines indicate spatial mean annual values for TG-SM, MOD16A2 and ET-MTE, respectively. Figures 4.8e, 4.8f and 4.8g are determination coefficients (R²), RMSE and significant values of monthly

Figure 5.3. Average diurnal cycles for net ecosystem carbon exchange (NEE) as calculated from the observations (Obs, open circles) and modeled by CABLE using default parameters (Def, black line), optimized above-ground parameters alone (Abv, blue line) and optimized parameters (Opt, red line), respectively. The shaded area represents standard deviation of the mean observed NEE.

Figure 5.5. Average diurnal cycles for latent heat (GPP) as calculated from the observations (Obs, open circles) and modeled by CABLE using default parameters (Def, black line), optimized above-ground parameters alone (Abv, blue line) and optimized parameters (Opt, red line), respectively. The shaded area represents standard deviation of the mean observed Q_{le}.

Figure 5.6. Statistical metrics for CABLE performance at the hourly time-scale using default

Figure 5.13. Coupling of gross primary productivity (GPP) and evapotranspiration (ET) at the annual time-scale across ten sites as calculated from the observations (Obs, dark green) and modeled by CABLE using default parameters (Def, black line), optimized above-ground parameters alone (Abv, blue line) and optimized parameters (Opt, red line), respectively. The

Figure 6.2. Monthly gross primary production (GPP), leaf area index (LAI) and photosynthetic capacity (PC, the ratio of GPP over LAI) of different models across Australia from 2001 to 2011. The gray line indicates the product of PC-CABLE and LAI-MOD. 186

Figure 6.11. The spatial distribution of per-pixel correlations and RMSE between ET-TGSM,
ET-MOD, ET-CABLE and ET-MTE. The cross symbols indicate the correlation is not
statistically significant at a <i>p</i> level of 0.05
Figure 6.12. Average monthly soil water content (SWC) at soil surface layer calculated from
the ECV product and the CABLE estimation during the period of 2001 to 2011198

List of Tables

Table 4.1. Brief description of the eight flux tower sites used to develop and validate the TG-SM model, including site identifier (ID), site name (Site), latitude (Lat, °S), longitude (Long, °E), biome type (IGBP), data period, mean annual temperature (MAT, °C), mean annual precipitation (MAP, mm yr⁻¹) and mean annual radiation (Rad, W m⁻² s⁻¹). SAV denotes savannas; OSH denotes open shrublands; WSA denotes woody savannas; and GRA denotes grasslands.

Table 5.2. Definitions and ranges of CABLE parameters in sensitivity analysis......141

Table 6.1. Eddy covariance data used in this study. Information includes site name (Site),

Abstract

The aim of this thesis is to analyze the patterns of gross primary production (GPP) and evapotranspiration (ET) across Australian biomes in combination of eddy covariance, remote sensing and land surface model (LSM) methods, taking advantage of their respective applicability on different space and time scales. To do this, I (1) used the wavelet method to decompose eddy covariance observed half-hourly GPP and ET into different frequencies from hourly to annual to investigate the coupling of GPP and ET and their interactions with climate and vegetation variability over hourly to annual time-scales, (2) established GPP-EVI relationships across multiple biomes using observed GPP and MODIS EVI and applied them to the global scale, (3) developed an pure remote sensing ET model (TG-SM) in combination of MODIS EVI, LST and microwave soil moisture data, (4) identified and optimized key above- and below-ground processes of GPP and ET in the CABLE model across 10 Australian flux sites, and (5) benchmarked the CABLE model across the whole Australia through integrative use of remote sensing products of GPP and ET predicted by both my own remote sensing models and other available products.

Each chapter provides new insights into the popular approach for estimating GPP or ET, while together they form a strong example in joint analysis of GPP and ET across various spatio-temporal scales.